

A Study on the Challenges Faced by Mainstream Schools in  
Educating Ethnic Minorities in Hong Kong

Research report

Oxfam Hong Kong  
Dr. Loh Ka Yee Elizabeth (The University of Hong Kong)  
Dr. Hung On Ying (The University of Hong Kong)

January 2020



樂施會  
**OXFAM**  
Hong Kong

無窮世界  
World  
Without  
Poverty



## Members of research team

Oxfam Hong Kong

Elizabeth K. Y. Loh, PhD  
Assistant Professor  
Faculty of Education  
University of Hong Kong

Cathy O. Y. Hung, PhD  
Postdoctoral Fellow  
Centre for Advancement of Chinese Language Education and Research  
University of Hong Kong

## Table of content

Executive summary .....	7
1. Background.....	20
1.1 The Current Situation in Hong Kong.....	20
1.2 The challenges faced by the non-Chinese speaking students in education .....	21
1.3 Difficulties faced by schools and teachers .....	22
1.4 Significance of the Study .....	23
1.5 Research objectives.....	23
2. Comparing Hong Kong and the other countries on the policies related to second language learning.....	24
2.1 Comparing Hong Kong, New South Wales and British Columbia.....	25
2.2 Analyzing overseas models of support.....	29
3. Research Methods .....	31
3.1 Research Design.....	31
3.2 Participants .....	31
4. First stage of study: Interview results.....	34
4.1 Interviews with the school principals .....	34
4.1.1 Exploring the challenges faced by principals from the perspective of human resources.....	34
4.1.1.1 High turnover rate of teaching assistants .....	34
4.1.1.2 Government subsidy is insufficient to employ a more experienced teacher.....	34
4.1.1.3 Experience of teaching non-Chinese speaking students lacks professional recognition .....	36
4.1.1.4 Related training courses failed to meet the needs.....	37
4.1.1.5 The timetable of the refresher courses is released too late .....	38
4.1.1.6 The Government should provide additional subsidy to support non-Chinese subjects' teaching .....	38
4.1.1.7 Increase the flexibility of the subsidy .....	38
4.1.1.8 A small number of non-Chinese speaking students are found in each grade .....	39
4.1.2 Exploring the challenges faced by principals from the perspective of material resources.....	39
4.1.2.1 It relies on the teacher's sole efforts to develop teaching materials .....	39
4.1.2.2 "Second Language Learning Framework" fails to address the actual needs .....	40
4.1.2.3 Homework tutoring arrangements.....	41
4.1.2.4 Assessment mechanism limits the secondary school choices of non-Chinese speaking students .....	41
4.1.2.5 Difficult to arrange time for enrichment.....	42
4.1.2.6 Insufficient support for teaching resources .....	42
4.1.3 Exploring the challenges faced by principals from the perspective of social resources.....	43
4.1.3.1 Difficulties in home-school cooperation .....	43
4.1.3.2 Lack of collaboration between experts and schools.....	43
4.2 Interviews with teachers .....	44

4.2.1	Teacher's understanding of non-Chinese speaking students .....	44
4.2.1.1	Cultural differences amongst non-Chinese speaking students.....	44
4.2.1.2	Difficulties in communicating with non-Chinese speaking students .....	45
4.2.1.3	It is difficult to agree with the parenting style of non-Chinese speaking parents .....	46
4.2.2	Teaching skills related to teaching non-Chinese speaking students .....	47
4.2.2.1	Teaching support is limited to the Chinese Language .....	47
4.2.2.2	The ability of teaching assistants is not sufficient to support non-Chinese speaking students .....	47
4.2.2.3	Refresher courses fail to improve the skills of teaching non-Chinese speaking students .....	48
4.2.2.4	Students' ability varies greatly .....	48
4.2.2.5	Lack of special educational assessment tools designed for non-Chinese speaking students .....	49
4.2.2.6	It is difficult to teach students with low motivation .....	49
4.2.3	Teachers' attitudes towards non-Chinese speaking students being taught in mainstream schools .....	50
4.2.3.1	Disagree with the assessment mechanism of the Education Bureau .....	50
4.2.3.2	Feeling discouraged in teaching non-Chinese speaking students ..	50
4.2.4	Teachers' awareness of teaching non-Chinese speaking students .....	51
4.2.4.1	Unclear guidelines .....	51
4.2.4.2	The pull-out support is contrary to the intention of abolishing the designated schools.....	51
4.2.4.3	Teaching non-Chinese speaking students needs patience.....	52
4.2.4.4	Non-Chinese speaking students with weak learning ability find it difficult to adapt to mainstream schools.....	52
4.2.4.5	Teaching non-Chinese speaking students increases the workload of teachers .....	53
4.2.4.6	Heavy teaching workload, making it difficult for teachers to balance training with job .....	54
4.3	Summary of interview results .....	55
5.	Questionnaire survey.....	57
5.1	Questionnaire design .....	57
5.2	Respondents .....	57
5.3	Principal questionnaire.....	59
5.3.1	Personnel arrangements .....	59
5.3.2	Chinese learning and assessment .....	61
5.3.2.1	Curriculum design.....	61
5.3.2.2	Teaching materials.....	62
5.3.2.5	Teaching staff arrangements .....	63
5.3.2.6	The difficulties in teaching NCS students Chinese using Mandarin	63
5.3.3	Overall teaching circumstances.....	64
5.3.3.1	Impacts of students' personal factors on learning .....	64
5.3.3.2	Progression issues .....	64
5.3.3.3	Impacts of family factors on NCS students' learning .....	65

5.3.3.4	Issues in relation to teaching NCS Students.....	65
5.3.4	Measures to support NCS students .....	66
5.3.4.1	Measures related to staff arrangements in supporting NCS students .....	66
5.3.4.2	Measures related to the professional support .....	68
5.3.5	Suggestions in supporting NCS students .....	70
5.3.5.1	Suggestions related to the resources .....	70
5.3.5.2	Suggestions related to the professional support and development .....	73
5.3.5.3	Preferences of the suggestions.....	75
5.3.6	Key factors affecting the effectiveness of teaching NCS students .....	78
5.3.6.1	Key factors that affect the most on the effectiveness of supporting NCS students as perceived by the principals .....	79
5.3.7	Views towards different ethnicities .....	80
5.3.7.1	Recruitment matters .....	80
5.3.7.2	Students' matters .....	80
5.3.7.3	Communication with parents .....	81
5.3.7.4	Understanding of different ethnicities .....	81
5.4	Teacher Questionnaire .....	82
5.4.1	Difficulties of teachers in teaching NCS students.....	82
5.4.1.1	Difficulties of teachers in instructing NCS students.....	82
5.4.1.2	Difficulties of Chinese Language subject teachers from schools of various compositions of NCS students.....	83
5.4.1.3	Difficulties of non-Chinese Language subject teachers from schools of various compositions of NCS students .....	86
5.4.2	Situation of overall teaching.....	89
5.4.2.1	Teachers' confidence in teaching NCS students .....	89
5.4.2.2	Family factors.....	90
5.4.2.3	Student personal factors affecting learning .....	91
5.4.2.4	Progression issues .....	91
5.4.3	Difficulties of Chinese learning and assessment .....	92
5.4.3.1	Curriculum of Chinese Language subject .....	92
5.4.3.2	Teaching materials.....	94
5.4.3.3	Lesson arrangements .....	95
5.4.3.4	Assessment arrangements .....	97
5.4.3.5	Teaching staff arrangements .....	98
5.4.3.6	Medium of instruction.....	99
5.4.4	Measures to support NCS students .....	100
5.4.4.1	Measures related to staffing arrangements in supporting NCS students .....	100
5.4.4.2	Measures related to professional support.....	101
5.4.5	Suggestions on supporting NCS students .....	102
5.4.5.1	Recommendations on resources .....	102
5.4.5.2	Suggestions related to professional support and development ..	105
5.4.5.3	Preference of the suggestions .....	111
5.4.6	Key factors affecting the effectiveness of teaching NCS students .....	113

5.4.6.1 Key factors that affect the most on the effectiveness of supporting NCS students as perceived by teachers .....	116
5.4.7 Teachers' views towards different ethnicities.....	117
5.4.7.1 Recruitment matters .....	117
5.4.7.2 Students' matters .....	118
5.4.7.3 Parent-school communication matters.....	119
5.4.7.4 Understanding of different ethnicities .....	120
5.5 Summary of questionnaire survey.....	121
6. Case Studies: Pre-conditions for effective learning support to non-Chinese speaking students .....	123
6.1 Social Integration.....	123
6.1.1 Promoting Peer Support .....	123
6.1.2 Early Childhood Education.....	123
6.1.3 Transition from Kindergarten to Primary One.....	124
6.2 Learning and Teaching .....	124
6.2.1 Collaborative Teaching .....	124
6.2.2 Teaching instruction.....	124
6.2.3 Professional Training for Teachers .....	125
6.3 Teaching Resources: Complete Teaching Materials .....	125
6.4 Home-School Cooperation.....	126
6.5 Policies.....	126
7. Recommendations .....	127
7.1 Social and Cultural Integration .....	127
7.2 Teaching Resources .....	129
7.3 Professional support and development .....	131
References .....	133
Annex 1: Background information of interviewed schools.....	134
Annex 2: Principal interview questions.....	135
Annex 3: Teacher interview questions.....	138
Annex 4: School principals' questionnaire survey .....	140
Annex 5: Teachers' questionnaire survey.....	157

## Executive summary

### Introduction and background

1. The number of non-Chinese speaking students attending mainstream schools in Hong Kong is on the rise. The problem that the progress of non-Chinese speaking students lagging behind that of the Chinese speaking students is being more dominant. One of the main learning difficulties faced by these students is that even after learning Chinese for many years, their Chinese ability still has a significant lag compared with Chinese-speaking students of the same age (Tse & Loh, 2008, 2009). Due to the low level of Chinese proficiency, this not only increases the learning difficulties of students but also hinders progression and employment (Paryani, 2015).
2. The Education Bureau has finally implemented measures in the past few years to make improvements, including the abolition of "designated schools" (2013/14 school year), the provision of additional recurrent funding (2014/15 school year) and the proposed "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" (2014/15 school year), etc., to promote the integration of non-Chinese speaking students and their Chinese learning. In the 2018-19 Budget, the Government has also earmarked \$500 million for minority services to provide support services, and education is considered as one of the priorities.
3. Frontline teachers shoulder the teaching of Chinese-speaking students, and at the same time, it is not easy to take care of the lagging progress of non-Chinese speaking students. To date, what are the effect of the above measures on helping mainstream schools teach non-Chinese speaking students to learn Chinese and integrate into the Hong Kong education system?
4. This study aims to explore the challenges faced by schools in teaching non-Chinese speaking students and to listen to their views so as to identify possible suggestions for improvement.
5. The study consists two main components: interviews and questionnaire surveys with school principals and teachers. By reviewing local and overseas literature on supporting second language teaching, interview questions for school principals and teachers were formulated. Based on the results of the interviews, questionnaires for principals and teachers were designed and distributed to all primary schools in Hong Kong that admit non-Chinese speaking students. School principals, Chinese Language subject and non-Chinese Language subject teachers were invited to fill in the questionnaires in order to understand the difficulties faced by mainstream schools in teaching non-Chinese speaking students. As such, conditions for effectively supporting non-Chinese speaking students and suggestions for directions of supporting non-Chinese speaking students are identified.

### Research methods

6. A literature review of overseas support models for second language learning including New South Wales, Australia and British Columbia, Canada is provided.
7. The research team visited nine primary schools from October to November 2018 to interview 9 principals and 24 teachers. Based on the results of the interviews, the principal and teacher questionnaires were designed and then conducted from

February to June 2019. A total of 121 principal questionnaires and 1,230 teacher questionnaires were completed, covering more than 40% of primary schools with non-Chinese speaking students in Hong Kong.

### **Overseas support models for second language teaching**

8. The following eight areas drawn from the overseas experiences were used to compare with the Hong Kong situation: 1) entry assessment, 2) second language learning support, 3) second language development program, 4) support to non-language subjects' teaching in mainstream schools, 5) second language learning support model in mainstream schools, 6) additional resources of second language teaching in mainstream schools, 7) subsidies for teaching second language in mainstream schools, and 8) qualification of second language teachers.
9. Although Hong Kong, New South Wales, Australia and British Columbia, Canada adopted measures to assess the language proficiency of second-language students who have just entered schools, we have found that the Hong Kong Education Bureau has not made any bridging measures to help students in need to successfully promote from kindergarten to primary school (for example, the Department of Education in New South Wales provides additional English intensive courses for students in need to prepare for mainstream curriculum). Also, in Hong Kong, there is no teaching package to allow teachers to make appropriate learning support according to the language level of students.
10. Both New South Wales and British Columbia have certain professional requirements for teachers who teach second language students. The responsibility for teaching second language students is provided by a specialist teacher who has received second language teacher training. Those teachers are responsible for teaching support and co-ordination. Relevant personnel needs to receive professional training to learn how to support these students. At present, Hong Kong does not strictly require teachers to possess relevant professional qualifications for supporting non-Chinese speaking students. The effectiveness of support is doubtful.
11. Both New South Wales, Australia and British Columbia, Canada provide support for non-language subjects. Hong Kong has no relevant measures and obviously ignores the need for non-language subjects.

### **Interview results**

12. According to the literature (Gamoran, Secada, & Marrett, 2000), difficulties that principals face in managing schools can be analyzed in three aspects: human resources, material resources, and social resources.
13. This study uses the "model of teaching" proposed by Freeman (1989) as part of the theoretical framework to examine the difficulties teachers encounter in the teaching process. The theory defines four factors that determine the quality of teaching; the absence of any of them is not conducive to teaching. These four factors include: knowledge, skills, attitudes, and awareness (Freeman, 1989).

### Challenges faced by principals in terms of human resources



14. Some principals expressed that allowances from the government were not enough. The principals questioned the effectiveness of the government's allowance, as these allowances are only sufficient for schools to hire junior teachers or teaching assistants that had not received any teacher training to teach non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students.
15. Some principals believed that there is lack of professional recognition in teaching non-Chinese speaking students. Therefore, they suggested the government to add a permanent teaching post for coordinating non-Chinese speaking students (especially for highly concentrated schools). While professional recognition can be provided to teachers teaching non-Chinese speaking students, this new teaching post could give more incentive for teachers to target it as a goal so as to receive related trainings or to work as professional development.
16. Though some trainings have been provided by the government, some principals reflected the content of training courses provided by universities were too theoretical. Moreover, training courses will not be effective to improve teaching efficacy, if teachers are not willing to teach non-Chinese speaking students and to try different teaching strategies. Some principals believed that teachers will have a greater motivation to teach non-Chinese speaking students, if professional recognition is given.
17. Some principals indicated that the schedule of professional training (also named "refresher training") for teachers by the Education Bureau was given to schools very late, which was usually announced after the start of the school year, thus it is hard for schools to arrange teachers to participate.
18. Considering the difficulties encountered by other subject teachers in teaching non-Chinese speaking students, some principals have pointed out that there is a need of extra funding and allowances from the government to support teaching of non-Chinese Language subjects.
19. Some principals believed that there is a need to increase flexibility in using the allowances, or to give extra funding, to let schools have the resources to promote activities for cultural integration and home-school cooperation.
20. Some principals from low concentration schools had mentioned that, since non-Chinese speaking students were scattered across different grades, it is difficult for schools to organize manpower to support non-Chinese speaking students in every grade. Some principals suggested the Education Bureau to consider arranging non-Chinese speaking students with similar level of Chinese proficiency in the same districts to join support groups on Saturdays or after school.

#### Challenges faced by principals in terms of material resources

21. Some principals pointed out that there is a big learning gap between non-Chinese speaking students and Chinese speaking students. This has increased the workload of teachers, as they had to design tiered worksheets<sup>1</sup> and to make assessment adjustments.
22. Some principals expressed that the predicted learning outcome of the "Second Language Learning Framework" is too ideal which only breaks the Chinese speaking

---

<sup>1</sup> Tiered worksheet is referred to adjust and cut out in terms of topic design, difficulty and scope of worksheets, every topic has two or more levels, to take care of student's individual learning difference.

student's learning content into small pieces and does not match the general learning progresses of non-Chinese speaking students nor the learning characteristics of second language students. Although the Education Bureau has provided sample materials of Primary 3 level for schools to refer to, the discrepancy of non-Chinese speaking students is too big and their Chinese ability is not equivalent to basic ability of Primary 3 level. Therefore it is hard to use these materials directly.

23. Some principals expressed that the current homework guidance for non-Chinese speaking students mostly depends on external services. Thus, there is a need for the Education Bureau to provide guidelines, to let schools choose appropriate external homework guidance services.
24. Some principals expressed that although current non-Chinese speaking students from Primary 1 to Primary 4 receive adjusted arrangements during assessment, they are required to take examinations with no adaptive arrangements for secondary school places allocation purpose. As grade of language subjects would lead to the downward adjustment of the overall grade, non-Chinese speaking students are at disadvantage in choosing secondary schools and school allocation.
25. Some principals expressed that as the class schedule is tight and short-handed, NCS students have to be pulled away for enhancement during Putonghua lessons. Some principals believed, this deprives the right for non-Chinese speaking students to learn Putonghua, as there is an actual demand in learning Putonghua, but there is no other method.
26. Some principals believed that support in teaching resources were insufficient, teachers have to design school based teaching materials for Chinese speaking students and appropriate teaching materials for non-Chinese speaking students, which increase teachers' work load. Thus, it is suggested that the Education Bureau can set up online platform to share resources among schools.

#### Challenges faced by principals in terms of social resources

27. Some principals pointed out that teachers face difficulties in communicating with parents of NCS students. These parents do not understand that students need time to learn and absorb. Some principals revealed that some class teachers do not teach English Language subjects and usually encounter difficulties when they have to use English to communicate with parents of NCS students.
28. Some principals pointed out that since teachers generally lack related experiences, the Education Bureau should facilitate cooperation between universities and schools and let specialists cooperate with teachers in preparing teaching materials on-site and acquiring skills in teaching non-Chinese speaking students. Some principals even suggested the Education Bureau to provide on-site teaching support services.

#### Teachers' understanding of non-Chinese speaking students

29. Some teachers mentioned that non-Chinese speaking students come from different cultural backgrounds and their customs are different. Teachers may not have knowledge about every culture. Some teachers also mentioned that since Chinese is not a phonogram, which requires a lot of copying exercises to learn, some non-Chinese speaking students will resist doing homework and copying new words. Non-Chinese

speaking parents, especially mothers, generally have low levels of education and do not know much about Hong Kong society. Also, their mothers seldom leave the house and so it is difficult for schools to communicate with them.

30. Some teachers pointed out that some non-Chinese speaking students use their home dialect as their mother tongue and English is their second language. Sometimes it is difficult to communicate with students. If the students have just arrived in Hong Kong and have never received local kindergarten education, the situation is even worse. Teachers teaching General Studies said that, in addition to the Chinese language subject, life experiences of non-Chinese speaking students are different from that of Chinese speaking students. Thus, when they explain more abstract concepts, they encounter communication obstacles.
31. Some teachers said that they do not agree with the parenting style of parents of non-Chinese speaking students. Some teachers said that they have non-Chinese speaking students with behavior problems. When they tried to call the parents, the parents did not think this was a problem. Teachers said that it was difficult to understand this “laissez-faire” parenting style. Some teachers expressed that parents of Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students have different values for education. Chinese people generally value children's education, while non-Chinese speaking parents believe that religion is more important.

#### Teachers' skills in teaching non-Chinese speaking students

32. Some non-Chinese Language subject teachers said that support for teaching non-Chinese speaking students is limited to Chinese Language subject only. However, non-Chinese Language subjects are also taught in Chinese. Support is thus needed for those teachers.
33. Teaching assistants lack teaching experiences. Some teachers expressed that teaching assistants may not be able to take care of the learning needs of non-Chinese speaking students. Some teachers also said that some non-Chinese speaking parents have difficulties in understanding English. Teaching assistants may not be able to translate or interpret. It is recommended that the Education Bureau allows schools to use resources flexibly and to employ translators.
34. A teacher who had participated in the refresher course stated that the refresher course was too theoretical and the lecturer did not understand the actual needs of teachers. Some teachers also said that instructors of refresher courses offered by the Education Bureau did not have any experience in teaching non-Chinese speaking students, which made the participants feel greatly disappointed and it is a waste of time.
35. Some teachers expressed that the abilities of students in same class would vary greatly. Not only Chinese speaking students with different abilities, but also non-Chinese speaking students, as well as students with special educational needs; it is difficult to take care of the learning patterns and needs of all students. Some teachers also said that some non-Chinese speaking students may have special educational needs. It is difficult for teachers to catch up with the progress of the school curriculum and meet the different needs of different students. Some teachers are worried that if they want to accommodate the progress of non-Chinese speaking students, it would possibly delay the progress of Chinese speaking students.
36. Some teachers mentioned that the lack of special education assessment tools for non-

Chinese speaking students has delayed opportunities for early intervention.

37. Some teachers said that some non-Chinese speaking students have a very low motivation to learn. They often hand in their homework late and their parents do not cooperate to meet the school requirements which make teaching more difficult.

#### Teachers' attitudes towards non-Chinese speaking students in mainstream schools

38. The examination paper for non-Chinese speaking students is the same as the one for Chinese speaking students in internal examinations for Secondary School Places Allocation purpose. Some teachers expressed that even if they try hard to teach non-Chinese speaking students, it is difficult to help them catch up with the level of Chinese speaking students which makes teachers feel discouraged.

#### Teachers' awareness of teaching non-Chinese speaking students

39. Some teachers pointed out that curriculum guidelines of their schools and of the Education Bureau were inconsistent and teachers were confused. In addition, materials developed by the Education Bureau in cooperation with different institutions are lacking in completeness and consistency and teachers need to spend time on screening. Some teachers suggested to unify resources in order to develop a comprehensive curriculum for non-Chinese speaking students. Non-Chinese Language subject teachers also expressed that the Education Bureau has not provided relevant guidance and support for the teaching of other subjects, which makes them feel very difficult to teach.
40. Some teachers expressed that the Education Bureau should consider NCS students' level of Chinese language listening and speaking when they are allocated to primary schools. Some teachers explained that if the discrepancy between the ability of non-Chinese speaking students and other students is too great, the motivation and confidence of non-Chinese speaking students in learning Chinese Language subject and other subjects will be affected with insufficient support. It is recommended that these students should be enrolled by schools with a higher proportion of non-Chinese speaking students, which have more resources to better cater for these students.
41. In order to address the learning needs of non-Chinese speaking students, teachers often have to re-design and re-organize a complete set of courses and materials. Some teachers have said that they have to find additional teaching resources to teach non-Chinese speaking students. In addition, some of the teaching resources found are not based on the Hong Kong context. Teachers need to rewrite them to meet the needs of their students. This is very time-consuming. Some teachers expressed that teaching non-Chinese speaking students has increased the workload of teachers and suggested that schools should increase manpower. Some teachers stated that these workloads are almost equivalent to the work of a publishing house.
42. Some teachers pointed out that the quota of refresher courses is limited and registration is difficult. In addition, some teachers said that the workload of teachers is already very heavy and it is difficult to have their work and training at the same time.

#### **Survey results**

43. The Principal Questionnaire is divided into eight parts: personnel arrangements, difficulties in teaching Chinese Language subject and assessment, situation of other subjects' teaching and overall teaching circumstances, measures to support NCS students, suggestions on supporting NCS students, key factors affecting the effectiveness of teaching NCS students, principals' views towards different ethnicities, and school information.
44. The Teacher Questionnaire is divided into eight sections: difficulties of teachers in teaching NCS students, situation of overall teaching, difficulties in Chinese learning and assessment, measures to support NCS students, suggestions on supporting NCS students, key factors affecting the effectiveness of teaching NCS students, teachers' views towards different ethnicities and teacher information.

#### Results of the survey: school principals

45. 93.2% of the principals expressed that they encounter greater difficulties in employing teachers with related teaching skills for Chinese as a second language.
46. 94.2% of the principals expressed that Chinese writing of the mainstream curriculum are too demanding for non-Chinese speaking students.
47. 95% of the interviewed principals agreed that there is a lack of teaching materials that are targeting students with Chinese as a second language and corresponding to the mainstream curriculum at the same time.
48. 96.7% of the interviewed principals agreed that despite immersion and pull-out learning measures have been adopted, it is still difficult for non-Chinese speaking students to reach the same language abilities as the Chinese speaking students from the same grade before the secondary school places allocation exam (from Primary 1 to Primary 4).
49. Over 90% of the interviewed principals expressed that teaching assistants are generally lack of teaching experience (95%) and Chinese learning support programme for non-Chinese speaking students should be provided by teachers experienced in teaching non-Chinese speaking students for pull-out learning support (94.2%). Over 90% of the interviewed principals agreed that turnover of teaching assistants would affect the stability of teaching (95%), which results in non-Chinese speaking students constantly adapting to the teaching style of different teachers (96.3%).
50. Over 85% of the interviewed principals expressed that teaching Chinese Language subject in Putonghua would make non-Chinese speaking students encounter more difficulties in integrating into the Chinese Language lessons (87.2%) and learning Chinese (85.7%).
51. 95% of the interviewed principals expressed that it is the most difficult for non-Chinese speaking students that have never received any local kindergarten education to adapt to mainstream curriculum, which reflects the importance of supporting their transition from kindergarten to primary school.
52. 86.6% of the interviewed principals expressed that non-Chinese speaking students are lacking of family support, in other words, support from school could be considered as the only Chinese learning opportunity for them.
53. 92.6% of the interviewed principals expressed that support from the Education Bureau for non-Chinese speaking students in learning other subjects (e.g. Mathematics, General Studies) is insufficient.

54. Most of the interviewed principals expressed that subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is insufficient for employing experienced teachers for supporting non-Chinese speaking students and specialist teachers for non-Chinese speaking students are lacking professional recognition.
55. Most of the interviewed principals expressed that the Education Bureau does not provide special supporting measures or guidance in communicating with non-Chinese speaking parents and promoting cultural integration.
56. Over 90% of the interviewed principals expressed that the Education Bureau should offer professional recognition for specialist teachers for non-Chinese speaking students, provide guidelines for specialist teachers, ensure the subsidy to be used for supporting non-Chinese speaking students' learning and needs.
57. Most of the interviewed principals expressed that there should be more flexibility in using the subsidy provided by the Education Bureau, allowing the school to spend some of the subsidy to enhance the communication between non-Chinese speaking parents and schools and to organize cultural exchange activities.
58. Most of the principals considered creating a post (e.g. NCSST, Non-Chinese Speaking Students Support Teacher) in the permanent staff establishment as the first priority among all the measures to be implemented.
59. Most of the principals expressed that subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is influential on the learning and teaching towards non-Chinese speaking students.

#### Results of the survey: teachers

60. 74.8% of the interviewed teachers expressed that they encounter greater difficulties in catering for the learning differences between Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students at the same time.
61. Interviewed Chinese Language teachers expressed that “ensuring non-Chinese speaking students being able to keep up with the schedule of the mainstream curriculum”, “achieving the learning target of the mainstream curriculum” and “catering for the learning differences between Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students at the same time” are the biggest challenges.
62. Interviewed non-Chinese language teachers expressed that “ensuring non-Chinese speaking students being able to keep up with the schedule of the mainstream curriculum” and “catering for the learning differences between Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students at the same time” are more challenging.
63. Teachers are apparently not having much confidence in “teaching non-Chinese speaking students to achieve a similar level of the Chinese speaking students”. Only 37.8% of Chinese language subject teachers and 54.1% of non-Chinese language subject teachers reported being confident.
64. Nearly 90% of the Chinese Language teachers (89.8%) and non-Chinese Language teachers (86.8%) expressed that it is the most difficult for the non-Chinese speaking students that have never received any local kindergarten education to adapt to mainstream curriculum.
65. Over 95% of Chinese Language teachers expressed that Chinese Language subject of the mainstream curriculum is too difficult for non-Chinese speaking students.
66. Over 90% of Chinese Language teachers expressed that there is a lack of teaching materials that are targeting students with Chinese as a second language and

corresponding to the mainstream curriculum at the same time. 100% of Chinese Language teachers working at medium concentration schools agreed that, as Chinese Language teaching materials, practices, and adjusted assessments are insufficient, they have to rely on their personal effort to develop all these materials.

67. Over 90% of Chinese Language teachers expressed that despite immersion and pull-out learning measures have been adopted, it is still difficult for non-Chinese speaking students to reach the same language abilities as the Chinese speaking students from the same grade before the Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) exam (from Primary 1 to Primary 4). Nearly 90% of Chinese Language teachers expressed that non-Chinese speaking students are at a disadvantage in SSPA exam for taking the same Chinese language exam paper with the Chinese speaking students.
68. Nearly 90% of the Chinese Language teachers expressed that turnover of teaching assistants would affect the stability of teaching, which results in non-Chinese speaking students constantly adapting to the teaching style of different teachers. 97% of Chinese Language teachers working at medium concentration schools expressed that Chinese learning support program for non-Chinese speaking students should be provided by teachers experienced in teaching non-Chinese speaking students as a pull-out learning support, reflecting that it is necessary to have a more rigid qualification requirement for supporting teachers.
69. Over 90% of Chinese Language and non-Chinese Language teachers expressed that the Education Bureau is not providing special supporting measures or guidance in communicating with non-Chinese speaking parents and promoting cultural integration.
70. Over 94% of the teachers expressed that the Education Bureau should create a post (e.g. NCSST) in the permanent staff establishment to be responsible for supporting NCS students (e.g. to conduct small group teaching/group teaching) and cultural integration.
71. Over 92% of the interviewed teachers suggested that the Education Bureau should create a post of special coordinator (e.g. NCSCO, Non-Chinese Speaking Students Coordinator), in order to arrange a teacher responsible for the coordination work of non-Chinese speaking students, organizing student supporting groups, and promoting in-school cultural integration education.
72. Over 95% of the teachers expressed that the Education Bureau should provide professional recognition for non-Chinese speaking students' specialist teachers.
73. Facing the problem of insufficient teaching materials, most of the interviewed teachers (including Chinese and non-Chinese Language teachers working at low, medium and high concentration schools) suggested the Education Bureau to provide teaching materials for the "Second Language Learning Framework". Over 95% of the interviewed teachers expressed that it is necessary for the Education Bureau to provide support for non-Chinese Language subjects (e.g. Mathematics and General Studies).
74. Interviewed teachers (especially for schools with lower concentration) suggested the Education Bureau to provide special supporting measures in communicating with non-Chinese speaking parents and promoting cultural integration. As there is only a small group of non-Chinese speaking students studying at low concentration schools, cultural exchange is easily to be ignored.
75. Most of the teachers considered increasing the amount of the subsidy and allowing the school to employ Assistant Primary School Master as the most important and the most effective supporting measures. Most of the teachers expressed that to create a post of

coordinator (e.g. NCSCO) to be responsible for the coordination work of non-Chinese speaking students, is the most urgent measure.

76. Over 98% of the Chinese Language teachers expressed that the Education Bureau should create a teaching post in the permanent staff establishment. Moreover, most of the non-Chinese Language teachers expressed that teaching materials and parents' cooperation are more influential in affecting non-Chinese speaking students' support.

### **Pre-conditions for effective learning support to non-Chinese speaking students**

77. From the mainstream primary school cases we interviewed, we tried to find out the successful factors for providing non-Chinese speaking students with equal learning opportunities from the following four aspects: social integration, learning and teaching practices, teaching resources, and home-school communication. The following conditions are helpful to support non-Chinese speaking students.
78. The research team found that to have a successful support, in addition to school teachers, peer support is essential. In order to help non-Chinese speaking students, some schools arrange senior Chinese-speaking students to help non-Chinese speaking students to review Chinese vocabularies. On the one hand, it increases opportunities for students learning. On the other hand, it creates a caring culture.
79. The research team found that many interviewees expressed that in fact, except the difficulties encountered in learning Chinese, non-Chinese speaking students have no difference with Chinese-speaking students in social integration and can fully participate in campus life. Many interviewees explained that this is because most non-Chinese speaking students have enrolled in local kindergartens. It is easy for them to adapt to the learning environment dominated by Chinese-speaking students. This reflects the fact that studying in local kindergartens and starting to learn with Chinese speaking students since childhood have helped non-Chinese speaking students to integrate into the mainstream learning environment. Therefore, for some non-Chinese speaking students who have just arrived in Hong Kong, the Education Bureau should provide at least a summer pathway course so that they can adapt to the new learning environment as early as possible.
80. The research team found that collaboration between teachers is very helpful for practical support, for example, team teaching. The advantage of team teaching is to promote professional sharing among teachers and to reflect on teaching methods, which help teachers to evaluate teaching design from different perspectives and to improve teaching efficiency.
81. The mode of cooperative teaching can sometimes be a practice community collaboration between experts and teachers. Experts participate in the teaching process, from design, practice, evaluation, reflection and optimization, in order to develop and experiment with effective teaching strategies and to make successful teaching practices.
82. The research team found that most respondents teaching Chinese and non-Chinese Language subjects said that, since there are very few related topics and trainings on teaching non-Chinese speaking students, they have to explore methods of teaching non-Chinese speaking students based on their own personal experiences. For teaching non-Chinese speaking students, whether it is teaching skills, communication with students, etc., teachers need to re-learn in order to prepare for teaching. It can be seen



that to prepare teachers with adequate training is of great help to teachers supporting non-Chinese speaking students. Therefore, we believe that the development of teacher professional training cannot be ignored.

83. Effective learning and teaching are dependent on a curriculum matched with suitable teaching materials. It is impossible to rely on the personal efforts of teachers for reorganizing the curriculum, designing teaching materials, and adapting assessment tools. We believe that conditions for supporting non-Chinese speaking students must include a comprehensive set of teaching materials.
84. Mutual trust and communication between schools and parents is equally important. Schools should establish a good communication model, such as translated notices, translated handbook content, etc., so that non-Chinese speaking parents can participate in their children's learning. Some schools particularly encourage non-Chinese speaking parents to participate in school activities, join parent-teacher associations, etc., so that they can better understand the teaching arrangements and policies of schools, which increase their trust in the schools.
85. Despite the multi-faceted cooperation of teachers, principals and parents, the lack of policies would reduce the effectiveness of support measures. Therefore, the Education Bureau needs to address the problems of the existing submission mechanism, the curriculum arrangement, the lack of resources for the "Second Language Learning Framework", teacher training and professional recognition, etc.

## **Recommendations**

### Social and cultural integration aspects

86. We suggest encouraging NCS parents to let their children study in kindergartens and increasing their awareness of the significance of early childhood education and avoiding absenteeism from schools that hinders children's learning progress.
87. Provision of school-parent collaboration support measures organized by non-governmental organizations: In addition to the difficulties in teaching NCS students, principals and teachers in mainstream school are found to have insufficient knowledge about the culture and customs of different ethnic minority groups. It added great challenges to the schools. We suggest encouraging non-governmental organizations to take up the bridging role between school and parents. These organizations can provide services that facilitate communication and understanding, while providing services that help teachers of NCS students to relieve their stress from the workload of teaching NCS students
88. Ethnic minority organizations could help NCS students and their families to integrate into the mainstream society: Given the strong collectivist culture of ethnic minority groups, we suggest leaders of ethnic minority community groups to help strengthen the family supports for new arrival NCS families. It not only helps to maintain the social bond among the ethnic minority groups, but also helps them to understand the mainstream culture of Hong Kong society, the education system and the labor market.
89. With the abolition of "designated schools" policy, many NCS students are now studying in mainstream primary schools with Chinese speaking students. We suggest the Education Bureau (EDB) to provide summer bridging program for NCS kindergarteners to adapt to a new learning environment over the transition period.

### Learning resources aspect

90. NCS students are supposed to be taught by teachers with more teaching experiences. However, the additional recurrent funding provided by the EDB are only enough for schools to employ teachers with less teaching experiences, or even teaching assistants for such a challenging task. It leaves the quality of support questionable. The EDB should increase the amount of funding for schools to employ APSM (Assistant Primary School Master/ Mistress) teachers to provide learning enrichment and support to NCS students.
91. The additional recurrent funding scheme requires schools to enroll at least 10 NCS students to receive the amount of funding between HK\$800,000 and HK\$1,500,000. Some schools with low-NCS student composition are worried that they are not going to intake enough students to maintain the eligibility for the funding. The remaining NCS students, who have been admitted, would have insufficient learning supports. Therefore, we suggest providing the amount of funding based on the number of NCS students.
92. The questionnaire survey indicated that, over 80% non-Chinese Language subject teachers said that there is a lack of teaching support to NCS students' learning in other subjects (e.g. Mathematics and General Studies). We suggest the EDB to provide additional subsidy on the learning support of subjects other than Chinese Language.
93. The current learning support measure is lack of having a designated teacher to coordinate, plan and monitor the curriculum planning and teaching development for teaching NCS students. It results in a lack of sustainability and advancement. In reference to the measure used in supporting students with special educational needs, the EDB should set up a coordinator position (NCSCO), to allow schools arranging a teacher to coordinate the supports for NCS students and organize the group learning supports as well as activities of social and culture integration in order to ensure the teaching support is developing progressively. The EDB should also add a teaching position (NCSST) in the school system who is responsible for students' learning support (group or split group learning) and their cultural integration. These measures have been implemented in other countries (e.g. New South Wales and British Columbia) for many years. Many evidences prove the effectiveness of specialist teachers in supporting second language learning.

### Professional support and development aspects

94. In the survey, frontline teachers have clearly pointed out that the "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" is over-optimistic, which is not practically matching the actual learning progress of NCS students. Moreover, many teachers expressed that owing to a lack of training for teaching second language learners, they are unable to design materials for teaching Chinese as second language. We suggest the EDB to provide a set of teaching materials which can match with the mainstream curriculum and the "Second Language Learning Framework".
95. Before the existence of suitable teaching materials, teachers teaching Chinese Language or non-Chinese Language subjects need to design teaching materials for NCS students. It has increased their workload. We suggest the EDB to set up an online

platform which allows schools to upload and share teaching resources designed for NCS students.

96. Given the lack of experience of frontline teachers to support the learning of NCS students, the EDB should facilitate the collaboration between universities and schools, in a continuous and close working relationship, to ensure teachers to master the skills in teaching NCS students. It is especially important for schools with lower NCS student composition as they face more constraints in resources. Therefore, we suggest the EDB to organize a teaching support team to provide school-based support to schools with NCS students.

# A Study on the Challenges Faced by Mainstream Schools in Educating Ethnic Minorities in Hong Kong

## Report

### 1. Background

#### 1.1 The Current Situation in Hong Kong

In the 2016/17 school year, around 8,700 ethnic minority students ("non-Chinese speaking students, NCS", hereafter) were enrolled in 325 mainstream primary schools, which are equivalent to 2.49% of the whole population of school-aged students (349,008)<sup>2</sup>. One of the major learning difficulties faced by these students is that even if they have been learning Chinese for many years, they still have a lower Chinese proficiency compared with the Chinese speaking students at the same age (Tse & Loh, 2008; 2009). Due to the low Chinese proficiency, learning opportunities and chances for further study of these NCS students are hindered. More importantly, it affects their future employment (Paryani, 2015). Such situation is more obvious in non-Chinese speaking students who enroll in schools using Chinese as the medium of instruction.

Regarding this problem, the Education Bureau has implemented measures in the past few years to facilitate NCS students to learn Chinese, for example, the abolition of "designated schools" in the academic year of 2013-2014; the provision of additional recurrent funding from the academic year of 2014-2015 onwards; the introduction of the "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" ("Second Language Learning Framework") in the year of 2014/15, etc. Furthermore, in the 2018-19 Budget, the Government earmarked 500 million grants for ethnic minorities, and education is considered as one of the priorities. The support provided by the Government to non-Chinese speaking students in primary and secondary schools has only been implemented in the past few years and there is still room for improvement. Therefore, this research aims to enhance the education policy to strengthen the support for non-Chinese speaking students and to assist teachers teaching Chinese as a second language.

In the following, we briefly discuss the research findings from the previous research studies conducted by our team in order to provide a general picture of how schools and teachers view about the challenges faced by the NCS students.

---

<sup>2</sup> 2016/17 Statistics on the population of students. Extracted from [https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/about-edb/publications-stat/figures/Enrol\\_2016.pdf](https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/about-edb/publications-stat/figures/Enrol_2016.pdf)

## 1.2 The challenges faced by the non-Chinese speaking students in education

The problems of having insufficient resources and support, language barriers, cultural integration issues, poverty, discrimination and stereotypes have prompted the non-Chinese speaking students to a disadvantage in education compared to the Chinese speaking students. Among the problems, the Chinese language learning problem affects non-Chinese speaking students the most when receiving education. If the issues are not addressed, their chances of learning, further study, social integration, employment and upward mobility will be affected in the long run.

Although many non-Chinese speaking students have been learning Chinese since kindergarten, the lack of language environment in family has made them far less likely to have the language input of Chinese than the Chinese speaking students, pushing their starting point of learning behind the latter group. One of our large-scale studies, conducted in 2015-2017<sup>3</sup>, focusing on the difficulties of educating the NCS kindergarteners revealed that parents of K3 NCS kindergarteners are concerned about their children's adaptation to the new school environment and the inability to meet the learning expectations in the primary school settings. Among all the subjects, they worried about Chinese language subject the most.

In fact, their concerns are not exaggerated. We conducted another longitudinal study<sup>4</sup> and found that NCS students, who were studying in Primary one, and their parents encountered many difficulties during the transition from kindergarten to primary school. These include communication problems with the Chinese Language subject teachers, understanding the contents of the school curriculum and handbooks, following up and checking homework, assisting children to revise and prepare for the Chinese language dictations and examinations.

In the same study, we also found that NCS students, who were in Primary one, failed in most of the Chinese language tests (including listening, speaking, comprehension and writing components). If there are no support measures, the gap of Chinese language proficiency between the Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students will keep widening as they grow up. Besides, NCS students not only need support for learning Chinese in schools, but also require assistance to interact with their ethnic Chinese schoolmates in an inclusive school environment.

---

<sup>3</sup> Loh, E. K. Y., Principal investigator, "Start from the beginning – Supporting non-Chinese speaking kindergarteners to learn Chinese as a second language (2015-2017)"; Funded by Oxfam Hong Kong, and Social Innovation and Entrepreneurship Development (SIE) Fund, Hong Kong SAR Government (HK\$3,10,2441)

<sup>4</sup> Loh, E. K. Y., Principal investigator, "Research on the transition of kindergarten to primary school of non-Chinese speaking students (2017-2018)" Funded by Oxfam Hong Kong (HK\$548,500).

### 1.3 Difficulties faced by schools and teachers

The significant lag in Chinese language ability among NCS students resulted a large gap on the learning progress as compared with Chinese speaking students, which has brought great challenges to teachers. Although the Education Bureau has introduced the "Second Language Learning Framework" to the Chinese language curriculum in the 2014/15 academic year and provided teaching materials and examples for Primary three and four students, but not all grade levels, many teachers commented that the Framework has only listed out the learning goals. However, there is a lack of comprehensive teaching materials, teaching methods and a second language curriculum that is compatible with the mainstream curriculum. In the other words, teachers need to spend extra efforts and time to accommodate the "Second Language Learning Framework" into the school-based curriculum. On many different occasions, there have been initiatives raised towards the Education Bureau, urging the Bureau to provide a comprehensive set of curriculum and teaching materials for both primary and secondary school teachers.

Only a small number of Chinese Language subject teachers have received training in teaching non-Chinese speaking students. Some teachers even reflected that there is a lack of effective teaching strategies to teach non-Chinese speaking students (Shum et al, 2012). Therefore, relevant teacher training courses in relation to the learning needs of non-Chinese speaking students are needed urgently. It is worth to note that the Education Bureau has required a specific proportion of teachers to complete basic, advanced and special courses before the academic year of 2019-2020 for supporting the learning of students with special educational needs. However, the Education Bureau has not made such requirement in the support of non-Chinese speaking students. We expressed that it might be the reason that only a small number of teachers know the ways to teach the NCS students.

Starting from the 2014/15 academic year, an additional recurrent funding, between \$800K to 1.5 million, is provided to schools enrolled with 10 or more NCS students. Most of the schools would use the funding to employ additional teachers or teaching assistants. However, as the amount of funding varies with the number of NCS students intake every year, schools can only employ teachers on contract basis. Some pointed out that the nature of contract has caused high turnover and mobility of teachers. It is difficult for schools to keep more experienced teachers and assure a consistent team of teaching professions in the curriculum planning.

Besides teaching and learning of Chinese language, the present study investigates the challenges in social and cultural integration of the students and parent-teacher partnership faced by teachers and principals.

Due to the recent changes in the medium of instruction (MOI) policy in teaching Chinese, the learning difficulty of NCS students in some primary schools might be more complicated than the others, which is another research objective of the present study to

examine what these difficulties are. In the 2015/16 academic year<sup>5</sup>, 70% of the mainstream primary schools began to use Mandarin as the MOI for Chinese Language subject, in which about 16% of the mainstream primary schools using Mandarin to teach Chinese in all grade levels; and about 55% of them using it as the MOI in teaching certain components of Chinese subject. Unfortunately, most non-Chinese speaking students have little access to Mandarin before primary school education. To further explore this aspect, this study not only elaborates the problems faced by Chinese Language subject teachers and school principals but also carefully analyzes how MOI might have an impact on teaching NCS students.

#### **1.4 Significance of the Study**

Through this research, we hope that the findings can inform the Government to design policies that promote learning of NCS students, create the opportunities for them to integrate into mainstream school environment, and provide them with an equal learning opportunity as their Chinese speaking peers. To this end, the significance of this study is twofold: to inform the tertiary education institutes about the training needs of frontline teachers and prospective teachers; and to provide a future direction for policymaking as well as how the resource shall be allocated that can support teachers and schools more effectively such as launching specialized teacher training program on teaching materials and strategies catering for students' diversified learning needs.

#### **1.5 Research objectives**

1. To review the literature so as to compare how local and foreign mainstream schools support second language students;
2. To explore the difficulties faced by school principals and teachers in promoting social and cultural integration, teaching (Chinese as a second language), and parent-teacher partnership;
3. To identify the factors or prerequisites for supporting NCS students;
4. To advise on the future direction of policies supporting NCS students.

---

<sup>5</sup> Legislative council (2016). Extracted from <http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr15-16/chinese/panels/ed/papers/ed20160702cb4-1181-2-c.pdf>

## 2. Comparing Hong Kong and the other countries on the policies related to second language learning

Several countries (e.g. Israel, Australia, and Canada) have a long history in implementing second language teaching and learning policies and each of them has its own distinctive features. For example, the Ministry of Education in Israel required all teachers and teacher assistants, who teach second language students, to obtain a specific training. The Israel government would also arrange a teacher assistant to assist the learning of new-arrival students in classrooms for one year.

In 2014, Oxfam Hong Kong has compared Hong Kong with the English-speaking countries (including New South Wales of Australia and British Columbia of Canada) on the “Second language policies”<sup>6</sup> and has made some recommendations. These countries have recently refined their policies on second language teaching and learning to further enhance the support and teaching quality. Table 1 listed and compared the related measures of Hong Kong<sup>7</sup>, Australia<sup>8</sup>, and Canada<sup>9</sup> in the following areas: 1) entry assessment, 2) second language learning support, 3) second language development program, 4) support to non-language subjects’ teaching in mainstream schools, 5) second language learning support model in mainstream schools, 6) additional resources of second language teaching in mainstream schools, 7) subsidies for teaching second language in mainstream schools, 8) qualification of second language teachers.

---

<sup>6</sup> 香港樂施會 (2014). 英語國家與香港的「第二語言政策」.

<sup>7</sup> 香港教育局 (2017). 促進少數族裔平等權利現行及計劃中的措施

<sup>8</sup> NSW Department of Education & Communities (2014) English as an additional language or dialect: Advice for schools

<sup>9</sup> British Columbia Ministry of Education (2018). English language learning policy guidelines



## 2.1 Comparing Hong Kong, New South Wales and British Columbia

	<b>Hong Kong</b>	<b>New South Wales in Australia</b>	<b>British Columbia in Canada</b>
1. Entry assessment	Schools administer assessment to Primary one NCS students upon admission to understand their Chinese language proficiency.	Schools are required to assess all new arrival students, regardless of the grade level, using the assessment tool provided by the Department of Education, to evaluate the English language proficiency of students and decide whether the students need to attend the intensive class for new arrivals.	Schools are required to assess all new arrival students, regardless of the grade level, to evaluate and understand the English language proficiency of these students.
2. Second language learning support	<p>1) Schools with 10 or more NCS students are eligible to apply for a subsidy to assist the school implementing the “Second Language Learning Framework” (in the way of adopting diversified intensive learning and teaching modes such as pull-out learning, split-class/ group learning, and after-school consolidation), and building an inclusive learning environment</p> <p>2) The EDB provides school-based support service to assist schools in accommodating the school-based curriculum and designing appropriate teaching materials</p>	<p>1) Schools can apply for English as an additional language or dialect (EAL/D) specialist teachers through the EAL/D New Arrivals Program to support the learning needs of new arrivals</p> <p>2) Schools with 4 or more second language students are eligible to apply for an additional School Learning Support Officer</p> <p>3) New arrivals are required to attend the intensive class for new arrivals to prepare them to begin learning in the mainstream curriculum</p> <p>4) Before promoting to the secondary school, Grade 6 students, whose language proficiency is not reaching the minimum requirement, are required to take the English classes in the Intensive English Centers</p>	<p>1) Schools are required to draw the Annual Instructional Plans before September, when new school term begins, in which the plans should include learning support plan, timeline, assessment method, and support strategies</p> <p>2) The learning support needs to be carried out by English Language Learner (ELL) specialists</p> <p>3) ELL specialists need to report students’ learning progress every year</p>

3. Second language development program	Abolition of “designated schools”	N.A.	N.A.
4. Support to non-language subjects’ teaching in mainstream schools	No	Other subjects’ teachers design tiered teaching curriculum and activities with the EAL/D specialist teacher.	Other subjects’ teachers co-teach with ELL specialists
5. Second language learning support model in mainstream schools	Schools arrange pull-out learning, split-class/ group learning, and after-school consolidation	The teaching modes include parallel model, elective model, tutorial or withdrawal model: Under the parallel model, a class of EAL/D students are taught separately by a specialist EAL/D teacher, covering curriculum area content with a language development focus; Under the elective model, classes of EAL/D students are formed to undertake a specific program as an elective; Under the tutorial or withdrawal model, students from different classes or years are grouped together for a period of time for more intensive EAL/D tuition	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Based on students’ level of ability, ELL specialist and class teacher assign students to the class, which is more likely for them to achieve successful learning</li> <li>2) Learning support needs to be carried out by ELL specialists</li> <li>3) Support modes include individual and/or group learning, pull-out learning, and/ or after-school activity</li> <li>4) Learning support is designed and accommodated based on mainstream curriculum</li> <li>5) Specialist teachers must report to parents concerning student’s learning progress and social competence five times a year</li> </ol>

6. Additional resources of second language teaching in mainstream schools	EDB commissioned a university in Hong Kong to organize 22 Chinese learning support centers at different locations in Hong Kong, to develop teaching resources, to organize teacher sharing workshops and NCS parents' workshops to help them supporting NCS students to learn Chinese	Henry Parkes Equity Resource Centre provides teaching resources in relation to teaching English as a second language	No
7. Subsidies for teaching second language in mainstream schools	School with 10 or more NCS students are eligible to receive an additional recurrent fund, between HK\$800,000 and HK\$1,500,000 from EDB annually.	Resource Allocation Model includes: 1) The base school allocation provides funding for the core cost of educating each student and operating a school ; 2) equity loadings are calculated based on the socio-economic background of students, number of aboriginal students and the reported level of English as an Additional Language or Dialect need, and number of students with additional needs; 3) targeted funding delivers dedicated subsidies to support the provision of personalized learning and support to cater for the specific needs of students (e.g. new arrivals) who speak a language other than English as their first language and require intensive English language tuition	Schools receive funding for a maximum of 5 years

8. Qualification of second language teachers      No requirement

EAL/D teachers are required to be qualified teachers in TESOL to provide support to the EAL/D students

ELL specialists are required to be registered teachers in British Columbia College of Teachers and to receive accredited training in teaching English as a second language

## 2.2 Analyzing overseas models of support

Entry language assessment has been administered to the second language learners in Hong Kong, New South Wales, and British Columbia. The assessment has an important effect on letting schools understand the language proficiency level of the second language learners and provide suitable learning support according to the language proficiency level. Although EDB has required schools to administer the entry assessment on the NCS students' Chinese language proficiency before starting primary school education, we observed that there are no related support measures nor teaching resources that help teachers to support these students during the transition from kindergarten to primary school. For instance, Department of Education in New South Wales provided the students, who have the language learning needs, with intensive English courses to help them preparing for the mainstream curriculum.

Teachers' teaching quality, undoubtedly, is a determinant of students' learning outcomes (Lingard & Mills, 2003), which underpin the importance of teachers' professional training. Among the countries we compared, both Australia and Canada have established professional qualification requirement towards teachers, who teach second language learners. Specialist teachers, responsible for teaching and coordinating the learning of second language learners, are required to have relevant training. For instance, specialist teachers, in Australia, are required to complete one to two courses related to teaching English as a second language and a practicum for 22 days.

In Hong Kong, the key problem in supporting the NCS students' learning is a lack of specialist teachers who are responsible for planning, monitoring, and coordinating the teaching and learning supports to the NCS students. Without a recognized specialist teacher, teachers need to develop their own teaching materials, which risk consistency and comprehensiveness in the curriculum across the grade levels and make the progression of teaching and learning questionable. Moreover, without a mechanism to recognize specialist teachers, it is difficult to motivate teachers to receive relevant training. To this end, it shows the need of setting up a specialist teacher position, who meets the professional recognition requirement and receives relevant training, to facilitate the sociocultural inclusion in school, manage the parent-school partnership and ensure a progressive development of learning support.

Comparing Hong Kong with other countries on the support models, we found that the support model used in other countries might not be entirely applicable to the Hong Kong context. In other countries, pull-out learning is the most common way used to support second language learners. However, we expressed that it might not be sufficient to address the learning needs of NCS students in Hong Kong. It is because differing from those in other countries, second language learners in Hong Kong, usually do not have sufficient family support. Parents of new arrival students, who can successfully migrate to Australia or Canada, are mostly professionals themselves. These parents, who are well-educated and have good English language level, are more capable to provide resources for their children's learning and give their children ideal learning environment and conditions, have higher expectation on children's education. On the contrary, NCS parents in Hong Kong are mostly less educated and limited in both Chinese and English

language proficiency. These parents in Hong Kong might encounter great challenges to immerse into the city on top of supporting and educating their children. Pull-out learning might not be sufficient to these NCS students, who have lacked family support. Thus, schools need to provide consolidation including preparation and revision of learning to these students.

### 3. Research Methods

#### 3.1 Research Design

The study was conducted in two stages: the first stage is a qualitative study of school cases using semi-structured interviews with teachers and principals; the second stage is a large-scale questionnaire survey, which is designed according to the findings from interviews in the first stage. Both interview and questionnaire materials can be found in Annexes.

#### 3.2 Participants

##### First stage of the study

The study interviewed nine primary schools, including three types of primary schools that implement Putonghua as medium of instruction for teaching Chinese Language Subject, Cantonese as medium of instruction for teaching Chinese Language Subject and English primary schools. From the list of schools in each category, we randomly invited principals and teachers of the schools with high, medium and low concentration<sup>10</sup> of non-Chinese speaking students for interviews. In order to make the research more comprehensive, we invited, from each school, the principal, two Chinese Language subject teachers, each from the senior and junior grades, and two teachers that teach non-Chinese subjects (such as Mathematics and General Studies), each from the senior and junior grades. In total, there are 9 principals and 24 teachers (see the chart below). The average teaching experience of the interviewees is more than 10 years.

Subject	<u>Chinese Language subject</u>		<u>Non-Chinese subjects (including Mathematics and General Studies)</u>		<u>Subtotal</u>
	Cantonese as medium of instruction	Putonghua as medium of instruction	Cantonese as medium of instruction	English as medium of instruction	
Concentration of non-Chinese speaking students					
High concentration (> 50 non- Chinese speaking students)	2	2	2	2	8

---

<sup>10</sup> High concentration is defined as schools with more than 50 NCS students, medium concentration is defined as schools with 31-50 NCS students, low concentration is defined as schools with 30 or less than 30 NCS students.

Medium concentration (31-50 non-Chinese speaking students)	2	2	2	2	8
Low concentration (1-30 non-Chinese speaking students)	2	2	2	2	8
Subtotal	6	6	6	6	<u>Total: 24</u>

## Second stage of the study

The research team carried out thorough interviews with teachers and principals (first stage of study). Based on the results from the interviews, we designed two sets of questionnaires, principal questionnaire (annex 4) and teacher questionnaire (annex 5), to examine the difficulties and recommendations of teachers and principals towards educating NCS students. The questionnaire survey was conducted between February and June of 2019. In the school year 2017/2018, 203 primary schools enrolled less than 10 NCS students, 74 primary schools enrolled 10-30 NCS students, 11 primary schools enrolled 31-50 NCS students, and 37 primary schools enrolled 51 or more NCS students. In total, 325 primary schools were invited to the survey. Among these schools, 33 primary schools replied that they have no NCS students in the school year 2018/2019, the figure of primary schools with at least one NCS student is updated to 292.

A total of 1,230 teacher questionnaires and 121 principal questionnaires were completed. 64 school principals responded to opt out from the survey, the total number of school principal questionnaire is 185, referring to a 63.4% of response rate, and the participation rate of principals is 41.4% of all primary schools with NCS students in Hong Kong. Teachers, who completed the teacher questionnaire, were from at least 135 primary schools which covered 46.2% of all primary schools admitted with NCS students in Hong Kong. Among these teachers, 88.1% of them were coming from aided primary schools, 8.5% government primary schools, 3.3% direct-funded primary schools and 0.1% private primary schools. The principals were from 121 primary schools of which 88.1% were from aided primary schools, 9.3% government primary schools and 2.5% direct-funded primary schools. There were 612 (50.2%) Chinese Language subject teachers and 607 (49.8%) non-Chinese subject teachers (including 271 English subject teachers, 178 mathematics subject teachers, 125 General Studies teachers and 33 other subjects) Teacher). The average teaching years is 12.3 years. 11 of them did not report the subject they taught.

According to the principals' questionnaires, 38 of them (31.4%) were from schools admitting with 1-9 NCS students, 32 (26.5%) admitting 10-30 NCS students, 7 (5.8%) admitting 31-50 NCS students, and 44 (36.4%) admitting more than 50 NCS students.



Schools with 1-9 NCS students were referred to as “extremely low NCS composition schools”; those with 10-30 NCS students hereinafter referred to as "low NCS composition schools"; schools with 31-50 NCS students hereinafter referred to as "medium NCS composition schools", and those with more than 50 NCS students hereinafter referred to as "high NCS composition schools". The Table below illustrated the basic information of these four types of schools.

Table: Number of NCS students

Types of schools	Average number of NCS students	Average number of all students	Proportion of NCS students in schools
Extremely low composition (1-9 NCS students)	4	640	0.63% (1 : 160)
Low composition (10-30 NCS students)	18	622	2.89% (1 : 34.6)
Medium composition (31-50 NCS students)	37	531	6.97% (1 : 14.4)
High composition (more than 50 NCS students)	223	463	48.16% (1 : 2.08)

## 4. First stage of study: Interview results

### 4.1 Interviews with the school principals

According to the literature (Gamoran, Secada, & Marrett, 2000), the difficulties that principals faced in managing schools can be analyzed from three aspects: human resources, material resources, and social resources. Human resources refer to teachers' knowledge, skills, attitudes, training resources, and staff arrangement. Material resources refer to teaching-related tools, teaching and preparation time, and additional fund to facilitate teaching. Social resources refer to mutual trust, responsibility sharing and collaboration among teachers as well as parent-school partnership, to enhance teaching effectiveness.

#### 4.1.1 Exploring the challenges faced by principals from the perspective of human resources

##### *4.1.1.1 High turnover rate of teaching assistants*

Some of the interviewed principals pointed out that the government subsidy is only enough to employ teaching assistants to provide non-Chinese speaking students with pull-out program<sup>11</sup>. However, the position of teaching assistant is contract-based and lacks room for promotion, resulting in a high turnover rate. The turnover of teaching assistants greatly affects the stability of teaching and undoubtedly has a negative impact on the quality of teaching. Furthermore, newly employed teaching assistants are often not familiar with the learning patterns and language proficiency of non-Chinese speaking students, and it is difficult for students to have continuous and gradual learning.

*"We have to consider that teaching assistants need to have a promotion prospect and we cannot expect them to be a teaching assistant forever." -- Principal I*

*"After a teacher has worked a year or two and has accumulated some experience, his/her salary will get higher. The school does not have enough funding to employ him/her anymore. He/she also does not think that he/she still needs to be a contract teacher. Therefore, the experience is difficult to pass on." -- Principal I*

*"The turnover rate of teachers (teaching assistants) is very high. Teachers are more likely to leave the job if there is no incentive." -- Principal E*

##### *4.1.1.2 Government subsidy is insufficient to employ a more experienced teacher*

Non-Chinese speaking students lack family support. They need experienced and skillful teachers to provide the most appropriate and effective learning support. The government subsidy, however, only allows schools to employ teachers with less

---

<sup>11</sup> In pull-out program, students are pulled out from the class time or after-school period to participate in individual or group-learning. Some schools might adjust the number of pull-out sessions depending on the students' needs.

experience, or even teaching assistants, who have not received any professional teaching training and had recognized qualification, to teach non-Chinese speaking students. Many principals questioned the actual effectiveness of the government subsidy.

*"These (NCS) students should be supported by a professionally recognized teacher. I am skeptical to the idea of employing an unqualified teaching assistant to support them." -- Principal A*

*"The Education Bureau requires the schools to use the subsidy to employ additional teachers. However, the bureau only provides with an amount of \$800,000. I doubt about the calculation formula used by the EDB to estimate this amount, because it is only enough for employing newly graduated teachers, who are of lower rank on the salary scale." -- Principal I*

Principals of low-NCS students composition schools added that the current government subsidy is available for school's intake of at least 10 non-Chinese speaking students. Principals of low-NCS students composition schools, especially those admitted 10 students which are just enough to meet the subsidy application requirement, worried that if the school does not admit enough non-Chinese speaking students in the future, the school will lose the subsidy. They worried that the remaining non-Chinese speaking students will not receive enough support.

*"It is determined by the number of students enrolled. Therefore, it is not sable for the professional development of teachers or the curriculum. There will be many uncertainties and many problems." -- Principal E*

Principals explained that if a school enrolls 10 non-Chinese speaking students, it can apply for a subsidy of \$800,000 from EDB, to provide support for the NCS students, that is, an average of \$80,000 for each NCS student. On the contrary, if the school enrolls 9 NCS students, they will only receive a subsidy of \$50,000, that is, about \$5,000 per student. It shows a huge difference in the subsidy amount, as large as 16 times, with only one student less.

In view of this, principals of low-NCS students composition schools suggested that the amount of subsidy should be calculated and distributed proportionally based on the number of NCS students.

*"In my opinion, the Education Bureau should change the current system regarding the calculation of funding amount. Rather than setting a minimum number of NCS students, 10 students, to be the eligibility for receiving \$800,000 subsidy, the amount can be estimated proportionally based on the number (of non-Chinese speaking students)." -- Principal B*

*"I expressed that we have to invest a lot more resource to support students than the Education Bureau does. The EDB's funding is estimated according to the number of students. But to be honest, if schools have a lot of (non-Chinese speaking) students, these schools, of course, have more resources to employ more*

*teachers. However, for schools, which have very few NCS students, they could not have enough funding to even employ half a teacher." - Principal A*

Some principals said that very few teachers have received professional training in teaching as a second language and it is difficult to employ suitable teachers for the job. Therefore, some principals suggested that prospective teachers, who are studying in university, should be provided an option to receive training in a specialized stream and become a teacher who is qualified to teach NCS students.

Some principals said that applicants, who are native speakers of Mandarin, usually have not received professional teacher training. It is very difficult to employ teachers who can teach non-Chinese speaking students in Mandarin.

*"There are very few teachers who possess training background or experience in teaching NCS students." -- Principal G*

*"Prospective teachers, who are in university, should be provided options of taking a specialized stream, teaching either Chinese-speaking or NCS students." -- Principal H*

#### ***4.1.1.3 Experience of teaching non-Chinese speaking students lacks professional recognition***

Some principals described that teachers are spending extra hours on designing another set of teaching materials for NCS students, which increases teachers' burden. Some principals, especially those from the high-NCS students composition schools, suggested that the government should add a regular teaching position to cater the needs of non-Chinese speaking students. On the one hand, it can give professional recognition to teachers, who are currently teaching non-Chinese speaking students. On the other, such an additional post provides an incentive for more prospective teachers taking the responsibility of teaching NCS student as a career goal and willing to pursue professional training.

*"My idea is that the government can give teachers a recognized position so that teachers can teach (NCS students) more wholeheartedly. At least, you need to provide paid leave for teachers to undergo training." -- Principal H*

*"If you want to encourage schools, even if you don't have a coordinator (a coordinator who is responsible for NCS students), you should find a recognized (qualified) teacher to teach NCS students. Therefore, you must ensure that schools have enough funding to employ teachers in the rank of APSM (Assistant Primary School Master/Mistress)." - Principal D*

*"I think that the government should provide teachers with more incentives to teach NCS students. In this way, more teachers will be willing to teach NCS students." – Principal H*

Furthermore, since 2019-2020, the EDB has implemented "all-graduate teaching force" policy in aided and caput schools. The current provisional fund will not be enough for schools to keep the teachers if the amount of funding is not going to be adjusted.

#### ***4.1.1.4 Related training courses failed to meet the needs***

Despite the government has provided training courses, some principals reflected that the training provided by universities was too vague and failed to meet the actual needs of teaching.

*"Sometimes academics don't quite understand the needs of the school." -- Principal F*

*"It will be better if the Education Bureau provides examples." -- Principal D*

*"For the in-service teachers, providing them with some trainings or seminars, or even giving them examples, are indeed utterly inadequate." -- Principal I*

*"I encourage my colleagues to participate in a five-week training program, but I think that five weeks are not adequate to help them resolve the difficulties in teaching. There is still room for improvement in this area. Even that it lasts five weeks, I don't think it is enough for the colleagues to fully grasp the skills. After the training, if that teacher does not have hands-on experience on the front line, he would soon forget about what he has learnt." -- Principal I*

Some principals believed that teachers' attitudes toward teaching NCS students have a more direct impact on teaching effectiveness. If teachers are not willing to teach NCS students and hesitating to try out different teaching strategies, it is difficult to improve teaching effectiveness even if training is provided. Professional recognition for teachers to teach NCS students may encourage them to advance.

*"For the time being, we have seen a lot of changes in the pedagogy in our school, but not the Chinese language subject teaching. The reason to that is the Chinese Language subject teachers are more resistant against changes." -- Principal H*

*"Some NCS students don't listen and speak no matter how much effort you try. Some teachers become reluctant to teach NCS students. There was an instance that a teacher, after finishing the class, started crying when leaving the classroom, as the teacher felt being disrespected." -- Principal H*

Some of the interviewed principals expressed that, the current training courses are mainly focused on Chinese Language, while Mathematics and General Studies are both taught in Chinese, and teachers of these subjects need the relevant training or teaching support as well.

*"Apart from Chinese Language, Mathematics and General Studies are also taught in Chinese. For example, vocabularies used in General Studies are very different from*

*those used in Chinese Language that could be a great challenge for NCS students." -- Principal D*

#### **4.1.1.5 The timetable of the refresher courses is released too late**

Some of the interviewed principals expressed that timetable of the refresher courses given by the EDB was released to schools too late, usually after the school term started. It was difficult for schools to arrange time for the teachers to participate.

*"If refresher course is essential for teachers, I think it would be best to inform schools as soon as possible. We need to arrange staff in advance and consult with our colleagues. We need sufficient time to employ staff (substitute teacher) and arrange the timetable." -- Principal D*

#### **4.1.1.6 The Government should provide additional subsidy to support non-Chinese subjects' teaching**

In view of the difficulties faced by non-Chinese subject teachers in teaching NCS students, some principals pointed out that the Government should provide additional funding to subsidize the teaching of non-Chinese subjects.

*"Non-Chinese speaking students are not only weak in Chinese Language, many of them (NCS students) are also weak in Mathematics. It is because when they do Mathematics problems, it is difficult for them to comprehend the questions and this prevents them from constructing knowledge. We think there is also a need of additional subsidy to support the Math subject teaching." -- Principal G*

#### **4.1.1.7 Increase the flexibility of the subsidy**

Some of the interviewed principals expressed that there should be an increase on the flexibility towards the use of subsidy, or a provision of additional fund, which allow schools to use the subsidy in promoting cultural integration and organizing activities that promote home-school partnership.

*"I tried to find non-government organizations that provide services in homework tutoring and teaching Chinese culture to let students understand more about the Chinese's lives and festivals. However, I am only able to find one organization with this kind of service so far. It is indeed lacking in the community." -- Principal B*

*"I recognized that there is no organization providing services to help parents of different ethnicities to integrate into the local culture. In fact, I realize that we don't know much about their culture and we need to raise our awareness on that." -- Principal B*

A principal gave an example of the school's attempt to organize a bridging program for NCS students during the summer holiday, however it was not approved by the Education Bureau.

*"For the case of our school, using English as the medium of instruction, NCS students need to learn keywords in different subjects as early as possible. We suggested to organize relevant summer bridging courses, but the Education Bureau did not approve it." -- Principal D*

#### **4.1.1.8 A small number of non-Chinese speaking students are found in each grade**

Principals from low-NCS students composition schools mentioned that a few numbers of NCS students are found in different grades. It is thus difficult for schools to arrange support for NCS students for each grade. Some principals suggested that the Education Bureau could consider grouping NCS students, who are studying in the same district and with similar abilities, to receive support in small groups after school or on Saturdays.

*"The 18 NCS students in our school are found in different grades, from grades one to six. Therefore, we can only provide support for the grades with more NCS students." -- Principal I*

*"There can be learning support provided on a district basis, in which the classes can be organized after school to cater for the individual needs of NCS students." -- Principal G*

#### **4.1.2 Exploring the challenges faced by principals from the perspective of material resources**

##### **4.1.2.1 It relies on the teacher's sole efforts to develop teaching materials**

Some of the interviewed principals mentioned that the learning gap between NCS and Chinese-speaking students is too big. Teachers need to design tiered worksheets<sup>12</sup> and special examination arrangements on their own, which undoubtedly have increased their workload.

*"Although there is the 'Second Language Learning Framework', there are Chinese-speaking and non-Chinese speaking students at our school. It is very difficult for teachers to design an examination paper suitable for both NCS and Chinese-speaking students." -- Principal H*

*"I have been searching for different teaching resources in different areas to help teachers teaching NCS students, but there is just no such resource for Chinese Language." -- Principal H*

---

<sup>12</sup> Tiered worksheets refer to worksheets that have suitable adjustments of the design, difficulty and scope, such that each lesson consists of two or more levels to cater for individual learning differences.

In particular, for the low-NCS students composition schools, teachers have to design teaching materials for only a few of NCS students. Some principals believed that it might not be time-efficient.

*"It takes teachers' own efforts to develop their own teaching materials and exercises, and to make various accommodations." -- Principal B*

#### **4.1.2.2 "Second Language Learning Framework" fails to address the actual needs**

Some of the interviewed principals said that the expected learning outcomes set by the "Second Language Learning Framework" are too idealistic. It only splits the learning content of Chinese-speaking students into small steps, which is not in line with the learning progresses and learning styles of most NCS students.

*"I think that it (Second Language Learning Framework) is helpful to the curriculum planner, because it is referenceable, predictive or evaluable. But as a front-line teacher, I don't think it helps much. In a normal teaching process, I will not use 1.1, 1.2, 1.3 to evaluate the teaching progress." -- Principal E*

Furthermore, NCS students have different starting points on Chinese language learning, some are even enrolled in the middle of the school year or have never received kindergarten education previously. These NCS students apparently need a longer time to start learning the basic listening and speaking skills. While it further shows that the assumption made by the "Second Language Learning Framework" has been too idealistic, some requirements may not even be achievable for the Chinese-speaking students.

*"The ability of NCS students varies greatly. Some NCS students of junior grades do not understand and do not know how to speak (Chinese language). It only gets improved when they move to the senior grades." -- Principal G*

*"There are transfer students in every grade. If the NCS transfer student is a Primary One student, we still have the ability to teach him. But if he joins as Primary Five or Primary Six students, the teaching would be really difficult." -- Principal E*

*"In fact, the content of the "Second Language Learning Framework" is no different from that of the Chinese-speaking students. I think it is also possible to use it to teach Chinese-speaking students. Chinese-speaking students may not be able to reach the eighth level in the "Second Language Learning Framework". It is not realistic."-- Principal A*

Some principals pointed out that the "Second Language Learning Framework" lacks supporting resources. Although the Education Bureau has provided schools with the reference teaching materials of Primary Three, it is worth to note that the disparity in the ability among the non-Chinese speaking students is so huge that even if the students are in Primary Three, they might not possess the Chinese language ability which is equivalent to a Chinese-speaking third grader. It is difficult to apply it directly.



*"In fact, it is not sufficient to examine the framework only when designing the Second Language Learning Framework. When will the supporting resources appear?" -- Principal H*

*"The Education Bureau has recently distributed reference teaching materials for NCS students in the Primary Three, but it has not clearly described the content of curriculum for the Primary Three. Therefore, we cannot use it directly." -- Principal E*

Some principals believed that the "Second Language Learning Framework" does not help frontline teachers. On the contrary, it might be able to help teachers' practice if the EDB can provide effective teaching strategies or teaching methods that can help students learn better.

#### **4.1.2.3 Homework tutoring arrangements**

In addition, some principals said that most of the homework tutoring for non-Chinese speaking students is counting on the external service providers. In this regard, the Education Bureau needs to provide guidance for schools to choose the suitable external homework tutoring services.

*"We have provided after-school homework tutoring classes so that NCS students can build a good foundation in Chinese. For the time being, they can only be carried out in the senior grades. I hope that in the future they can be implemented in the junior grades as well." -- Principal D*

*"In the past, there was one hour after class for doing homework. We used the subsidy to employ a teaching assistant and that a teacher would need to support around twenty NCS students at the same time, and the quality of the support was very low. Then, I proposed to employ part-time teachers from external organizations two years ago, and then one teacher will provide homework tutoring support for five NCS students." -- Principal H*

#### **4.1.2.4 Assessment mechanism limits the secondary school choices of non-Chinese speaking students**

At present, non-Chinese speaking students from Primary One to Primary Four can receive special accommodation in examination arrangements. However, in the internal examinations for the purpose of Secondary School Places Allocation, they are required to be assessed by using the same set of examination papers as the Chinese-speaking students. The language scores will drag down NCS students' overall performance, and NCS students are thus at a disadvantage in the selection and allocation of secondary school places.

*"The weakness in Chinese language has affected NCS students throughout the learning process, and eventually they would be allocated to secondary schools in a lower banding." -- Principal C*

*"As the designated schools were cancelled that year, streaming was not possible. Non-Chinese speaking students need to be assessed with the same set of examination papers as the Chinese-speaking students." -- Principal H*

*"For example, writing an article, for a Chinese-speaking student, would be just converting the spoken language into written forms, which is an easier task. But, for non-Chinese speaking students, it would not be easy as they have found difficulties in expressing themselves in spoken language already, not to mention converting into written forms. With such language barrier, no matter which subject, as long as it involves the use of Chinese, their performance would be affected greatly. For the internal examination for the purpose of Secondary School Places Allocation, an examination, which is so important, why is there no adjustment being provided?" -- Principal E*

*"The Education Bureau's guidelines did not mention that special adjustments are needed for non-Chinese speaking students' exams. They are expected to take the same exam papers (as the Chinese-speaking students). I reported (to the Education Bureau) that some students are non-Chinese speaking students, but it was only taken just a report, a notice and a record only. Because of the issue of fairness, the scores will not be adjusted. Therefore, NCS students are at a disadvantage in the Secondary School Places Allocation, just like having a congenital deficiency." -- Principal I*

#### **4.1.2.5 Difficult to arrange time for enrichment**

Some principals said that the class schedule was tight, and manpower was insufficient, thus they could only arrange pull-out program during the Putonghua class. Some principals expressed that there is an actual need to learn Mandarin. The current practice has deprived NCS students the right to learn Mandarin, but there is no other way.

*"We have been arranging students to receive enrichment of the Chinese Language during the Putonghua class. We are all struggling. Because being biliterate and trilingual is necessary, so it is practical to learn Mandarin." -- Principal E*

#### **4.1.2.6 Insufficient support for teaching resources**

Some principals believed that there is insufficient support for teaching resources. Teachers need to design school-based materials for Chinese-speaking students, as well as materials suitable for non-Chinese speaking students, which obviously increases teachers' workload. The Education Bureau can set up an online platform to allow sharing of resources between schools.

*"Set up a platform so that everyone can share some good resources." -- Principal C*

### 4.1.3 Exploring the challenges faced by principals from the perspective of social resources

#### **4.1.3.1 Difficulties in home-school cooperation**

Some principals said that class teachers have encountered many difficulties when communicating with NCS parents, for example, language barriers, and parents did not understand that students need time to learn and absorb slowly. Some principals pointed out that some class teachers do not teach English Language, and from time to time they encounter difficulties when they communicate with the parents in English.

*"The time spent on communicating with non-Chinese speaking parents is several times longer than other parents, and some teachers are not English Language teachers. It is difficult to request them to communicate in English." -- Principal B*

#### **4.1.3.2 Lack of collaboration between experts and schools**

Some principals pointed out that teachers generally lack relevant experience. The Education Bureau should promote collaboration between universities and schools, so that experts can go to the schools and work with teachers to prepare teaching materials and master the skills of teaching non-Chinese speaking students. Some principals even suggested that the Education Bureau should provide on-site teaching support services.

*"First of all, teaching skills of teachers and experts are different. Secondly, I understand that the teaching work of teachers is very heavy, and it is impossible to ask them to create professional teaching materials. I think the best solution is that the Education Bureau sends experts to schools two or three times a week." -- Principal C*

*"I don't know who wrote (the Second Language Learning Framework), but he probably is not a frontline teacher. In fact, if the government is willing to put in more resources, there should be experts coming to the schools to prepare lessons with teachers together, to observe the difficulties teachers encounter during class, and offer help to solve them immediately. Gradually, this will allow our colleagues to master fully, to draw inferences and design classroom teaching themselves according to the course framework, and even to make adjustments and changes." -- Principal I*

*"If the (Education Bureau) is really willing to do it, it can invite tertiary institutions to set up a school support team, and even set up district-based support in various districts, to organize seminars, sharing sessions or lesson observations in the district. ."-- Principal I*

## 4.2 Interviews with teachers

In order to explore this research question systematically, the current study uses the "model of teaching" proposed by Freeman (1989) as part of the theoretical framework to examine the difficulties encountered by teachers in the teaching process. The theory defines four factors that determine the quality of teaching; the absence of any one factor is not conducive to teaching. These four factors include: knowledge, skills, attitudes, and awareness (Freeman, 1989). Teachers' knowledge includes: the content being taught (theme); the person being taught (the student's background, learning mode, language proficiency, etc.); and where they teach (social culture and contextual background). Skills are things that teachers must be able to do. Attitude refers to the attitude of teachers towards themselves, teaching activities and students in the teaching process. Awareness refers to the ability of teachers to understand and monitor the attention they pay to the above three factors (knowledge, skills and attitudes). The researchers analyzed the difficulties encountered by teachers in the teaching process by exploring these four factors.

### 4.2.1 Teacher's understanding of non-Chinese speaking students

#### *4.2.1.1 Cultural differences amongst non-Chinese speaking students*

Some teachers mentioned that NCS students come from different cultural backgrounds with different customs. Teachers may not understand every culture well. Some teachers also mentioned that non-Chinese speaking students are reluctant to do copying exercises. Since Chinese is not an alphabetic language, it requires a lot of copying practices, and some non-Chinese speaking students just resist doing homework.

*"Non-Chinese speaking parents do not have a culture of copying, because English is a phonogram, and it does not require a lot of copying work. Chinese characters are different and cannot be remembered without copying." -- School H Chinese Language subject teacher B*

*"Parents of non-Chinese speaking students do not advocate forcing or pushing their children. We have different opinions on learning." -- School A Chinese Language subject teacher A*

*"Many of the times, only one of the parents (mother) comes, but they are not familiar with Chinese and English, thus communication is difficult. Some families are even more reluctant to cooperate with the school and think that we are pushing the children too much. They think that it would be good enough as long as the children try their best, and that we don't need to urge them to complete their homework." -- School B Mathematics teacher C*

Some teachers said that non-Chinese speaking parents, especially mothers, have generally low level of education, and seldom leave their home. It is difficult for schools to communicate with them.

*"The religion of non-Chinese speaking students has many taboos which we may not know. Recently, schools took students to visit Kadoorie Farm. Four non-Chinese speaking students did not participate. We asked them why they did not participate. They replied that their mothers said that there are pigs in Kadoorie Farm, and their religion does not allow contact with pigs." -- School I General Studies Teacher C*

#### **4.2.1.2 Difficulties in communicating with non-Chinese speaking students**

Some teachers pointed out that some NCS students use their own dialect as their mother tongue, and English is also their second language. Sometimes they encounter difficulties when communicating with students. If the students have just arrived at Hong Kong and have never received local kindergarten education, the situation is even worse.

Apart from Chinese Language, General Studies teachers said that because non-Chinese speaking students have different life experiences from the Chinese-speaking students, they also encounter difficulties when they need to explain concepts that are more abstract.

Mathematics teachers expressed that, for the Mathematics courses in the senior grades, more problem-solving questions are involved. When teachers need to explain to non-Chinese speaking students, they also encounter many difficulties.

*"Has the Government considered that non-Chinese speaking students who have never received kindergarten education should not be allowed to enter primary schools for the time being?" -- School B Chinese Language subject teacher A*

*"When I first taught non-Chinese speaking students, I met a non-Chinese speaking student from Pakistan. The family communicates in English, so supposedly the English proficiency should be very good, but in fact it is not the case. Special attention is still needed for reading and writing." School G English Language teacher C*

*"Non-Chinese speaking students do not watch Chinese TV programs at home, nor are they be exposed to Chinese books. In other words, there is no relevant context in their lives." -- School G Chinese Language subject teacher A*

*"The government's requirements for General Studies are much higher than they were a decade ago. For example: Students need to think, analyze and utilize the elements of STEM (science, technology, engineering and mathematics). Non-Chinese speaking students have already encountered many difficulties in understanding the vocabularies of General Studies, let alone expressing and analyzing in Chinese. Can the Government provide funding or group support?" - School G Mathematics / General Studies Teacher D*

*"General Studies involves historical parts and requires students to study Hong Kong history. For non-Chinese speaking students, their nationality and place of birth are not Hong Kong. This is a very abstract concept. It is neither a current social situation*

*nor history that they can share with Chinese-speaking students." -- School E General Studies Teacher D*

#### ***4.2.1.3 It is difficult to agree with the parenting style of non-Chinese speaking parents***

Some teachers said that they do not agree with the parenting style of non-Chinese speaking parents. A teacher gave an example, in which the teacher was faced with behavioral problems of non-Chinese speaking students, and tried to call and let the parents know, but the parents did not think this was a problem. The teacher said that it was difficult to understand such permissive parenting style.

Some teachers also pointed out that some NCS students need to go to Pakistani schools after day school, until they return home at 11 pm. Teachers think this would seriously affect the time for students to do their homework and study.

Some teachers believed that Chinese and non-Chinese speaking parents have different values for education. Chinese people generally value their children's education, while non-Chinese speaking parents think that religion is more important.

*"In terms of cultural practices, (non-Chinese speaking parents) are different from the Chinese culture which values education highly. For them, they are more focused on 'worshipping the God'. Because their value orientation is different from ours, it is difficult for schools to support them. Parents are not concerned about learning, and even think that there is no need to do the homework." - School G Chinese Language subject teacher B*

*"Non-Chinese speaking parents think that studying is not the most important thing in life, and experiencing life is more important. The culture that they have, makes it difficult for schools to manage and deal with students." - School E Chinese Language subject teacher A*

Some teachers mentioned that non-Chinese speaking students are not very obedient to their mothers, but most of the fathers need to work for long hours. It is extremely difficult for non-Chinese speaking parents to supervise their children's learning.

*"Non-Chinese speaking parents may not be willing to come to schools to communicate with us, especially the women, who rarely go out. She may feel that at home, the children do not listen to them anyway. Moreover, generally their education level is low. It seems a dream if you ask them to learn Chinese in their 30s and 40s." -- School G Mathematics / General Studies Teacher D*

*"Non-Chinese speaking students are mostly cared for by their mothers. Their culture does not allow women to get in touch with outsiders. Two years ago, we tried to*

*hold some parenting training classes but failed because they did not participate."-  
School I Chinese Language subject teacher A*

There is another teacher pointing out that NCS parents do not care much about education and the importance of participation in school activities. Some parents would let their children absent from school after collecting the report card in July.

*"Some NCS parents are practical. After they collect the report card in July, they would think it is meaningless to participate in the post-examination activities. For the reason of skipping one month of school bus fee, they would simply not let the children go to school."—School H English Language teacher C*

#### **4.2.2 Teaching skills related to teaching non-Chinese speaking students**

##### **4.2.2.1 Teaching support is limited to the Chinese Language**

Some non-Chinese Language subject teachers said that the current support for teaching non-Chinese speaking students is limited to the Chinese Language. Non-Chinese subjects are also taught in Chinese, and teachers also have the need for related support.

*"In fact, during the past three years, I have been inquiring the Education Bureau, including the Mathematics Development Group and different Mathematics groups, hoping to get some Mathematics support for non-Chinese speaking students, but I have not received any response." -- School G Mathematics / Common Sense Teacher D*

*"The Education Bureau only supports Chinese Language, and for other subjects we can only rely on teachers to do it, and it is very difficult. The support that Education Bureau provides is insufficient, schools need to support their students themselves." -- School E General Studies Teacher D*

##### **4.2.2.2 The ability of teaching assistants is not sufficient to support non-Chinese speaking students**

Teaching assistants lack teaching experience. Some teachers expressed that teaching assistants may not be able to cater for the learning needs of non-Chinese speaking students.

Some teachers said that some non-Chinese speaking parents have difficulty in understanding English. Teaching assistants may not be able to do translation or interpretation work. It is recommended that the Education Bureau relaxes the flexibility of using the resources and allow schools to employ translators.

*"At present, the education sector lacks a group of teaching assistants that specially cater for non-Chinese speaking students." -- School D Chinese Language subject teacher B*

*"The Education Bureau can train a group of teaching assistants to help support non-Chinese speaking students and allocate the number of teaching assistants according to the number of non-Chinese speaking students." -- School I Chinese Language subject teacher A*

*"I think the Education Bureau can provide more financial assistance and give schools the autonomy to decide how to use the money. If the school has just admitted a lot of non-Chinese speaking students and needs more translators, then the money can be used to employ translators as needed." -- School E English Language teacher C*

#### **4.2.2.3 Refresher courses fail to improve the skills of teaching non-Chinese speaking students**

Some teachers who have participated in the refresher course said that the refresher course is too theoretical, and the lecturer does not understand the actual needs.

Some teachers also said that there was an instructor of the refresher courses offered by the Education Bureau who has no experience of teaching non-Chinese speaking students, which made the participants feel greatly disappointed and that the time was wasted.

*"There were some seminars or workshops that have very similar content as the refresher courses, so I hope that these programs can be carried out systematically to avoid duplication." -- School E Chinese Language subject teacher B*

#### **4.2.2.4 Students' ability varies greatly**

Some teachers believed that the ability of the students in the same class varies greatly. Not only are there Chinese speaking students with different abilities, but also non-Chinese speaking students, as well as students with special educational needs, making it difficult to cater for the learning patterns and needs of different students. Some teachers also said that some non-Chinese speaking students may also have special educational needs. It is difficult for teachers to catch up with the progress of the school curriculum and cope with various needs at the same time.

Some teachers worried that if they want to accommodate the progress of non-Chinese speaking students, it may delay the progress of Chinese speaking students.

*"If all students are required to accommodate the progress of non-Chinese speaking students, this would drag down the language proficiency of Chinese speaking students." -- School C Chinese Language subject teacher A*

*"The difficulty is that we have to keep up with the progress of the school, but in fact, non-Chinese speaking students can't keep up." -- School C Chinese Language subject teacher B*



*"Because non-Chinese speaking students have infiltrated into different classes and different grades. If there is only one non-Chinese speaking student in a class, how can teachers teach all students together." -- School E Chinese Language subject teacher A*

*"In reality, there are students of different levels of abilities in a class. In particular, we adopt mixed-mode teaching. There are Chinese-speaking students, non-Chinese speaking students, and SEN (special educational needs) students. We must consider students of different abilities. "-- School C Chinese Language subject teacher A*

*"Most of the time, teachers have to teach according to the teaching content of the whole class, and cannot put in too much time in the class to meet the needs of the non-Chinese speaking students. So, to some extent, NCS students would feel that the course is relatively difficult and fail to keep up with the rapid teaching pace."-- School B number subject teacher C*

#### **4.2.2.5 Lack of special educational assessment tools designed for non-Chinese speaking students**

Some teachers mentioned that there is currently a lack of special educational assessment tools for non-Chinese speaking students, which delays the opportunity for early intervention.

*"The Education Bureau stipulates that if non-Chinese speaking students need to undergo assessments for special education needs, it needs to be delayed by one year than Chinese speaking students because it is necessary to rule out the possibility of the effect of language barriers on learning. Even if we are quite certain that some students have special educational needs, they must wait for a year. This would delay the opportunity of providing support to them, for example, allowing them to join the special educational needs support group. Resources are limited, and students need to get the reports before the school can provide support." -- School G Chinese Language subject teacher A*

#### **4.2.2.6 It is difficult to teach students with low motivation**

Some teachers said that some non-Chinese speaking students have a very low level of motivation to learn. They often do not submit their homework and parents do not cooperate with the school requirements, making teaching more difficult.

*"It varies among students. For students who have rather low learning motivations, they do not want to participate in class nor hand in homework." -- School A Chinese Language subject teacher A*

### 4.2.3 Teachers' attitudes towards non-Chinese speaking students being taught in mainstream schools

#### **4.2.3.1 Disagree with the assessment mechanism of the Education Bureau**

At present, schools are allowed to make adjustments for the assessments of Primary One to Primary Four for non-Chinese speaking students. However, since Primary Five, non-Chinese speaking students are assessed by the examination papers of Chinese-speaking students for the purpose of Secondary School Places Allocation. Teachers expressed that this is unfair. Some teachers explained that the results for Secondary School Places Allocation are calculated proportionately, where the results of language subjects account for a large proportion. The Chinese Language result would drag down the overall learning performance, making it impossible for non-Chinese speaking students to attend better schools.

*"The performance of Chinese Language has greatly lowered their scores. Because Secondary School Places Allocation involves the results of all subjects, which are then calculated proportionately, Chinese Language would lower the performance of other subjects. Therefore, their choices for the Secondary School Places Allocation are relatively fewer compared to Chinese-speaking students. They are suitable for studying in English schools, but they do not meet the requirements for attending English schools." -- School H Chinese Language subject teacher B*

#### **4.2.3.2 Feeling discouraged in teaching non-Chinese speaking students**

Because internal examinations for Secondary School Places Allocation require non-Chinese speaking students to be assessed with the examination papers of Chinese-speaking students, some teachers think that even if they try hard to teach non-Chinese speaking students, it is difficult to help them catch up with the level of Chinese-speaking students, and thus they feel discouraged.

*"Our Primary One to Primary Four classes are clearly divided into non-Chinese-speaking courses and Chinese-speaking courses. Non-Chinese-speaking courses are of course easier and with adjustments. But when students are promoted to Primary Five, since they need to join Secondary School Places Allocation, which takes fairness into account, the examination papers of non-Chinese speaking students and Chinese-speaking students need to be the same. This is a big problem." -- School H Chinese Language subject teacher B*

## 4.2.4 Teachers' awareness of teaching non-Chinese speaking students

### **4.2.4.1 Unclear guidelines**

Some teachers pointed out that guidelines of their schools and of the Education Bureau were inconsistent, and teachers were confused.

In addition, materials developed by the Education Bureau in cooperation with different institutions lack completeness and consistency, and teachers need to spend time to screen the materials. Some teachers suggested that resources can be unified to develop a complete non-Chinese speaking language program.

Non-Chinese subject teachers also thought that the Education Bureau has not provided relevant guidance and support for the teaching of other subjects, making it very difficult to teach.

*"The 'Second Language Learning Framework' is very theoretical." -- School H  
Chinese Language subject teacher B*

*"The Second Language Learning Framework may be a good reference for research and analysis, but it is not very practical when it comes to the real-life classroom application. Children's progresses are different, so we need to prepare materials outside the framework. I think the framework makes me feel confused." -- School C  
Chinese Language subject teacher B*

*"I feel that the guidelines are inadequate. Our school has a set (of guidelines) and the Government has another set (of guidelines), so I feel a bit messy." -- School C  
Chinese Language subject teacher A*

*"The Education Bureau has no guidelines or support for the teaching of other subjects (non-Chinese subjects). Schools need to explore it themselves entirely. I think it is very difficult. The Education Bureau should at least listen to our opinions." -- School E  
General Studies Teacher C*

### **4.2.4.2 The pull-out support is contrary to the intention of abolishing the designated schools**

Some teachers pointed out that the intention of the Education Bureau to abolish the designated schools is to enable non-Chinese speaking students to study with Chinese-speaking students. Unfortunately, the Education Bureau did not consider that the gap between the Chinese listening and speaking abilities of some non-Chinese speaking students and Chinese speaking students is too large. Schools had no choice but to support non-Chinese speaking students with pull-out program, leading to doubts that this practice may violate the original intention.

*"We want to teach non-Chinese speaking students Chinese, but we pull them out from class and teach them in English. It seems to be putting the cart before the*

*horse. Although the pull-out teaching seems good, it does not match the general direction." -- School E Chinese Language subject teacher A*

*"After separating (pulling-out) non-Chinese speaking students from their Chinese-speaking counterparts, we began to find that it reduces their Chinese context." -- School H Chinese Language subject teacher A*

#### **4.2.4.3 Teaching non-Chinese speaking students needs patience**

Some teachers reflected that, because NCS students' learning progress is rather slow, and the outcomes of the teaching do not appear immediately, so teaching non-Chinese speaking students requires a lot of patience. This is not something that every teacher can do.

Due to cultural differences and different attitudes towards education, some teachers expressed that teaching non-Chinese speaking students involves being not too authoritarian and too demanding. They need to abandon the previous concept of focusing on achievements, but instead focus on the campus life of students, and even relax the requirements of submitting homework after considering the situation of students.

*"Teacher teaching non-Chinese speaking students need to have a more inclusive attitude. Some teachers who are rather strong and dominant need to let go of some (standard) and should not be too authoritarian and too strict." -- School H Chinese Language subject teacher A*

*"Teachers should understand the situation of non-Chinese speaking students. Schools can also handle their homework submission more leniently." -- School B General Studies Teacher D*

#### **4.2.4.4 Non-Chinese speaking students with weak learning ability find it difficult to adapt to mainstream schools**

Some teachers expressed that at the Primary One schools places allocation, the Education Bureau should consider the students' level of Chinese language listening and speaking. Some teachers explained that if the starting point of non-Chinese speaking students is too different from other students, without sufficient support, this would affect the motivation and confidence of non-Chinese speaking students in learning Chinese and other subjects. It is recommended that these students should be enrolled into schools with a higher proportion of non-Chinese speaking students.

#### 4.2.4.5 Teaching non-Chinese speaking students increases the workload of teachers

In order to meet the learning needs of non-Chinese speaking students, teachers often have to redesign and rearrange a complete set of course and teaching materials. Some teachers expressed that teaching non-Chinese speaking students has increased the workload of teachers and suggested that schools should increase their manpower. Some teachers even thought that the workload is almost equivalent to that of a publisher.

To illustrate the point, a teacher said they need to find additional teaching resources to teach non-Chinese speaking students. In addition, the content of some of the teaching resources found are not based on the context of Hong Kong. Teachers need to rewrite them to meet the needs of students. This takes up a lot of their time.

Another teacher in an English primary school said that generally the publishers first publish the Chinese version of a textbook. There are relatively fewer choices for the English version of the teaching materials (for example, worksheets), and thus need to be written by teachers themselves.

*"The Education Bureau allows schools to develop (course materials) freely, while requiring the schools to ensure that non-Chinese speaking students have the ability to be assessed for the Secondary School Places Allocation. In fact, this requires a company to do it." -- School H Chinese Language subject teacher A*

*"I feel that there is a lack of support. Chinese Language subject panels need to develop a first language course and also a second language course. They also need to train new teachers to teach non-Chinese speaking students. In one year's time, Chinese Language subject panels need to teach and at the same time develop teaching materials for different students. Imagine how a teacher can have so much time to handle all these things. The work done naturally wouldn't be of high quality, because there is no room to think." -- School H Chinese Language subject teacher B*

*"Teachers need to find the right reading materials from the vast amount of materials, and readjust and redesign, it involves a lot of work." -- School B Chinese Language subject teacher B*

*"Teachers need to find additional resources on their own, but some of the contents are not of Hong Kong context (Hong Kong-based). They do not meet the teaching needs. Teachers need to spend time looking for suitable teaching resources." -- School D Chinese Language subject teacher B*

*"In terms of textbooks, many booksellers publish in Chinese first, and the English version would lag behind. As a result, teachers need to prepare their own teaching resources, such as exercises. The supplementary exercises in the bookshops are mostly in Chinese, reducing teachers' choice." -- School D General Studies Teacher C*

#### ***4.2.4.6 Heavy teaching workload, making it difficult for teachers to balance training with job***

Some teachers pointed out that quotas of refresher courses are limited, and registration is difficult.

In addition, some teachers said that the workload of teachers is already very heavy, and it is difficult to balance training with job.

*"There are not many quotas for refresher courses." -- School E Chinese Language subject teacher B*

*"These (refresher courses) are fully booked very quickly and it is difficult to sign up. In addition, teachers really have a lot of things to deal with, and I don't want to leave students in the lurch in order to attend the training." -- School C Chinese Language subject teacher A*

*"The Education Bureau may consider organizing refresher courses during the summer break. Even if the Education Bureau provides a five-week refresher course, how can teachers attend the course during term time?" - School E Chinese Language subject teacher B*

### 4.3 Summary of interview results

To analyze the challenges faced by school principals and teachers, the problem is that the level of Chinese language required by the current internal examinations for the purpose of Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) is too high, which is much higher than the level that non-Chinese speaking students can achieve. Under the current system, non-Chinese speaking students are required to participate in the internal examination for SSPA in Primary five and six. The results of the examination are used to determine the allocation of secondary school places (i.e. SSPA). However, the design of the test paper itself is used to assess the level of Chinese speaking students. The design of the test questions and the scoring standards are based on the ability of Chinese speaking students. Obviously, this evaluation mechanism is not fair to non-Chinese speaking students. Subject to the current system, schools need to prepare non-Chinese speaking students to participate in the examination. Before being promoted to Primary 5, schools need to prepare the non-Chinese speaking students to achieve the same level as Chinese speaking students during Primary 1 to 4. There are only 4 years for the schools to do so.

However, it is not easy for schools to let non-Chinese speaking students achieve the same language proficiency as Chinese speakers' students in a short period of time. In terms of teaching resources, schools reflected that there is not a complete set of textbooks made for second-language learners that can match the mainstream curriculum. At present, teaching materials for non-Chinese speaking students are made by teachers themselves every year. In terms of workforce arrangements, schools has encountered considerable difficulties in employing teachers who have received training in teaching second language. The amount of subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is insufficient to schools that have less than 10 non-Chinese speaking schools. Despite suitable applicants are found, those schools are impossible to employ teachers who are more qualified and experienced. Furthermore, most of the school's support relies on textbooks and teaching strategies designed by teachers. If teachers do not have the relevant qualifications for second language teaching, it is difficult to guarantee the effectiveness of the support. In fact, the strategies used in second language teaching and the learning process of second language students are different from first language teaching (Cook, 2016). Teachers need to have relevant professional knowledge to effectively support the second language students and design appropriate materials. However, there is no professional qualification requirement for teachers of second language teaching in Hong Kong. With reference to situations overseas, second language teaching is strictly required to be supported by qualified teachers who have received second language teaching training. To reflect the support for second language teaching in Hong Kong, although subsidy is available to schools to employ additional staff, no relevant professional qualifications are required. The effectiveness of support and the quality of teaching cannot be guaranteed.

On the one hand, mainstream schools in Hong Kong need both relevant teaching resources and professional teachers. On the other hand, support measures need to be supported by families. While interviewed teachers reported that they lack a comprehensive understanding of the cultural practices of ethnic minorities, they pointed

out that non-Chinese speaking parents pay less attention to their children's learning than Chinese parents, and that the parenting styles are different, which make the support more difficult.



## 5. Questionnaire survey

### 5.1 Questionnaire design

The study consists of two stages: first stage is a qualitative study of cases using a semi-structured interviews and the results from the first stage are used to design the questionnaires used in the second stage; the second stage is a questionnaire survey of all primary schools in Hong Kong. Both stages recruited school principals and teachers from the mainstream primary schools. The interviews and questionnaires can be found in the annexes. Items of questionnaires were asked on a scale of 0-5, the percentages of 0-2 and 3-5 points were illustrated in the following report.

The principal questionnaire had 8 parts: personnel arrangements, difficulties in teaching Chinese Language subject and assessment, situation of other subjects' teaching and overall teaching circumstances, measures to support NCS students, suggestions on supporting NCS students, key factors affecting the effectiveness of teaching NCS students, principals' views towards different ethnicities, and school information.

The teacher questionnaire had 8 parts: difficulties of teachers in teaching NCS students, situation of overall teaching, difficulties in Chinese Language learning and assessment, measures to support NCS students, suggestions on supporting NCS students, key factors affecting the effectiveness of teaching NCS students, teachers' views towards different ethnicities and teacher information.

### 5.2 Respondents

A total of 1,230 teacher questionnaires and 121 principal questionnaires were completed. 64 school principals responded to opt out from the survey, the total number of school principal questionnaire is 185, equivalent to a response rate of 63.4%, and the participation rate of principals is 41.4% of all primary schools with NCS students in Hong Kong. Teachers, who completed the teacher questionnaire, were from at least 135 primary schools which covered 46.2% of all primary schools admitting NCS students in Hong Kong. Among these teachers, 88.1% of them were coming from aided primary schools, 8.5% government primary schools, 3.3% direct-funded primary schools and 0.1% private primary schools. The principals were from 121 primary schools of which 88.1% were from aided primary schools, 9.3% government primary schools and 2.5% direct-funded primary schools. There were 612 (50.2%) Chinese Language subject teachers and 607 (49.8%) non-Chinese Language subject teachers (including 271 English subject teachers, 178 mathematics subject teachers, 125 General Studies teachers and 33 other subjects teachers). The average teaching years is 12.3 years. 11 of them did not report the subject they taught.

According to the principals' questionnaires, 38 of them (31.4%) were from schools admitting 1-9 NCS students, 32 of them (26.5%) admitting 10-30 NCS students, 7 of them (5.8%) admitting 31-50 NCS students, and 44 of them (36.4%) admitting more than 50 NCS students. Schools with 1-9 NCS students were referred to as "extremely low NCS composition schools"; those with 10-30 NCS students hereinafter referred to as "low NCS

composition schools"; schools with 31-50 NCS students hereinafter referred to as "medium NCS composition schools", and those with more than 50 NCS students hereinafter referred to as "high NCS composition schools". Table 1 below illustrated the basic information of these four types of schools.

Table 1: Number of NCS students

Types of schools	Average number of NCS students	Average number of all students	Proportion of NCS students in schools
Extremely low composition (1-9 NCS students)	4	640	0.63% (1 : 160)
Low composition (10-30 NCS students)	18	622	2.89% (1 : 34.6)
Medium composition (31-50 NCS students)	37	531	6.97% (1 : 14.4)
High composition (more than 50 NCS students)	223	463	48.16% (1 : 2.08)

### 5.3 Principal questionnaire

#### 5.3.1 Personnel arrangements

Most principals were facing the same difficulties in employing teachers (93.2%) who have skill in teaching relating to Chinese as a second language. Employing teachers and teaching assistants who had experience teaching NCS students (92.6% and 90.8% respectively), teachers who were able to teach NCS students (88.4%), and teaching assistants capable of teaching NCS students (88.4%) were also comparatively challenging for principals. (See Table 2)

To what extent do you think it is difficult to ...	More difficulties (%)	Less difficulties (%)
1) Employ teachers who have experience teaching NCS students	88.4	11.6
2) Employ teachers who are capable of teaching NCS students	88.4	11.6
3) Employ teachers who have passion in teaching NCS students	83.5	16.5
4) Employ teaching assistants who have experience teaching NCS students	92.6	7.4
5) Employ teaching assistants who are capable of teaching NCS students	90.8	9.2
6) Employ teaching assistant who have passion in teaching NCS students	86.7	13.3
7) Employ teachers who have skill in teaching Chinese as a second language	93.2	6.8
8) Provide incentives for teachers to be willing to teach NCS students	79.2	20.8
9) Retain teaching assistants who have experience in teaching NCS students	83.3	16.7
10) Maintain enough resources to employ specialist teachers to teach NCS students	72.5	27.5
11) Transform teachers' mind-set and accept teaching NCS students	62.8	37.2
12) Encourage teachers to teach NCS students with more flexible teaching modes	66.9	33.1
13) Arrange teachers to take refresher courses to learn how to teach NCS students	59.5	40.5
14) Arrange short-term training courses (such as lectures, workshops, etc.) for teachers to learn how to teach NCS students	45	55
15) Appoint experienced teachers to coordinate the learning and teaching of NCS students	56.2	43.8
16) Arranging teachers/teaching assistants to provide after-school tutorials for NCS students	50.4	49.6

Table 2: Difficulties in personnel arrangements (n=121)

Among the categories which most principals expressed difficulties, there are more than 90% of extremely low and low-NCS students composition schools have encountered greater obstacles in “employing teachers who are capable of teaching NCS students”, “employing teaching assistants who are experienced in teaching NCS students”, and “employing teachers who are skillful in teaching Chinese as a second language” (see Table 3). It might be because these schools received the lowest amount of subsidy and the subsidy is less sustainable, that limited the conditions to employ suitable teachers.

The difficulties faced by different types of schools	Extremely low concentration (%) (n=38)	Low NCS composition school (%) (n=32)	Medium NCS composition school (%) (n=7)	High NCS composition school (%) (n=44)
1) Employ teachers who have experience teaching NCS students	84.2	90.6	85.7	90.9
2) Employ teachers who are capable of teaching NCS students	86.8	84.4	85.7	93.2
4) Employ teaching assistants who have experience teaching NCS students	92.1	93.8	85.7	93.2
5) Employ teaching assistants who are capable of teaching NCS students	89.5	93.5	85.7	90.8
7) Employ teachers who have skill in teaching Chinese as a second language	92.1	96.6	85.7	93.2

Table 3: The main difficulties facing by schools with different concentrations of NCS students

## 5.3.2 Chinese learning and assessment

### *5.3.2.1 Curriculum design*

Most of the interviewed principals (94.2%) believed that Chinese writing requirements of mainstream curriculum is too demanding for NCS students. In addition, about 90% of the principals suggested that mainstream Chinese courses are too difficult for NCS students. Nearly 88% of the principals also said that the “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework” fails to match the actual teaching progress. (See Table 4)

To what extent do you agree with the following descriptions?	Agree (%)
1. The expected learning outcomes set by the “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework” are too ideal and do not generally meet the learning process of NCS students.	86.8
2. The “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework” fails to match the actual teaching progress	87.6
3. The “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework” does not help NCS students to keep up with the mainstream learning process	74.8
4. The lack of supporting facilities for the “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework” makes it difficult to assist teachers to integrate NCS students into mainstream Chinese Language subject lessons.	85.1
5. The mainstream Chinese Language course is too difficult for NCS students.	90.1
6. Chinese writing in mainstream curriculum is too demanding for NCS students	94.2

Table 4: Challenges in curriculum design (n=121)

### 5.3.2.2 Teaching materials

About 95% of the principals indicated that there is a lack of materials which match the mainstream curriculum. 89.3% of the principals agreed that Chinese Language subject teachers should rely on individual efforts to develop teaching materials and exercises. (See Table 5)

To what extent do you agree with the following descriptions?	Agree (%)
1. There is an absence of textbooks that set Chinese as a second language as well as conjunction with mainstream curriculum.	95
2. Chinese Language subject teachers must rely on personal efforts in developing textbooks, exercises, and various adjustments.	89.3
3. Following the previous question, Chinese Language subject teachers lack supports in developing textbooks, exercises, and various adjustment assessments	89.3

Table 5: Challenges in teaching materials (n=121)

### 5.3.2.3 Class arrangements

Most of the interviewed principals (96.7%) suggested that despite implementing integration and pull-out learning measures, it is still difficult for NCS students to reach the language level similar to the Chinese speaking students of the same grade before the Internal Examinations (from Primary 1 to Primary 4). (See Table 6)

To what extent do you agree with the following descriptions?	Agree (%)
1. NCS students are usually scattered at all grades	85.1
2. Following the previous question, schools have insufficient resources to arrange for the separation or intensive study support for NCS students in each grade.	76.9
3. Despite the application of the integration and pull-out learning measures, it is still difficult for NCS students to reach the language level similar to the Chinese speaking students of the same grade before the Internal Examinations (from Primary 1 to Primary 4).	96.7

Table 6: Challenges in class arrangements (n=121)

### 5.3.2.4 Assessment arrangements

Most of the principals (95.9%) indicated that NCS students are at a disadvantage when tested by the same paper with Chinese speaking students. (See Table 7)

To what extent do you agree with the following descriptions?	Agree (%)
1. If NCS students and Chinese speaking students are given the same Chinese language test papers, NCS students are at a disadvantage.	95.9
2. Chinese language scores of NCS students and Chinese speakers should be distributed separately.	83.3

3. NCS students should receive adjustments during the assessment (e.g. Reading aloud to the students)	86.8
---	------

Table 7: Challenges in assessment agreements (n=121)

### 5.3.2.5 Teaching staff arrangements

More than nine-tenth of the principals thought that teaching assistants generally lack experience (95%) and teachers who have abundant experience in teaching NCS students should provide support for NCS students separately (94.2%). On the other hand, 95% the principals suggested that the replacement of teaching assistants will affect the stability of teaching and NCS students are required to constantly adapt to the teaching style of different teachers (96.3%). (See Table 8)

To what extent do you agree with the following descriptions?	Agree (%)
1. Teaching assistants have sufficient professional knowledge to judge the student's Chinese language proficiency	37.1
2. Teaching assistants have the capability to design appropriate and progressive courses	27.6
3. There remains a high turnover rate of teaching assistants	67.8
4. The replacement of teaching assistants will affect the stability of teaching	95
5. NCS students are required to constantly adapt to the teaching style of different teachers.	96.3
6. Teaching assistants generally lack teaching experience	95
7. Pull-out learning of Chinese for NCS students should be provided by teachers who are experienced in teaching NCS students.	94.2
8. Pull-out learning of Chinese for NCS students should be provided by highly qualified teachers.	76.9

Table 8: Challenges in teaching staff arrangements (n=121)

### 5.3.2.6 The difficulties in teaching NCS students Chinese using Mandarin

More than 85% of the principals said that learning Chinese in Mandarin not only leads more obstacle for NCS students to integrate into the Chinese Language subject lesson (87.2%), but also increases difficulties in Chinese learning (85.7%). (See Table 9)

Difficulties in teaching NCS students Chinese using Mandarin	Agree (%)
1) For schools using Putonghua as the medium of instruction (MOI) for teaching Chinese Language Subject (PMIC): It is very difficult to employ teaching assistants who are capable of teaching Chinese in Mandarin.	89.9
2) For schools using Putonghua as the medium of instruction (MOI) for teaching Chinese Language Subject (PMIC): It is more difficult for NCS students to integrate into the Chinese Language subject lesson in mainstream curriculum.	87.2

- 3) For schools using Putonghua as the medium of instruction (MOI) for teaching Chinese Language Subject (PMIC): 85.7  
It is very difficult for NCS students to learn Chinese in Mandarin.

Table 9: Difficulties in teaching NCS students Chinese using Mandarin

### 5.3.3 Overall teaching circumstances

#### 5.3.3.1 Impacts of students' personal factors on learning

95% of the principals believed that NCS students who have never received local kindergarten education encounter the greatest difficulty to adapt to mainstream curriculum, reflecting the importance of connections between kindergarten and primary school. About 91% of the principals indicated that the Chinese learning level of NCS students affects their overall learning performance. (See Table 10)

The impacts of students' personal factors on learning	Agree (%)
1. Many NCS students have not received local kindergarten education	58.7
2. Following the previous question, NCS students who have never received local kindergarten education encounter the greatest difficulty to adapt to mainstream curriculum	95
3. The Chinese learning level of NCS students affects their overall learning performance	90.9
4. NCS students are often absent which affects teaching progress	66.1
5. NCS students are often overdue for their homework	66.9

Table 10: The impact of student personal factors on learning (n=121)

#### 5.3.3.2 Progression issues

More than 80% of the principals suggested that the Internal Examinations restrict the future academic development of NCS students (86%), which leads to limited choices for secondary school progression (86.7%). (See Table 11)

Progression issues	Agree (%)
1. Internal Examinations restrict the future academic development of NCS students	86
2. Following the previous question, NCS students have limited choice of secondary school progression	86.7
3. According to the current mechanism, Chinese Language and Mathematics will be scored nine times larger. Thus, Chinese language ability will have a great impact on the allocation. For most NCS students, both Chinese and English are their second language. As a result, the current Internal Examinations mechanism is unfair to non-Chinese speaking students compared to Chinese speaking students who only require learning one second language (English).	82.6

Table 11: Progression issues (n=121)



### 5.3.3.3 Impacts of family factors on NCS students' learning

According to the results, 86.6% of the principals agreed that NCS students lack family support. (See Table 12)

Impacts of family factors on NCS students' learning	Agree (%)
1. NCS students lack family support	86.6
2. Parents of NCS students lack resources to enroll tutorials for their children	79.3
3. Parents of NCS students have lower expectations for their children's education	77.7
4. Parents of NCS students are not willing to communicate with teachers	56.7

Table 12: Family factors affecting NCS students' learning (n=121)

### 5.3.3.4 Issues in relation to teaching NCS Students

At least 90% of the principals indicated that the Education Bureau lacks support for NCS students (92.6%). Moreover, it is impossible to take care of other subjects (e.g. Mathematics, General Studies) (95%), since the extra subsidy can only be used for the learning and teaching of Chinese Language. On the other hand, most of the principals agreed that it is very strenuous for teachers to take care of both NCS and Chinese speaking students at the same time (92.6%). Also, there was a consensus that NCS students with learning difficulties lacked identification assessment tools which delayed intervention (95%). (See Table 13)

Issues in relation to teaching NCS students	Agree (%)
1. The Education Bureau lacks support for NCS students in other disciplines (e.g. Mathematics, General Studies)	92.6
2. The additional subsidy provided by the Education Bureau according to the number of NCS students can only be used for the learning and teaching of Chinese language and there is no chance to cater for the needs of other subjects (e.g., Mathematics, General Studies).	95
3. Lack of identification tools for identifying NCS students with learning difficulties	95
4. It is very difficult for teachers to take care of both non-Chinese and Chinese speaking students while teaching.	92.6
5. Many teachers are not willing to teach NCS students	63.6

Table 13: Issues in relation to teaching NCS students (n=121)

### 5.3.4 Measures to support NCS students

#### 5.3.4.1 Measures related to staff arrangements in supporting NCS students

Most of the principals agreed that NCS students should be taught by teachers with more teaching experience. However, most of the principals found that the subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is not enough to employ teachers with more teaching experience. Instead, schools can only employ newly graduated teachers or even teaching assistants. Also, most principals agreed that “the subsidy is not enough to give teachers who are dedicated to teaching NCS students a chance to get promotion to a higher rank (i.e., PSM)” and “the subsidy is not enough to employ registered teachers to teach the NCS students”. (See Table 14)

Views towards the measures related to staff arrangements in supporting NCS students	Agree (%)			
	Extremely low NCS students composition schools (n=38)	Low NCS students composition schools (n=32)	Medium NCS students composition schools (n=7)	High NCS students composition schools (n=44)
1. The subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is not enough to employ an Assistant Primary School Teacher (APSM) to teach NCS students.	94.7	71.9	85.7	86
2. The subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is not enough to give teachers, who are dedicated to teaching NCS students, getting promotion (i.e. to PSM)	94.7	87.5	100	95.3

3. The subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is not enough to employ teachers with more teaching experience to support NCS students.	97.4	84.4	85.7	93
4. NCS students should be taught by teachers with more teaching experience	89.5	84.4	100	90.7
5. Government subsidy are often only enough to employ younger teachers or just teaching assistants.	100	93.8	85.7	97.7
6. Teachers who specialize in teaching NCS students lack professional recognition	94.7	90.6	100	81.4S

Table 14: Views towards the measures related to the staff arrangement in supporting the NCS students (n=121)

### 5.3.4.2 Measures related to the professional support

Considering the special measures and guidelines provided by the Education Bureau, most principals agreed that those supports are not enough for communication with NCS parents or cultural integration. (See Table 15)

Views towards the measures related to the professional supports	Agree (%)			
	Extremely low NCS students composition schools (n=38)	Low NCS students composition schools (n=32)	Medium NCS students composition schools (n=7)	High NCS students composition schools (n=44)
1. School-based curriculum development services provided by the Education Bureau have little effect	86.8	78.1	100	74.4
2. Teachers can hardly enroll refresher courses since the timetable for these courses was not notified to them as early as possible.	81.6	78.1	57.1	81.4
3. Teaching materials developed by the government and universities fail to meet the teacher's demand to support NCS students.	81.6	71.9	100	88.4
4. University scholars do not quite understand the needs of primary school	92.1	81.2	85.7	74.4

teachers to support NCS students.				
5. Refresher courses held by the university are too theoretical and out of reality.	86.8	71	85.7	81.4
6. Refresher courses held by the university fail to meet the teacher's demand to support NCS students.	84.2	67.7	85.7	81.4
7. The Education Bureau provides no special support measures or guidelines for communication with NCS parents.	92.1	78.1	85.7	83.7
8. The Education Bureau provides no special support measures or guidelines on the cultural integration of NCS students.	94.7	78.1	85.7	79.1

Table 15: Views towards the measures related to the professional support

### 5.3.5 Suggestions in supporting NCS students

#### *5.3.5.1 Suggestions related to the resources*

Nearly 90% of the principals suggested that the Education Bureau should increase the resources to support NCS students. Among them, most of the principals suggested that the Education Bureau should improve the flexibility on the subsidy usage so that schools may use it to promote communication between NCS parents and schools and cultural exchange activities. On the other hand, more than 80% of the principals suggested that the Education Bureau should provide professional recognition to teachers who are teaching NCS students as well as adding a teaching position in school system (for example, NCS students support teachers (NCSST), who is responsible for supporting learning (for example: Group teaching) and cultural integration. Since there is a demand to promote cultural exchange activities and communication between NCS parents and schools, the Education Bureau should also increase the amount of funding to meet various needs and give the amount of subsidy proportionate to the number of NCS students. (See Table 16)

Suggestions related to the resources	Effectiveness (%)			
	Extremely low NCS students composition schools (n=38)	Low NCS students composition schools (n=32)	Medium NCS students composition schools (n=7)	High NCS students composition schools (n=44)
1. The Education Bureau should increase the amount of subsidy to allow the schools to employ Assistant Primary School Degree Teachers (APSM) to provide NCS students with pull-out learning teaching support.	89.2	84.4	85.7	88.1
2. The subsidy of the Education Bureau should	89.2	93.8	100	87.8

be distributed according to the number of NCS students proportionately.

<p>3. The Education Bureau should improve the flexibility of using the subsidy so that schools may use it to promote cultural exchange activities and communication between NCS parents and schools.</p>	100	100	100	95.1
<p>4. The Education Bureau should add a coordinator position (e.g. NCSCO) who is responsible for co-ordinating the support work of NCS students, organizing student learning support group and promoting cultural inclusion in schools.</p>	78.4	87.5	100	95.2
<p>5. The Education Bureau should add a teacher position (Non-Chinese Speaking Students Support Teacher</p>	83.8	87.5	100	95.1

(NCSST)), who is responsible for supporting students' learning activities (for example: group teaching or split-group teaching) and cultural inclusion.

6. The Education Bureau should provide professional recognition to teachers who teach NCS students.	91.9	90.6	100	95.2
7. The Education Bureau should require NCS support teachers to ensure the received subsidy to be use for the learning and needs of NCS students.	94.6	84.4	100	90.5

Table 16: Suggestions for resources (n=121)



### 5.3.5.2 Suggestions related to the professional support and development

Considering the problems of lacking supporting teaching materials, most of the principals suggested that the Education Bureau should provide matched teaching materials for the “Second Language Learning Framework”. They also agreed that it is necessary to set up a platform which allows schools to share teaching resources for NCS students. On the other hand, most of the principals suggested that the Education Bureau should promote more sustainable and closer cooperation between schools and university experts. The Education Bureau also needs to support NCS students in other subjects (such as Mathematics and General Studies) as well as developing special measures in NCS parents' communication and cultural integration. (See Table 17)

Suggestions related to the professional support and development	Effectiveness (%)			
	Extremely low NCS students composition schools (n=38)	Low NCS students composition schools (n=32)	Medium NCS students composition schools (n=7)	High NCS students composition schools (n=44)
1. The Government should re-implement the policy of "designated schools"	94.6	65.6	100	81
2. The Education Bureau needs to provide teaching materials for the “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework”.	94.6	96.9	100	100
3. The Education Bureau should support NCS students' learning in other subjects (such as Mathematics and General Studies).	94.6	100	100	100
4. The Education Bureau should set up a platform for schools to share teaching resources designed for NCS students.	97.3	90.6	100	100
5. The Education Bureau should promote more sustainable and closer cooperation	100	93.8	100	100

between schools and university experts.

6. The Education Bureau should organize NCS teaching support teams and send staff for supporting schools that admit NCS students.	91.9	84.4	100	97.6
7. The Education Bureau can group NCS students of low NCS composition primary schools, located in the same district, and provide them with group learning support, based on their Chinese language proficiency (for example: after-school, Saturday enrichment courses or support)	83.8	71.9	100	82.9
8. As for teacher training, prospective teachers should be specialized their training of teaching Chinese as a second language	94.6	78.1	100	92.9
9. The government should encourage teachers, who teach NCS students, to get the related training by providing some incentives.	86.5	84.4	85.7	90.5
10. The Education Bureau should have special measures on the school-parent communication and cultural integration for NCS parents.	100	87.5	100	100
11. The Education Bureau should set up professional training development for teachers who teach NCS	97.3	84.4	85.7	95.1

students, so that schools can systematically train specialist teachers (e.g. it can be done by providing basic, advanced and special courses)

12. The Education Bureau should require a certain number of teachers in each school to receive relevant training in teaching NCS students.	73	65.6	71.4	82.9
13. The Education Bureau should plan the whole school approach in supporting NCS students' learning and related policies.	81.1	81.2	100	90.2

Table 17: Suggestions related to the professional support and development (n=121)

### 5.3.5.3 Preferences of the suggestions

School principals were asked to rank the above suggestions based on the importance, urgency and effectiveness. Most principals put “the Education Bureau should add a teaching position in the school system (for example, Non-Chinese Speaking Students Support Teacher (NCSST)), who is responsible for supporting learning (for example: Group teaching) and cultural integration.”, to the highest preference. The second highest preference is “The Education Bureau should increase the amount of subsidy to enable schools to employ Assistant Primary School Degree Teachers (APSM) to provide NCS students with pull-out teaching support.”. The third highest preference is “The Education Bureau should add a dedicated coordinator (e.g. NCSCO) to co-ordinate the support work of NCS students which includes organizing student support groups and promoting cultural inclusion in schools.”

#### 5.3.5.3.1 Five most important suggestions as perceived by the principals

Table 16 suggestion 5) The Education Bureau should add a teacher position, Non-Chinese Speaking Students Support Teacher (NCSST)), who is responsible for supporting students’ learning activities (for example: group teaching or split-group teaching) and supporting the cultural inclusion.	43.8%
---	-------

Table 16 suggestion 1) The Education Bureau should increase the amount of subsidy to allow the schools to employ Assistant Primary School Degree Teachers (APSM) to provide NCS students with pull-out learning teaching support.	39.7%
---	-------

Table 16 suggestion 4) The Education Bureau should add a coordinator position (e.g. NCSCO) who is responsible for co-ordinating the learning support work of NCS students, organizing student support group and promoting cultural inclusion in schools.	38.8%
Table 16 suggestion 3) The Education Bureau should improve the flexibility of using the subsidy so that schools may use it to promote cultural exchange activities and communication between NCS parents and schools.	30.6%
Table 17 suggestion 2) The Education Bureau needs to provide teaching materials for the “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework”.	29.8%
Table 17 suggestion 3) The Education Bureau should support the NCS students’ learning in other subjects (such as Mathematics and General Studies).	29.8%

#### ***5.3.5.3.2 Five most urgent suggestions as perceived by the principals***

Table 16 suggestion 5) The Education Bureau should add a teacher position (Non-Chinese Speaking Students Support Teacher (NCSST)), who is responsible for supporting students’ learning activities (for example: group teaching or split-group teaching) and supporting the cultural inclusion.	43.8%
Table 16 suggestion 1) The Education Bureau should increase the amount of subsidy to allow the schools to employ Assistant Primary School Degree Teachers (APSM) to provide NCS students with pull-out learning teaching support.	38.8%
Table 16 suggestion 4) The Education Bureau should add a coordinator position (e.g. NCSCO) who is responsible for co-ordinating the support work of NCS students, organizing student learning support group and promoting cultural inclusion in schools.	33.1%
Table 17 suggestion 2) The Education Bureau needs to provide teaching materials for the “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework”.	33.1%
Table 17 suggestion 3) The Education Bureau should support the NCS students’ learning in other subjects (such as Mathematics and General Studies).	33.1%

#### ***5.3.5.3.3 Five most effective suggestions as perceived by the principals***

Table 16 suggestion 5) The Education Bureau should add a teacher position (Non-Chinese Speaking Students Support Teacher (NCSST)), who is responsible for supporting students’ learning activities (for example: group teaching or split-group teaching) and supporting the cultural inclusion.	43.8%
Table 16 suggestion 1) The Education Bureau should increase the amount of subsidy to allow the schools to employ Assistant Primary School Degree	33.1%

Teachers (APSM) to provide NCS students with pull-out learning teaching support.

---

Table 16 suggestion 4) The Education Bureau should add a coordinator position (e.g. NCSCO) who is responsible for co-ordinating the support work of NCS students, organizing student learning support group and promoting cultural inclusion in schools.	33.1%
Table 17 suggestion 3) The Education Bureau should support the NCS students' learning in other subjects (such as Mathematics and General Studies).	31.4%
Table 17 suggestion 8) As for teacher training, prospective teachers should be specialized their training of teaching Chinese as a second language	24%

---

### 5.3.6 Key factors affecting the effectiveness of teaching NCS students

All principals believed that subsidy from the Education Bureau is the key to determine the effectiveness of learning and teaching among NCS students. On the other hand, nearly all principals agreed that teachers' understanding of NCS students (98.3%) and attitudes toward cultural differences (96.6%) have a great influence on teaching effectiveness. In terms of the effectiveness of teaching, all principals agreed that teachers' training (98.3%), teaching skills (99.2%), awareness of teaching effectiveness (99.2%), and enthusiasm in teaching NCS students (99.2%) are all key factors influencing the supports' effectiveness. Finally, the cooperation of NCS parents (100%) and the motivation of NCS students (100%) are equally important. (See Table 18)

Key factors affecting the effectiveness of teaching NCS students	The extent of effect (%)
1. Subsidy from the Education Bureau	100
2. School-based support services of the Education Bureau	93.2
3. A platform to allow schools to share teaching resources with each other introduced by the Education Bureau	95
4. NCS students supporting courses organized by the Education Bureau	95.8
5. A teaching position in the school system who is responsible for supporting NCS students introduced by the Education Bureau	95.8
6. NCS students supporting courses introduced by university	95.8
7. Teaching materials	97.5
8. School-based support provided by university	96.6
9. NCS parents' understanding of Hong Kong's education system	95
10. Educational expectations of NCS parents	97.5
11. Cooperation of NCS parents	100
12. Recruitment of experienced graduate teachers (GM) to support NCS students by schools	93.3
13. Teacher's understanding of NCS students	98.3
14. Teacher's attitude towards cultural differences	96.6
15. Teacher training to teach NCS students	98.3
16. Teacher's enthusiasm for teaching NCS students	99.2
17. Teacher's teaching skills	99.2
18. Teacher's teaching experience	97.5
19. Teacher's insight for self-teaching effectiveness	99.2
20. NCS students' cultural understanding of Hong Kong	94.1
21. Learning motivation of non-Chinese speaking students	100
22. Volunteer organization support for learning and inclusion of NCS students (e.g. tutorial, cultural exchange activities)	95.8

Table 18: Key factors affecting the effectiveness of teaching NCS students (n=121)

### ***5.3.6.1 Key factors that affect the most on the effectiveness of supporting NCS students as perceived by the principals***

Principals were asked to choose five key factors, from the above list, that have the most influence effect on the support effectiveness. Most principals believed that the subsidy provided by the EDB is the most influential factor. It is because if the amount of subsidy is inadequate, the schools would have insufficient resources to employ registered teachers, with teaching experience, to support NCS students. Thus, it influences the effectiveness directly.

1) Subsidy from the Education Bureau	54.5%
21) Learning motivation of non-Chinese speaking students	47.1%
5) A teaching position in the school system who is responsible for supporting NCS students introduced by the Education Bureau	38%
11) Cooperation of NCS parents	33.9%
2) School-based support services of the Education Bureau	28.1%

### 5.3.7 Views towards different ethnicities

#### **5.3.7.1 Recruitment matters**

Compared with other subjects, principals clearly have a conservative opinion (84.5%) for NCS applicants who meet the job requirements. (See Table 19)

Recruitment matters	Agree (%)
1. Willing to employ a NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as a Chinese Language subject teacher	84.5
2. Willing to employ a NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as an English Language teacher	94.9
3. Willing to employ a NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as a Mathematics teacher	90.6
4. Willing to employ a NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as a General Studies teacher	91.5
5. Willing to employ a NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as a teaching assistant	94

Table 19: Recruitment matters (n=121)

#### **5.3.7.2 Students' matters**

Only 93.2% of the principals clearly expressed their willingness to accept NCS students who meet the requirements for admission to Primary 1. (See Table 20)

Students' matters	Agree (%)
1. Willing to accept NCS students who meet the requirements for Primary 1 admission	93.2
2. Encourage NCS students to participate in extracurricular activities and allocate more resources to employ tutors who can teach in English / to provide extracurricular activities in English	89.8
3. Willing to let NCS schools participate in inter-school competitions (e.g. reading, singing, drama)	100
4. Willing to let Chinese speaking students know the cultural characteristics of other ethnic students in school	100

Table 20: Student matters (n=121)



### 5.3.7.3 Communication with parents

Only 84.7% of the principals agreed to provide English translations of school notices to promote communication with non-Chinese speaking parents. (See Table 21)

Communication with parents	Agree (%)
1. Willing to provide English translation of school notices to promote communication with NCS parents	84.7
2. Willing to arrange English teachers as class teachers for NCS students	91.5
3. Willing to allow NCS parents to join the Parent Teacher Association	99.1
4. Willing to explain the measures supporting NCS students in the "Primary School Overview" and the school website	93.2

Table 21: Communication with parents (n=121)

### 5.3.7.4 Understanding of different ethnicities

Only 68% of the principals indicated that they recognize the culture of each ethnic group. (See Table 22)

Understanding of different ethnicities	Agree (%)
1. You recognize the culture of each ethnic group	68.1
2. You recognize the traditions of various ethnicities	68.1
3. You have heard of the Racial Discrimination Ordinance	100
4. You understand the contents of the Racial Discrimination Ordinance	95.6
5. To consider the "Racial Discrimination Ordinance" when formulating school affairs	94.4

Table 22: Understanding of different ethnicities (n=121)

## 5.4 Teacher Questionnaire

### 5.4.1 Difficulties of teachers in teaching NCS students

#### 5.4.1.1 Difficulties of teachers in instructing NCS students

Similarly, teachers encountered a lot of difficulties in teaching NCS students. More than 70% of the teachers found it more difficult to “cater for the learning differences of both Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students at the same time” (74.8%), “help NCS students to keep up with the mainstream curriculum” (73.3%) and “reach learning objectives of the mainstream curriculum” (73.3%). (See Table 23)

	More difficulties (%)	Less difficulties (%)
1. Require NCS students to bring essential items for class (including stationeries and books)	42.7	57.3
2. Make NCS students understand classroom instructions	39.2	60.8
3. Apply appropriate teaching methods to guide NCS students to understand the teaching content	54.5	45.5
4. Make NCS students keep up with the teaching pace of the classroom	61.7	38.3
5. Inspire the learning motivation of NCS students	59.3	40.7
6. Apply teaching strategies to stimulate the curiosity of NCS students	50.5	49.5
7. Ask different levels of questions to guide NCS students' thinking	59.2	40.8
8. Apply questioning strategies to stimulate NCS students to take the initiative to speak	50.7	49.3
9. Provide opportunities for NCS students to express their opinions	30.3	69.7
10. Provide appropriate performance opportunities for NCS students	30.8	69.2
11. Arrange assignments that match the ability of NCS students	55.3	44.7
12. Make NCS students understand the homework requirements	51.5	48.5
13. Ask NCS students to submit all homework	62.3	37.7
14. Make NCS students keep up with the progress of mainstream curriculum	73.3	26.7
15. Make NCS students achieve the learning goals of the mainstream curriculum	73.3	26.7
16. Avoid over-emphasizing the importance of assessment scores to NCS students.	47.7	52.3

17. Cater for the learning differences of both Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students at the same time	74.8	25.2
18. Design teaching activities meeting the learning level of both Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students	65.8	34.2
19. Enhance the interaction between Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students	39	61

Table 23: Difficulties of teachers in instructing NCS students (n=1230)

#### ***5.4.1.2 Difficulties of Chinese Language subject teachers from schools of various compositions of NCS students***

Chinese Language subject teachers in schools of various NCS composition faced similar challenge in teaching NCS students. The Chinese Language subject teachers interviewed suggested the greatest difficulties include: making NCS students to keep up with the progress of the mainstream curriculum, making NCS students to achieve the learning objectives of the mainstream curriculum, and catering for the learning differences between Chinese and NCS students. Comparing with the other three types of schools, more Chinese Language subject teachers in medium-NCS students composition schools encountered the above difficulties (see Table 24).

	Chinese Language subject teachers (%) (n=611)			
	Extremely low NCS students composition schools (n=134)	Low NCS students composition schools (n=134)	Medium NCS students composition schools (n=31)	High NCS students composition schools (n=312)
1. Require NCS students to bring essential items for class (including stationeries and books)	32.8	47	61.3	45.8
2. Make NCS students understand classroom instructions	38.8	35.1	45.2	45.5
3. Apply appropriate teaching methods to guide NCS students to understand the	59.7	60.2	67.7	63.8

teaching content				
4. Make NCS students keep up with the teaching pace of the classroom	73.1	68.7	80.6	70.3
5. Inspire the learning motivation of NCS students	71.4	64.2	64.5	66
6. Apply teaching strategies to stimulate the curiosity of NCS students	65.7	56	60	58.8
7. Ask different levels of questions to guide NCS students' thinking	75.9	63.4	77.4	67.1
8. Apply questioning strategies to stimulate NCS students to take the initiative to speak	58.6	58.6	51.6	59.7
9. Provide opportunities for NCS students to express their opinions	43.3	25.6	45.2	35.6
10. Provide appropriate performance opportunities for NCS students	43.3	25.4	40	39
11. Arrange assignments that match the ability of NCS students	63.4	51.5	74.2	61
12. Make NCS students understand the homework requirements	57.6	48.5	58.1	58.7

13. Ask NCS students to submit all homework	56.7	66.9	77.4	69.9
14. Make NCS students keep up with the progress of mainstream curriculum	79.9	86.6	100	85.9
15. Make NCS students achieve the learning goals of the mainstream curriculum	82.8	85.8	96.8	85.9
16. Avoid over-emphasizing the importance of assessment scores to NCS students.	56.7	56	65.5	57.4
17. Cater for the learning differences of both Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students at the same time	84.3	83.8	96.6	86.2
18. Design teaching activities meeting the learning level of both Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students	75	70.5	86.2	80
19. Enhance the interaction between Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students	45.1	34.6	43.3	49.5

Table 24: Difficulties of Chinese Language subject teachers coming from schools of various NCS compositions in instructing NCS students

### 5.4.1.3 Difficulties of non-Chinese Language subject teachers from schools of various compositions of NCS students

Non-Chinese Language subject teachers from all NCS students composition schools have indicated that it is more difficult to “help NCS students keeping up with the progress of the mainstream curriculum” and “cater for the learning differences of both Chinese-speaking and NCS students at the same time”. For Non-Chinese Language subjects’ teachers coming from the medium and high NCS students composition schools, “asking NCS students to submit all homework” is more challenging. (See Table 25)

	Non-Chinese subject teachers (%) (n= 604)			
	Extremely low NCS students composition schools (n= 165)	Low NCS students composition schools (n=114)	Medium NCS students composition schools (n=29)	Extremely low NCS students composition schools (n= 296)
1. Require NCS students to bring essential items for class (including stationeries and books)	29.1	36.8	44.8	49.7
2. Make NCS students understand classroom instructions	33.5	33.6	24.1	41.7
3. Apply appropriate teaching methods to guide NCS students to understand the teaching content	51.2	41.2	37.9	47.1
4. Make NCS students keep up with the teaching pace of the classroom	55.4	51.8	55.2	51
5. Inspire the	55.1	45.1	44.8	52.9

learning motivation of NCS students				
6. Apply teaching strategies to stimulate the curiosity of NCS students	47	34.2	31	41.5
7. Ask different levels of questions to guide NCS students' thinking	53.6	43	37.9	50.5
8. Apply questioning strategies to stimulate NCS students to take the initiative to speak	50	37.7	37.9	40.2
9. Provide opportunities for NCS students to express their opinions	34.7	23.7	20.7	20.3
10. Provide appropriate performance opportunities for NCS students	31.5	24.6	20.7	21.3
11. Arrange assignments that match the ability of NCS students	55.7	48.2	37.9	48.8
12. Make NCS students understand the homework requirements	49.1	41.2	41.4	48.3
13. Ask NCS	49.7	57	79.3	60.3

students to submit all homework				
14. Make NCS students keep up with the progress of mainstream curriculum	64.7	57	65.5	59.7
15. Make NCS students achieve the learning goals of the mainstream curriculum	64.2	57.9	69	59
16. Avoid over-emphasizing the importance of assessment scores to NCS students.	41.9	31.6	48.3	38
17. Cater for the learning differences of both Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students at the same time	65.3	61.4	75.9	62.5
18. Design teaching activities meeting the learning level of both Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students	56.4	55.3	51.7	52.9



19. Enhance the interaction between Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students	38	31	37.9	30
---	----	----	------	----

Table 25: Difficulties of non-Chinese Language subject teachers in various NCS compositions in instructing NCS students

## 5.4.2 Situation of overall teaching

### 5.4.2.1 Teachers' confidence in teaching NCS students

Both Chinese and non-Chinese Language subject teachers have little confidence in teaching NCS students to reach the learning level close to that of Chinese speaking students. Only 37.8% of the Chinese Language subject teachers and 54.1% of non-Chinese Language subject teachers expressed that they are confident to help NCS students reaching similar level of the Chinese-speaking students. Less than half of the Chinese Language subject teachers expressed that they are confident to teach the NCS students while catering for the learning needs of Chinese-speaking (46.1%). Moreover, less than 60% of Chinese Language subject teachers expressed that they are confident to integrate the NCS students to learn with the Chinese-speaking students. Furthermore, a 73.9% of Chinese Language subject teachers expressed that they feel stressed. Besides, a 69.5% of Chinese Language subject teachers felt discouraged that NCS students fell far behind from their peers even though they have already given dedicated teaching and guidance to these students.

More than 80% of Chinese Language subject teachers (87.7%) and non-Chinese Language subject teachers (86.5%) agreed that “there is a lack of support from EDB to NCS students in learning non-Chinese Language subjects (e.g. Mathematics, General Studies). (See Table 26)

	Agree (%)	
	Chinese Language subject teacher (n=609)	Non-Chinese Language subject teacher (n=605)
1) You are confident to teach NCS students	71.3	75
2) You are confident to teach NCS students to reach the learning level close to that of the Chinese speaking students.	37.8	54
3) You are confident to teach NCS students while taking care the learning of Chinese-speaking	46.1	62.3

students.		
4) You are confident to integrate NCS students with the Chinese speaking students to learn effectively.	57.5	68
5) You feel stressed to take care of both NCS and Chinese speaking students while teaching.	73.9	61.5
6) When you are teaching NCS students, you are aware that you need to improve your teaching skills	88.7	82.9
7) When you are teaching NCS students, you are aware that you need to improve your lesson designs	89.7	83.6
8) You have ever felt discouraged because the NCS students are still falling behind the peers even after dedicating all your efforts to teach them	69.5	55.6
9) The disparity of Chinese language proficiency has affected the NCS students' overall learning performance	88.7	85.4
10) Lack of assessment tools to identify NCS students with learning difficulties	78.3	80.1
11) The Education Bureau lacks support for NCS students learning other subjects (e.g. mathematics and general studies)	87.7	86.5
12) You are willing to teach classes with NCS students even without school arrangement	77.7	82

Table 26: Teaching factors affecting NCS students' learning (n=1214)

#### 5.4.2.2 Family factors

Over 80% of Chinese and non-Chinese Language subject teachers said that NCS students are lacking family support. (See Table 27)

	Agree (%)	
	Chinese Language subject teacher (n=609)	Non-Chinese Language subject teacher (n=605)
1) NCS students lack family support	87.2	84
2) Parents of NCS students lack resources to enroll tutorials for their children	74.1	74
3) NCS parents have low expectations for their children's education	79.7	75.7
4) NCS parents are not willing to communicate with teachers	68	72.8

Table 27: Family background of non-Chinese speaking students (n=1214)

### 5.4.2.3 Student personal factors affecting learning

Almost 90% of Chinese Language subject teachers (89.8%) and non-Chinese Language subject teachers (86.8%) claimed that non-Chinese speaking students who have never received local kindergarten education faced the greatest difficulty in adapting to mainstream curriculum. (See Table 28)

	Agree (%)	
	Chinese Language subject teacher (n=609)	Non-Chinese Language subject teacher (n=599)
1) Many NCS students have not received local kindergarten education	62.8	62.8
2) NCS students who have never received local kindergarten education encounter the greatest difficulty to adapt to mainstream curriculum	89.8	86.8
3) NCS students are often absent which affects teaching progress	64.9	60.3
4) NCS students often overdue for their homework	70.8	67.6

Table 28: Student personal factors affecting learning (n= 1208)

### 5.4.2.4 Progression issues

More than 80% of the teachers believed that the progression choice for NCS students is limited. (See Table 29)

	Agree (%)	
	Chinese Language subject teacher (n=605)	Non-Chinese Language subject teacher (n=606)
1) Internal Examinations restrict the future academic development of NCS students	87.3	80.4
2) NCS speaking students have limited choice of secondary school progression	88.8	83.8
3) According to the current mechanism, the scores for language subjects and mathematics will be multiplied by 9 times. Thus, Chinese language ability will have a great impact on the allocation. For most NCS students, both Chinese and English are their second language. As a result, the current Internal Examinations mechanism is unfair to non-Chinese speaking students compared to Chinese speaking	81.5	80.7

students who only require learning one second language (English).

Table 29: Progression issues (n=1211)

### 5.4.3 Difficulties of Chinese learning and assessment<sup>13</sup>

#### 5.4.3.1 Curriculum of Chinese Language subject

Most Chinese Language subject teachers (94.2- 100%) from all kinds of NCS students composition schools indicated that mainstream Chinese curriculum is too difficult for NCS students, especially the Chinese writing component’s assessment requirement. The Chinese Language subject teachers also agreed that the expected learning outcomes set by the “Second Language Learning Framework” are too optimistic and do not meet the learning progress of average non-Chinese speaking students. The “Second Language Learning Framework” is not matching with the actual teaching progress. More than 80% of Chinese Language subject teachers believed that the Second Language Learning Framework lacks supports, and it is not helping teachers to help NCS students integrating into the mainstream Chinese lessons. (See Table 30)

	Agree (%)			
	Extremely low NCS students composition schools (n=128)	low- NCS students composition schools (n=131)	medium- NCS students composition schools (n=31)	high- NCS students composition schools (n=309)
1. The expected learning outcomes set by the "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" are too ideal and do not generally meet the learning process of NCS	85.2	82.4	77.4	84.8

<sup>13</sup> Only Chinese Language subject teachers were asked to respond to this part.

students.

---

2. The "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" fails to match the actual teaching progress	88.3	81.4	90.3	83.5
3. The "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" does not help NCS students to keep up with the mainstream learning process	84.3	70.5	77.4	79.2
4. The lack of supporting facilities for the "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" makes it difficult to assist teachers to integrate NCS	87.4	80.6	93.5	87.3

---

students into mainstream Chinese Language subject lessons.				
5. The mainstream Chinese Language course is too difficult for NCS students.	96.1	93.1	96.8	96.4
6. Chinese writing in mainstream curriculum is too demanding for NCS students	96.1	94.6	96.8	96.8

Table 30: Curriculum of Chinese Language subject (n=599)

#### 5.4.3.2 Teaching materials

Most Chinese Language subject teachers reported a lack of teaching materials matching the mainstreaming courses as well as targeting Chinese as a second language. Thus, Chinese Language subject teachers, especially those in medium-NCS composition school, have no choice but rely on personal efforts to develop teaching materials, exercises and various assessment adjustments (see Table 31).

	Agree (%)			
	Extremely low NCS students composition schools (n=128)	low- NCS students composition schools (n=131)	medium- NCS students composition schools (n=31)	high- NCS students composition schools (n=303)
1. A lack of teaching Chinese as a second language resources that match the mainstream	98.4	93.1	90.3	96

curriculum				
2. It relies on personal efforts of Chinese Language subject teachers in developing textbooks, exercises, and various assessment accommodations.	89.8	87	100	92.1
3. Following previous question, Chinese Language subject teachers lack supports in developing textbooks, exercises, and various assessment accommodations	94.5	88.5	100	92.4

Table 31: Teaching materials aspect (n= 593)

#### 5.4.3.3 Lesson arrangements

A majority of Chinese Language subject teachers pointed out that despite the use of both integration and pull-out learning, it is still difficult for NCS students to reach the language proficiency level like the Chinese speaking students of the same grade before sitting the internal examinations (91.1-96.7%). In addition, Chinese Language subject teachers in extremely low-NCS students composition schools indicated that NCS students are usually distributed at all levels. Due to a lack of resources, most of these Chinese Language subject teachers agreed that it is difficult to arrange for pull-out or intensive learning support for each NCS student (73.4 %). (See Table 32)

	Agree (%)			
	Extremely low NCS students composition schools (n=128)	Low-NCS students composition schools (n=131)	Medium-NCS composition school2 (n=30)	High-NCS students composition schools (n=303)
1. NCS students are usually scattered at all grades	96.1	87.8	83.3	80.2

2. Following the previous question, schools have insufficient resources to arrange for the pull-out or intensive learning support for NCS students in each grade	87.5	56.2	60	64
3. Despite the application of the integration and pull-out learning, it is still difficult for NCS students to reach the language level similar to the Chinese speaking students of the same grade before taking the Internal Examinations (from Primary 1 to Primary 4).	92.1	90	96.7	91.1

Table 32: Lesson arrangements aspect (n= 592)



#### 5.4.3.4 Assessment arrangements

Regarding the assessment, more than 90% of the Chinese Language subject teachers indicated that NCS students are at a disadvantage if they are assessed by the same set of Chinese Language subject examination paper as the Chinese speaking students. (See Table 33)

	Agree (%)			
	Extremely low-NCS students composition schools (n=128)	low-NCS students composition schools (n=131)	medium-NCS composition school (%) (n=31)	high-NCS composition school (%) (n=303)
1) If NCS students and Chinese speaking students are given the same set of Chinese Language subject examination papers, NCS students are at a disadvantage.	92.2	93.1	100	93.1
2) Chinese language scores of NCS students and Chinese speakers should be handled separately.	81.1	80	100	85
3) NCS students should receive adjustments during the assessment (e.g. read aloud the paper)	82.5	90.8	93.5	87.2

Table 33: Assessment arrangements (n=593)

#### 5.4.3.5 Teaching staff arrangements

About 90% of Chinese Language subject teachers in all NCS students composition schools expressed that the replacement of teaching assistants will affect the stability of teaching and NCS students need to adapt to changing teaching style of different teachers. In addition, 97% of the Chinese Language subject teachers in the medium-NCS students composition schools expressed that the Chinese learning support for NCS students need to be provided by experienced teachers. It reflected a need to impose more rigid professional requirements on teachers to support NCS students (See Table 34).

	Agree (%)			
	Extremely low-NCS students composition schools (n=120)	low-NCS students composition schools (n=118)	medium-NCS students composition schools (n=27)	high-NCS students composition schools (n=289)
1) Teaching assistants have sufficient professional knowledge to judge the student's Chinese language proficiency	45.8	50	51.9	47.1
2) Teaching assistants have the capability to design appropriate and progressive courses	34.2	43.2	44.4	36.9
3) There remains a high turnover rate of teaching assistants	63.9	59.5	51.9	64.6
4) The replacement of teaching assistants will affect the stability of teaching	91.8	94.1	80	91.8
5) NCS students are required to constantly adapt to the teaching style of different teachers.	91.8	92.5	86.7	91.2
6) Teaching assistants generally lack teaching experience	77	71.9	62.1	80.2

7) Pull-out learning of Chinese for NCS students should be provided by teachers who are experienced in teaching NCS students.	82.9	88.4	96.7	88.9
8) Pull-out learning of Chinese for NCS students should be provided by highly qualified teachers.	70.7	78.3	86.7	77.9

Table 34: Teaching staff arrangements (n=554)

#### 5.4.3.6 Medium of instruction

Most of the teachers who need to teach Chinese in Mandarin, expressed that NCS students are harder to integrate into the Chinese Language subject lesson. What's more, teaching Chinese in Mandarin would increase difficulties for NCS students (See Table 35)

	Agree (%)			
	Extremely low-NCS students composition schools (n=89)	low-NCS students composition schools (n=55)	medium-NCS students composition schools (n=14)	high-NCS students composition schools (n=177)
1. It is very difficult to employ teaching assistants who are capable of teaching Chinese in Mandarin.	92.1	85.5	85.7	80.2
2. It is more difficult for NCS students to integrate into the Chinese Language subject lesson in mainstream curriculum.	91.1	92.9	100	91
3. It is very difficult for NCS students to learn Chinese in Mandarin.	90	87.5	93.8	90.3

Table 35: Medium of instruction (n=335)

## 5.4.4 Measures to support NCS students

### 5.4.4.1 Measures related to staffing arrangements in supporting NCS students

Concerning the staffing arrangements in supporting NCS students, 88.8% of the Chinese Language subject teachers agreed that NCS students should be taught by teachers with more teaching experience. However, most teachers (including non-Chinese Language subject teachers) indicated that the subsidy of the government is only enough to employ younger teachers or even teaching assistants (90.1%). Moreover, the subsidy from EDB is not enough to give a teacher who is dedicated to teaching non-Chinese speaking students a promotion opportunity (i.e., promotion to PSM). (See Table 36)

Views towards the measures related to staff arrangements in supporting NCS students	Agree (%)	
	Chinese Language subject teacher (n=596)	Non-Chinese Language subject teacher (n=601)
1. The subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is not enough to employ an Assistant Primary School Teacher (APSM) to teach NCS students.	87.2	90.1
2. The subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is not enough to give teachers, who are dedicated to teaching NCS students, getting promotion (i.e. to PSM)	90.9	89.6
3. The subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is not enough to employ teachers with more teaching experience to support NCS students.	87.6	89.2
4. NCS students should be taught by teachers with more teaching experience	88.8	82.2
5. Government subsidy are often only enough to employ younger teachers or just teaching assistants.	90.1	89.9
6. Teachers who specialize in teaching NCS students lack professional recognition	77.5	81.7

Table 36: Evaluation of supporting staffing arrangements for NCS students (n=1197)

#### 5.4.4.2 Measures related to professional support

More than 90% of Chinese and non-Chinese Language subject teachers expressed that the Education Bureau does not provide special support measures or guidelines for promoting cultural integration and communication with parents of NCS students. (See Table 37)

	Agree (%)	
	Chinese Language subject teacher (n=589)	Non-Chinese Language subject teacher (n=597)
1. School-based curriculum development services provided by the Education Bureau have little effect	85.4	85.1
2. Teachers can hardly enroll refresher courses since the timetable for these courses was not notified to them as early as possible.	74.2	77.9
3. Teaching materials developed by the government and universities fail to meet the teacher's demand to support NCS students.	81.9	83.5
4. University scholars do not quite understand the needs of primary school teachers to support NCS students.	82.9	87.7
5. Refresher courses held by the university are too theoretical and out of reality.	84.4	90.5
6. Refresher courses held by the university fail to meet the teacher's demand to support NCS students.	84	90.3
7. The Education Bureau provides no special support measures or guidelines for communication with NCS parents.	91.3	94.4
8. The Education Bureau provides no special support measures or guidelines on the cultural integration of NCS students.	90.1	92.5

Table 37: Views towards the measures on professional support (n=1186)

## 5.4.5 Suggestions on supporting NCS students

### 5.4.5.1 *Recommendations on resources*

More than 90% of the teachers in extremely low, low, medium, and high NCS-composition schools recommended that the Education Bureau should increase the support in terms of resources. Among them, more than 94% of all teachers interviewed (including Chinese and non-Chinese Language subject teachers in all NCS students composition schools) have suggested to add a teaching position in the school system (for example, NCS students support teachers (NCSST)), who is responsible for learning support (in small groups or split-group) and cultural inclusion. More than 95% Chinese Language subject teachers expressed that the Education Bureau should provide professional recognition to teachers who teach non-Chinese speaking students.

More than 90% of the teachers suggested that the Education Bureau should set up a coordinator position (for example, NCSCO) who is responsible for coordinating the learning support work, arranging the student support team, and promoting cultural integration in the schools. In addition, almost 90% of Chinese Language subject teachers in high-NCS students composition schools suggested that the subsidy of the Education Bureau should be distributed according to the number of NCS students proportionately (see Table 38).

	Agree (%)							
	Chinese Language subject teachers (n=606)				Non-Chinese Language subject teacher (n=600)			
	Extremel y low- NCS students composi tion schools (n=132)	low-NCS students composi tion schools (n=131)	medium- NCS students composi tion schools (n=30)	high-NCS students composi tion schools (n=313)	Extremel y low- NCS students composi tion schools (n=164)	low-NCS students composi tion schools (n=113)	medium- NCS students composi tion schools (n=29)	high-NCS students composi tion schools (n=294)
1. The Education Bureau should increase the amount of subsidy to allow the schools to employ Assistant Primary School Degree Teachers (APSM) to provide NCS students with pull-out learning teaching support.	93.9	94.7	86.7	92	94.5	94.7	93.1	91.8
2. The subsidy of the Education Bureau should be distributed according to the number of NCS students proportionately.	92.4	89.4	87.1	94.2	90.9	95.6	86.2	92.2
3. The Education Bureau should improve the flexibility of using the subsidy so that schools may apply it to promote cultural exchange activities and communication between NCS parents and schools.	93.9	91.7	87.1	96.5	93.3	95.6	96.6	95.6
4. The Education Bureau should add a coordinator position (e.g. NCSCO) who is responsible for co-ordinating the support work of NCS students, organizing student	92.4	94.7	93.5	93.3	91.5	96.5	100	95.6

learning support group and promoting cultural inclusion in schools.									
5. The Education Bureau should add a teacher position (Non-Chinese Speaking Students Support Teacher (NCSST)), who is responsible for supporting students' learning activities (for example: group teaching or split-group teaching) and cultural inclusion.	93.9	96.2	96.8	94.6	94.5	96.5	96.6	95.9	
6. The Education Bureau should provide professional recognition to teachers who teach NCS students.	95.5	97	96.8	96.5	95.7	96.5	100	95.2	
7. The Education Bureau should require NCS support teachers to ensure the use of subsidy to be relevant to the learning and needs of the NCS students.	94.7	96.2	96.8	96.2	95.7	97.3	100	95.6	

Table 38: Suggestions related to resources (n=1206)



#### ***5.4.5.2 Suggestions related to professional support and development***

Considering the lack of teaching materials, most of the teachers suggested that the Education Bureau should provide teaching materials matching with the “Second Language Learning Framework”. More than 95% of teachers indicated that the Education Bureau should support NCS students in non-Chinese Language subjects (such as Mathematics and General Studies). Teachers, especially those from the low-NCS students composition schools, suggested that it is necessary to have special measures for school-parents communication and cultural integration. It is because NCS students, who are underrepresented in these schools, can be easily neglected (See Table 39).

		Agree (%)							
		Chinese Language subject teachers (n= 604)				Non-Chinese Language subject teachers (n= 594)			
		Extremely low-NCS students composition schools (n=132)	low-NCS students composition schools (n=129)	medium-NCS students composition schools (n=30)	high-NCS students composition schools (n=313)	Extremely low-NCS students composition schools (n=163)	low-NCS composition school (%) (n=110)	medium-NCS composition school (%) (n=29)	high-NCS composition school (%) (n=292)
1.	The Government should re-implement the policy of "designated schools"	90.2	84.5	90	89.5	92	90	100	90.4
2.	The Education Bureau needs to provide teaching materials for the "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework".	98.5	93.2	96.8	98.4	96.4	97.3	100	98
3.	The Education Bureau should support NCS students' learning	98.5	95.5	100	98.4	97	98.2	100	98.3

in other subjects (such as Mathematics and General Studies).									
4. The Education Bureau should set up a platform for schools to share teaching resources designed for NCS students.	96.2	95.5	100	98.4	95.2	97.3	100	95.2	
5. The Education Bureau should promote more sustainable and closer cooperation between schools and university experts.	93.9	93.2	87.1	96.2	86.1	93.8	93.1	93.5	
6. The Education Bureau should organize NCS teaching support teams and send staff for supporting schools that admit NCS students.	90.9	89.4	93.5	92.3	90.9	93.8	93.1	93.2	

7. The Education Bureau can group NCS students of low NCS composition primary schools, located in the same district, and provide them with group learning support, based on their Chinese language proficiency (for example: after-school, Saturday enrichment courses or support)	91.7	88.6	80.6	90.7	92.1	89.4	86.2	87.4
8. As for teacher training, prospective teachers should be specialized their training of teaching Chinese as a second language	95.4	91.7	90.3	94.2	92.7	92.9	100	92.9
9. The government should encourage	90.9	93.9	90.3	94.9	88.5	93.9	89.7	93.2

teachers, who teach NCS students, to get the related training by providing some incentives.									
10. The Education Bureau should have special measures on the school-parent communication and cultural integration for NCS parents.	97	96.2	90.3	97.8	95.2	97.4	100	96.6	
11. The Education Bureau should set up professional training development for teachers who teach NCS students, so that schools can systematically train specialist teachers (e.g. it can be done by providing basic,	95.5	95.5	90.3	97.1	91.5	95.6	100	95.9	

advanced and special courses)									
12. The Education Bureau should require a certain number of teachers in each school to receive relevant training in teaching NCS students.	84.1	90.9	83.9	89.1	77.6	87.6	89.7	88.8	
13. The Education Bureau should plan the whole school approach in supporting NCS students' learning and related policies.	90.2	90.1	87.1	90.7	80.6	89	92.9	93.2	

Table 39: Advice for professional support and development (n=1198)

### 5.4.5.3 Preference of the suggestions

Teachers were asked to rank the above suggestions based on the importance, urgency and effectiveness. Most teachers put “The Education Bureau should increase the amount of subsidy to enable schools to employ Assistant Primary School Degree Teachers (APSM) to provide NCS students with pull-out teaching support.” as the highest preference. The second highest preference is “The Education Bureau should set up a dedicated coordinator (e.g. NCSCO) to co-ordinate the support work of NCS students which include organizing student support groups and promoting cultural integration education in schools.”

#### 5.4.5.3.1 Five most important suggestions as perceived by the teachers

Table 38 suggestion 1) The Education Bureau should increase the amount of subsidy to allow the schools to employ Assistant Primary School Degree Teachers (APSM) to provide NCS students with pull-out learning teaching support.	42.8%
Table 38 suggestion 4) The Education Bureau should add a coordinator position (e.g. NCSCO) who is responsible for co-ordinating the support work of NCS students, organizing student learning support group and promoting cultural inclusion in schools.	42.8%
Table 38 suggestion 5) The Education Bureau should add a teacher position (Non-Chinese Speaking Students Support Teacher (NCSST)), who is responsible for supporting students’ learning activities (for example: group teaching or split-group teaching) and supporting the cultural inclusion.	40.5%
Table 39 suggestion 3) The Education Bureau should support the NCS students’ learning in other subjects (such as mathematics and general studies).	36%
Table 39 suggestion 2) The Education Bureau needs to provide teaching materials for the Second Language Learning Framework.	35.1%

#### 5.4.5.3.2 Five most urgent suggestions as perceived by the teachers

Table 38 suggestion 4) The Education Bureau should add a coordinator position (e.g. NCSCO) who is responsible for co-ordinating the support work of NCS students, organizing student learning support group and promoting cultural inclusion in schools.	39.9%
Table 38 suggestion 5) The Education Bureau should add a teacher position (Non-Chinese Speaking Students Support Teacher (NCSST)), who is responsible for supporting students’ learning activities (for example: group teaching or split-group teaching) and supporting the cultural inclusion.	39.6%
Table 38 suggestion 1) The Education Bureau should increase the amount of subsidy to allow the schools to employ Assistant Primary School Degree Teachers (APSM) to provide NCS students with pull-out learning teaching support.	39.8%

Table 39 suggestion 3) The Education Bureau should support the NCS students' learning in other subjects (such as mathematics and general studies).	38.3%
--	-------

---

Table 39 suggestion 2) The Education Bureau needs to provide teaching materials for the Second Language Learning Framework.	37.3%
---	-------

---

**5.4.5.3.3 Five most effective suggestions as perceived by the principals**

Table 38 suggestion 1) The Education Bureau should increase the amount of subsidy to allow the schools to employ Assistant Primary School Degree Teachers (APSM) to provide NCS students with pull-out learning teaching support.	38.8%
---	-------

---

Table 38 suggestion 4) The Education Bureau should add a coordinator position (e.g. NCSCO) who is responsible for coordinating the support work of NCS students, organizing student learning support group and promoting cultural inclusion in schools.	38.3%
---	-------

---

Table 38 suggestion 5) The Education Bureau should add a teacher position (Non-Chinese Speaking Students Support Teacher (NCSST)), who is responsible for supporting students' learning activities (for example: group teaching or split-group teaching) and supporting the cultural inclusion.	37.4%
---	-------

---

Table 39 suggestion 3) The Education Bureau should support the NCS students' learning in other subjects (such as mathematics and general studies).	36.2%
--	-------

---

Table 39 suggestion 2) The Education Bureau needs to provide teaching materials for the Second Language Learning Framework.	33.9%
---	-------

---



#### **5.4.6 Key factors affecting the effectiveness of teaching NCS students**

Chinese Language subject teachers suggested that there is a need for the Education Bureau to add a teaching post to support NCS students. The voice is especially stronger from the medium and high NCS students composition schools, with more than 98% of teachers agreeing to add a teaching post. In addition, a majority of non-Chinese Language subject teachers expressed that the teaching materials and parents' involvement have had great effects on NCS students teaching. Moreover, most of the teachers agreed that teachers' training, enthusiasm and teaching skills are important to affect the effectiveness in teaching NCS students. (See Table 40)

	Agree (%)							
	Chinese Language subject teachers (n=607)				Non-Chinese Language subject teachers (n=599)			
	Extremel y low- NCS students composit ion schools (n=130)	low-NCS students composit ion schools (n=133)	medium- NCS students composit ion schools (n=31)	high-NCS students composit ion schools (n=313)	Extremel y low- NCS students composit ion schools (n=163)	low-NCS composit ion school (%) (n=113)	medium- NCS composit ion school (%) (n=29)	high-NCS students composit ion schools (n=294)
1. Subsidy from the Education Bureau	95.4	97	93.5	95.8	96.3	96.5	89.7	98
2. School-based support services of the Education Bureau	96.9	94.7	93.5	95.5	94.4	98.2	96.6	97.6
3. A platform to allow schools to share teaching resources with each other introduced by the Education Bureau	94.7	94.7	93.5	93	92.6	96.5	93.1	91.8
4. NCS students supporting courses organized by the Education Bureau	97.7	95.5	96.8	94.9	92.6	99.1	93.1	96.2
5. A teaching position in the school system who is responsible for supporting NCS students introduced by the Education Bureau	97.7	96.2	100	98.4	96.2	99.1	96.6	98
6. NCS students supporting courses introduced by university	95.4	93.9	86.7	92	86.5	93.9	93.1	92.2
7. Teaching materials	98.5	97.7	100	97.8	97.5	99.1	100	96.6
8. School-based support provided by university	95.4	97	93.5	94.5	88.9	93.9	96.6	89.1

9. NCS parents' understanding of Hong Kong's education system	95.4	94	87.1	96.2	93.9	93.9	96.6	94.6
10. Educational expectations of NCS parents	93.9	97	93.3	98.1	96.9	95.6	100	97.3
11. Cooperation of NCS parents	96.9	97	93.5	99	100	98.2	100	99.3
12. Recruitment of experienced graduate teachers (GM) to support NCS students by schools	96.9	95.5	100	97.4	98.1	94.7	96.6	96.6
13. Teacher's understanding of NCS students	94.7	96.2	93.5	98.7	96.9	98.2	100	98
14. Teacher's attitude towards cultural differences	91.6	92.4	90.3	98.1	91.4	96.5	100	97.3
15. Teacher training to teach NCS students	96.2	97	96.8	98.7	96.9	100	96.6	97.6
16. Teacher's enthusiasm for teaching NCS students	96.2	97.7	100	98.4	95.1	99.1	100	98
17. Teacher's teaching skills	96.9	99.2	100	98.7	96.3	99.1	100	97.6
18. Teacher's teaching experience	93.8	97	96.8	94.9	93.9	97.4	100	95.2
19. Teacher's insight for self-teaching effectiveness	94.7	98.5	100	97.4	93.8	99.1	100	97.6
20. NCS students' cultural understanding of Hong Kong	93.9	91	87.1	92	91.4	92.9	93.1	94.9
21. Learning motivation of non-Chinese speaking students	98.5	97.7	100	99	100	99.1	96.6	98.3
22. Volunteer organization support for learning and inclusion of NCS students (e.g. tutorial, cultural exchange activities)	96.1	92.4	93.3	95.2	95.7	97.4	100	97.3

Table 40: Key factors affecting the effectiveness of teaching NCS students (n=1206)

#### *5.4.6.1 Key factors that affect the most on the effectiveness of supporting NCS students as perceived by teachers*

Teachers were asked to choose five key factors, from the above list, that have the most influential effect on the support effectiveness. Most teachers believed that the learning motivation and parents' cooperation are the most influential factors.

21) Learning motivation of non-Chinese speaking students	48.7%
11) Cooperation of NCS parents	47.9%
1) Subsidy from the Education Bureau	46%
5) A teaching position in the school system who is responsible for supporting NCS students introduced by the Education Bureau	39.1%
7) Teaching materials	38.6%

## 5.4.7 Teachers' views towards different ethnicities

### 5.4.7.1 Recruitment matters

Compared with other subjects, the interviewed Chinese Language subject teachers are hesitated about employing NCS job applicants who meet the job requirements to be Chinese Language subject teacher in spite of their competence to teach. (See Table 41)

	Agree (%)			
	Extremely low-NCS students composition schools (n=300)	Low-NCS students composition schools (n=245)	Medium-NCS students composition schools (n=60)	High-NCS students composition schools (n=607)
1) Willing to employ an NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as a Chinese Language subject teacher	85.7	84.9	90	82.9
2) Willing to employ an NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as an English Language teacher	96.7	96.3	100	97.2
3) Willing to employ an NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as a Mathematics teacher	96.3	95.1	98.3	95.6
4) Willing to employ an NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as a General Studies teacher	92.7	91	96.7	93.8
5) Willing to employ an NCS applicant who meets the	98	96.3	98.3	98.5

requirements of  
the position as a  
teaching assistant

Table 41: Recruitment matters (n=1212)

#### 5.4.7.2 Students' matters

Clearly, teachers expressed their support for NCS students to participate in inter-school competitions (such as reading, singing and drama contests). Comparing with teachers in medium and high NCS students composition schools, those in low-NCS students composition schools are less willing to accept NCS students to be admitted into primary 1 (See Table 42).

	Agree (%)			
	Extremely low-NCS students composition schools (n=299)	low-NCS students composition schools (n= 245)	medium-NCS students composition schools (n=60)	high-NCS students composition schools (n=610)
1) Willing to accept NCS students who meet the requirements for Primary 1 admission	90.6	92.7	95	93.3
2) Encourage NCS students to participate in extracurricular activities and allocate more resources to employ tutors who can teach in English / to provide extracurricular activities in English	96	96.3	98.3	97.4
3) Willing to let NCS schools participate in inter-school competitions (e.g. reading, singing, drama)	97	98	100	98

4) Willing to let Chinese speaking students know the cultural characteristics of other ethnic students in school	91	89.8	93.2	95.6
--	----	------	------	------

Table 42: Students' matters (n=1214)

#### 5.4.7.3 Parent-school communication matters

Fewer teachers, coming from the extremely low NCS student composition schools, accept NCS parents to join the parent-teacher association. (See Table 43)

	Agree (%)			
	Extremely low-NCS students composition schools (n=300)	low-NCS students composition schools (n= 245)	medium-NCS students composition schools (n=59)	high-NCS students composition schools (n=611)
1) Willing to provide English translation of school notices to facilitate the communication with NCS parents	85.7	91.4	100	91.8
2) Willing to arrange English teachers as class teacher for NCS students	87.3	82.9	84.7	84.1
3) Willing to allow NCS parents join the Parent Teacher Association	88.3	93	100	93.6

Table 43: Parent-school communication matters (n=1215)

#### 5.4.7.4 Understanding of different ethnicities

Fewer teachers, coming from the low-NCS student composition schools recognized the culture and traditions of each ethnic group. Even for teachers from high NCS student composition schools, only about 70% of the interviewed teachers have the knowledge of different culture and traditions of ethnic groups. (See Table 44)

	Agree (%)			
	Extremely low-NCS students composition schools (n=299)	low-NCS students composition schools (n= 245)	medium-NCS students composition schools (n=60)	high-NCS students composition schools (n=611)
1) You recognize the culture of each ethnic group	58.5	66.9	73.3	70.5
2) You recognize the traditions of various ethnicities	54.7	65.3	64.4	66.9
3) You have heard of the Racial Discrimination Ordinance	91.7	95.1	95	96.9
4) You understand the contents of the Racial Discrimination Ordinance	76.7	80.4	80	85.6
5) To consider the "Racial Discrimination Ordinance" when formulating school affairs	78.3	80.3	76.7	83.8

Table 44: Understanding of different ethnicities (n=1215)



## 5.5 Summary of questionnaire survey

The research team has conducted a questionnaire survey in all primary schools admitting NCS students to examine the challenges encountered by school principals and teachers in personnel arrangement, Chinese Language subject teaching and assessment, teaching in other subjects, the overall learning situation of NCS students, the support measures, suggestions and factors that affect the effectiveness of supports.

We have summarized the key findings in the following:

1. Schools experienced a great difficulty in employing experienced teachers or teaching assistants, who are well equipped to teach NCS students. It reflected that teacher training of teaching Chinese as a second language is insufficient. We further found that the extremely low-NCS student composition schools have encountered the greatest challenge in staffing comparing to others, because the lowest amount of subsidy received and more instability of the subsidy have limited these schools to attract or employ better job candidates. Likewise, over 96% of teachers agreed that teachers' teaching skills have the greatest influence on the support of NCS students. However, less than 40% of Chinese Language subject teachers are confident to teach the NCS students to catch up with the Chinese speaking students. It further demonstrated the inadequacy of professional teaching training.
2. Although the EDB has provided subsidy to schools in employing teaching assistants, only 37.1% of principals agreed that teaching assistants have enough knowledge in evaluating students' Chinese language proficiency and only 27.6% of them agreed that teaching assistants are competent to design appropriate lessons that help students to progress. Similarly, only 40% of Chinese Language subject teachers agreed that teaching assistants have enough knowledge to evaluate the students' Chinese language proficiency. Likewise, only 30% of them agreed that teaching assistants can design appropriate lessons. This situation is indeed worrisome as it has shown that teaching assistants are lack of Chinese language knowledge and the teaching ability to design lessons for NCS students.
3. Nearly 80% of interviewed Chinese Language subject teachers agreed that the "Second Language Learning Framework" is lacked teaching resources that match with the learning framework, which has resulted in difficulty in assisting NCS students to integrate into the mainstream Chinese lessons. About 90% of Chinese Language subject teachers indicated a lack of Chinese teaching materials, exercises, and assessment tools. Teachers need to develop their own teaching materials, that can match with the learning framework, independently in every year. However, the consistency of these teaching materials is questionable. It is also difficult to evaluate and predict the effectiveness of these teaching materials.
4. Although about half (54%) of non-Chinese Language subject teachers expressed that they are confident to teach NCS students to have similar level as the Chinese speaking students, who are obviously more optimistic than the Chinese Language subject teachers (37.8%), there are still an approximately 61.7% of non-Chinese Language subject teachers expressed that it is stressed to cater for the learning needs of both NCS and Chinese-speaking students at the same time. Some non-

Chinese Language subject teachers, in the interviews, explained that the General Studies and Mathematics subjects are also taught in Chinese language, which also poses a problem to the NCS students in reading and comprehension.

5. Despite the difficulties in supporting the learning of NCS students as well as in finding extra time for preparing teaching materials, attending training and after-school consolidation, it is encouraging that nearly 80% of Chinese and non-Chinese Language subject teachers expressed that they are willing to teach NCS students and determined to let NCS students catch up with the progress of mainstream curriculum. We hope the suggestions made by the school principals and teachers (Chapter 7) can be realized.
6. Most teachers believed that learning motivation of students and parents' cooperation are both influential to the support. However, views of ethnic minority groups are different from Chinese culture and their value to education is relatively lower than the Chinese parents. They tend to support their children to learn by interests and carry out a different parenting style. It has added more difficulties to the teachers.
7. We found that many principals and teachers have some knowledge about the culture and traditions of different ethnic minority groups.

## 6. Case Studies: Pre-conditions for effective learning support to non-Chinese speaking students

According to the mainstream primary school cases we interviewed, we tried to find out the successful strategies from four aspects (social integration, learning and teaching practices, teaching resources, and home-school communication), that allow equal learning opportunities among the non-Chinese speaking students. Furthermore, we summarized the suggestions for supporting non-Chinese speaking students based on these pre-conditions (Chapter 7).

### 6.1 Social Integration

#### 6.1.1 Promoting Peer Support

In order to help non-Chinese speaking students, there are schools arranging senior Chinese speaking students to assist their non-Chinese speaking counterparts to make revision on Chinese vocabularies. On the one hand, it helps increasing the chances for students to learn. On the other hand, it helps building a caring culture.

*"We develop peer support among students. For example, we have a special Chinese learning team to train senior students to study Chinese at the recess period or in their spare time, and to review some Chinese vocabularies." -- Principal C*

#### 6.1.2 Early Childhood Education

Although the principals and teachers being interviewed reported that they have encountered many challenges in supporting non-Chinese speaking students, many interviewees said that in fact, the major problem for non-Chinese speaking students is learning Chinese. In terms of social integration, NCS students can fully adapt to the campus life as the Chinese speaking students do. Many interviewees explained that this is because most non-Chinese speaking students have been educated locally since kindergartens, thus are easier to adapt to the learning environment in primary schools, which are dominated by ethnic Chinese. In addition, many Chinese speaking students may even have non-Chinese speaking classmates during their study in kindergartens. Therefore, they are also willing to make friends with non-Chinese speaking students after transition to primary school. The principal of an EMI primary school said that Chinese speaking students are happy to communicate with non-Chinese speaking students. Sometimes Chinese speaking students talk to non-Chinese speaking students in English.

It showed that since NCS students are educated with Chinese-speaking students in local kindergartens since young age, it significantly helps non-Chinese speaking students to integrate into the Chinese-speaking students dominated environment. Therefore, for some non-Chinese speaking students, who have just arrived at Hong Kong, the Education Bureau should provide at least a summer bridging program, so that the new arrival non-Chinese speaking students can adapt to the new learning environment as early as possible.

### 6.1.3 Transition from Kindergarten to Primary One

In order to help non-Chinese speaking students to adapt to the new learning environment as early as possible, some primary schools arrange activities for prospective students before the commencement of school year on a regular basis.

*"We have about 16 kindergarten activities every year. Those activities are held on Saturdays. We expect those joining the activities are going to enroll in our school. Most of them joined the activities since they were studying K2." -- Principal H*

## **6.2 Learning and Teaching**

From the literature on curriculum development, scholars have proposed the concept of pedagogical leadership. Through collaboration, educators can make schools a caring community that cares for each other and develops social capital. Through curriculum evaluation and reflection, school becomes a teaching-oriented focus community to develop academic capital. Through the advocacy of the curriculum professional culture, school becomes a community of practice, thus producing professional capital. Therefore, an ideal teaching environment should focus on cooperation, constructiveness, vision, and critical reflection.

*"As a professional educator, we should be able to make appropriate adjustments in learning and teaching in response to the needs of students. This can take care of learning differences or learning diversity." -- Principal I*

Based on the case studies, we find the following practices that help create an ideal teaching environment.

### 6.2.1 Collaborative Teaching

We have found that collaboration between teachers can be very helpful for practical support, for example, team teaching. Collaborative teaching, also known as team teaching or cooperative teaching, means that two or more teachers organize in a cooperative manner, jointly design teaching arrangements, determine teaching objectives and methods, and prepare individual teaching plan. It further completes the implementation of teaching activities, the assessment of teaching effectiveness or the assessment of student learning.

The advantages of collaborative teaching are to promote professional sharing among teachers and to reflect on teaching methods, which helps teachers to evaluate teaching design from different angles and improve teaching efficiency.

*"Teachers have worked together to produce a lot of teaching resources with lots of pictures to help students memorize the key point." -- Principal C*

### 6.2.2 Teaching instruction

Cooperative teaching can sometimes be a collaboration of communities of practice between experts and teachers. Experts participate in the teaching process, from design, practice, evaluation, reflection and optimization, to develop and experiment with effective teaching strategies and to make successful teaching practices.

*"For Primary 1 and 2, we use the Picture Book Adaptation Course (a team of the University of Hong Kong assisted in the development of a picture book course). For Primary 3 and 4, we are supported by the school-based professional support team of the Education Bureau. They come to our school regularly to hold a meeting to optimize the curriculum of the Primary 3 and 4." -- Principal E*

### **6.2.3 Professional Training for Teachers**

Regardless of teaching Chinese or non-Chinese Language subjects, most of the respondents indicated that there are very few related topics and trainings on teaching non-Chinese speaking students. Most of them are based on their personal experiences to explore ways to teach non-Chinese speaking students. For teaching non-Chinese speaking students, whether it is teaching skills, communication with students, etc., teachers need to acquire new skills to prepare for teaching. This shows that training for teachers is of great help to teachers supporting non-Chinese speaking students. Therefore, we believe that the development of professional training for teachers cannot be ignored.

### **6.3 Teaching Resources: Complete Teaching Materials**

Effective learning and teaching involve appropriate curriculum and teaching resources. Teachers need to reorganize curriculum, design teaching materials, and adapt assessment tools. It is hardly possible to do it alone. We believe that an essential condition for supporting non-Chinese speaking students must include a complete set of teaching materials.

*"I feel that there is a lack of support. The Chinese Language Panel Teacher needs to develop a first language course, a second language course and trains new teachers to teach non-Chinese speaking students. The duty of the Chinese Language Panel Teacher for a school year is teaching and preparing teaching material for different students. Can you imagine how busy the Chinese language Panel Teacher is? How is it possible to handle all these works? The work done wouldn't be a quality one, because there is no room to think." -- Chinese teacher B of School H*

*"The Education Bureau allows schools to develop course materials freely. It also requires schools to ensure non-Chinese speaking students to be able to pass the internal assessment. In fact, this requires a company to do it." -- Chinese Teacher A of School H.*

The nine primary schools visited in this study have adopted the "pull-out" or "immersion" model, depending on the number of non-Chinese speaking students and the additional resources the schools receive from the Education Bureau. This study observed that one of the primary schools used the "dynamic enrichment learning mode" (DELHI &

Chan, 2018) combined with "extraction" and "immersion" to fill the gaps in the insufficient support for non-Chinese speaking families.

The outcome is found to be the best. The "Dynamic Enrichment Learning Mode" is designed by dedicated teachers to prepare students for classes, individually or in a group, before the class ("Extraction Mode"). Students then study with other Chinese speaking students in the "big class" ("Immersive Mode"). After class, the dedicated teacher reviews and teaches the contents of the next lesson in individual or small groups. Since 2015, the research team has supported non-Chinese speaking students in kindergartens to learn Chinese in a "dynamic enrichment learning mode". The learning results are ideal. Non-Chinese speaking students have significant growth in Chinese language proficiency. Some students can catch up with Chinese speaking students. We believe that the "dynamic enrichment learning mode" can be applied to non-Chinese speaking students in primary schools.

#### 6.4 Home-School Cooperation

Mutual trust and communication between schools and parents are equally important. Schools should establish a good communication mode, such as translation of notices, translation of content of student handbooks, etc., so that non-Chinese speaking parents can participate in their children's learning. Schools should also encourage non-Chinese speaking parents to participate in school activities, join parent-teacher associations, etc. so that they can have a better understanding of school's arrangements and policies of teaching, and raise their trust to schools.

*"We invited a team of 'Reading Mom' to help children in the community. They read English books for Chinese students and Chinese books for non-Chinese speaking students every Monday, hoping to increase their interest in reading." -- Principal C*

A teacher shared a successful case: *"I have taught a non-Chinese speaking student who has entered BAND 1 secondary school and followed the progress over the years. That student can enter BAND 1 secondary School because he and his parents are having a very clear target to achieve which is to live in Hong Kong, so they put learning Chinese in a top priority. In fact, if parents have that kind of thinking, students could have the possibility to learn well."*

#### 6.5 Policies

Despite the multi-faceted cooperation between teachers, school principals and parents, the lack of policy support would make the support less effective. Therefore, the Education Bureau needs to tackle the problems of the existing score submission mechanism, the arrangement of the curriculum, the lack of resources for second language, teacher training and professional recognition. In response to various problems, we will make further detailed recommendations on resources and professional support and development in Chapter 7.

## 7. Recommendations

Based on findings from interviews and survey, we found that there is a lack of second-language teaching materials for non-Chinese speaking students, no qualification requirement on second-language teaching support teachers, and a lack of support for non-Chinese teaching. Therefore, the research team believes that the Education Bureau should set up a teaching post in the school system and require support teachers to have obtained professional training in Chinese as a second language teaching. In addition, the principals and teachers interviewed pointed out that learning motivation of non-Chinese speaking students and cooperation of non-Chinese speaking parents are key factors to the effectiveness of support measures. The research team proposes to further strengthen the integration of ethnic minorities into the mainstream society and education system.

### 7.1 Social and Cultural Integration

**7.1.1 Encourage non-Chinese speaking parents to let their children study in kindergartens, strengthen their awareness of the importance of early childhood education and avoid long-term absenteeism as it affects their children's learning progress:** The literature suggested that early childhood education can contribute significantly to language development (Whorrall & Cabell, 2016). If we grasp the golden age of language learning, we can promote the development of Chinese listening and language skills of non-Chinese speaking students, which helps the students to participate in lessons, express their ideas effectively, promote communication with others and integrate into the school environment and the Hong Kong society.

**7.1.2 Support for home-school cooperation provided by NGOs:** The results of this study reflected that principals and teachers of mainstream schools often have insufficient knowledge of the cultural practices of ethnic minorities, and encounter various challenges in teaching non-Chinese speaking students, which undoubtedly adds burden to schools. The research team recommends that non-governmental organizations and other relevant stakeholders can serve as a bridge between schools and non-Chinese speaking parents in non-teaching arrangements.

Non-governmental organizations can help principals and teachers in mainstream schools to understand the culture and religion of ethnic minorities, strengthen the cultural sensitivity of frontline educators, and provide other non-teaching support, such as providing general translation services for schools. In addition to using the subsidy provided by the Standing Committee on Language Education and Research (SCOLAR) to promote Chinese language activities to improve the interest of non-Chinese speaking students in learning Chinese, NGOs can hold different activities and even home visits for non-Chinese speaking parents (especially their mothers) to help them to have a better understanding of lives in mainstream primary schools and the academic requirements and expectations of mainstream education for all students (including Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students).

These activities and services provided by NGOs do not only promote communication and understanding between mainstream schools and non-Chinese speaking families, but also alleviate the teaching pressure faced by frontline educators in teaching non-Chinese speaking students. Nowadays, most of the teachers in mainstream schools do not receive adequate and formal training in teaching non-Chinese speaking students.

**7.1.3 Ethnic minority organizations assist non-Chinese speaking students and their families to integrate into the mainstream society:** At the same time, in response to the tradition of ethnic minorities prioritizing religion and ethnic cohesion, in order to help non-Chinese speaking and ethnic minorities to integrate into the mainstream society and treat Hong Kong as their home, ethnic minority organizations and their leaders can provide greater support for young non-Chinese speaking families who are new to Hong Kong. For parents and children in these families, the research team suggests that these supports should not be limited to maintain the unity of their ethnic groups, but also to help them understand the mainstream culture, education system and job market of the Hong Kong society. For example, when conducting religious and related activities, ethnic minorities who have lived in Hong Kong for many years can be invited to share their experience of learning Chinese and admission to post-secondary courses in Hong Kong, as well as job-seeking and experiences of working with ethnic Chinese. These exchanges and sharing allow non-Chinese speaking students and their parents to understand the requirements and expectations of the mainstream society for students and employees. It is believed that the related activities and lectures arranged and organized by ethnic minority organizations and their leaders are more attractive and persuasive to non-Chinese speaking students.

**7.1.4 Strengthen Summer Bridging Programme for schools admitting less than 10 NCS students:** The Programme for NCS Primary 1 entrants, which was introduced in 2004, has been extended to cover NCS students progressing to Primary 2, Primary 3 and Primary 4 since 2007. The aim is to facilitate NCS primary students' adaptation to classroom setting with the use of Chinese. Participating schools (except special schools) should offer the Programme to at least 10 NCS students of their schools / and from other schools in summer holidays free of charge. According to the figures provided by Legislative Council, there were 332 primary schools admitting NCS students in 2018/19, and 205 of them admitting less than 10 NCS students (62% of total). The latter schools are not eligible to apply for the Programme though their NCS students are also with a great need in learning Chinese. According to the Education Bureau (EDB), assistance, where necessary, would be rendered to participating schools in case they wish to let their NCS students and parents join the Programme run by other schools. However, this arrangement is unsatisfactory as many parents of NCS students are not aware of this Programme. Moreover, because of the pick-up issue, parents are not willing to participate if the school is far from their home. In fact, the bridging programme held in other schools may not help NCS students to early adapt the learning content of the school which they will study in the future.

The research recommends the government to extend the Programme covering schools with less than 10 NCS students so as to facilitate NCS students to better adapt to



the new learning environment and strengthen their Chinese language foundation. After all, in most of the current mainstream primary schools, except for the English lesson, other subjects use Chinese as the main language for teaching and learning. Meanwhile, we recommend government to strengthen its promotion in kindergartens so as to inform NCS parents of the helping resources earlier.

In addition, by considering the support measures of the "Second Language Teaching Policy" in other places (see Chapter 2 of this report), the research team proposes to assess the language proficiency (including Chinese and English) for new arrivals of non-Chinese speaking students. Teachers can understand the actual situation of non-Chinese speaking students and provide Chinese learning support based on their assessment results.

A further approach is to provide non-Chinese speaking students who do not achieve a certain level of Chinese proficiency with enhancement program before the commencement of the school term and/or after school. For better effectiveness, these intensive courses should be coordinated by the Education Bureau, and the dedicated teachers should be responsible for the teaching and regular assessment and the follow-up of these transfer students.

## 7.2 Teaching Resources

**7.2.1 To increase the amount of subsidy so that schools can employ qualified primary school teachers for teaching support:** Non-Chinese speaking students should be taught by more experienced teachers. The amount of the current subsidy is only sufficient for schools to employ teachers with limited teaching experiences and even teaching assistants to complete this arduous task which the support quality cannot be guaranteed. In addition, teaching assistants lack stability and receive a low salary. It is impossible to attract employees with high quality and professional training, which directly affect the quality of teaching. In view of this, the Education Bureau should increase the amount of subsidy so that schools can employ Assistant Primary School Master/Mistress (APSM) to provide high-quality enrichment teaching support for non-Chinese speaking students.

**7.2.2 The additional recurrent funding should be paid in proportion to the number of non-Chinese speaking students:** At present, the Education Bureau's provision for subsidy requires schools to admit at least 10 non-Chinese speaking students. The amount of subsidy is between HK\$800,000 and HK\$1.5 million. Low-concentration schools are worried that if they are unable to recruit enough students in the future, they will lose their financial support and will not be able to continue to provide learning support to the existing non-Chinese speaking students. High-concentration schools reported that they need to employ additional teachers to take care of a large number of non-Chinese speaking students. The current subsidy is obviously insufficient. Therefore, it is recommended that the subsidy from the Education Bureau should be paid in proportion to the number of non-Chinese speaking students.

The research team welcomes the government's initiative to "provide all schools

admitting a relatively small number of NCS students (i.e. ordinary schools admitting less than ten NCS students and special schools admitting less than six NCS students) with a new two-tiered subsidy with additional funding” mentioned in 2019 Policy Address. Hopefully, this fund could effectively support the Chinese learning of NCS students in low-concentration schools. Specifically, the research team recommends that a subsidy amounted to a minimum of HK\$500,000 should be paid to schools that have less than 10 non-Chinese speaking students. It is worth noting that, whether a mainstream school has admitted 1 or 10 non-Chinese speaking students, it has to provide additional support for non-Chinese speaking students in teaching, cultural integration, and home-school communication. Furthermore, since the proficiency level of Chinese of non-Chinese speaking students is generally lower than Chinese speaking students, and most non-Chinese speaking students lack Chinese context in their families and daily life, they often need additional support to cope with Chinese Language subject and other subjects taught in Chinese.

Therefore, under the policy of abolishing the "designated schools" and creating an inclusive campus, we propose to increase the subsidy for schools that have less than 10 non-Chinese speaking students to HK\$500,000 to employ additional teachers (and related external services) to support the learning and integration of non-Chinese speaking students. This helps non-Chinese speaking students who lack Chinese context in their daily life feel easier to integrate into the mainstream classrooms. In addition, schools should be allowed to use the subsidy more freely or a special subsidy should be provided for schools to launch other activities that benefit the integration of non-Chinese speaking students. Therefore, it is recommended that the Education Bureau should increase the flexibility of the use of subsidy or set up a special subsidy to allow schools to organize activities to promote the communication between the non-Chinese speaking parents and schools, cultural exchanges, etc.

**7.2.3 The Education Bureau should provide additional subsidy to enable schools to support non-Chinese speaking students to learn non-Chinese subjects.** According to the survey results, more than 80% of teachers teaching non-Chinese subjects expressed that the Education Bureau lacks support for non-Chinese speaking students to learn other subjects (e.g. Mathematics and General Studies). These non-Chinese subjects are taught in Chinese. The vocabularies in the text are different from those in Chinese Language textbooks. They are generally more difficult and conceptually more abstract. Teachers who are not teaching Chinese Language subject actually encounter difficulties when teaching non-Chinese speaking students and need relevant support.

**7.2.4 To add a dedicated teacher to co-ordinate the learning of non-Chinese speaking students:** Due to the lack of a teacher who plays a coordinating role, planning and monitoring the curriculum design and teaching support development of non-Chinese speaking students, it makes teaching difficult to carry forward and optimize. With reference to the practice of special educational needs, the Education Bureau should set up a dedicated co-ordination position (for example, NCSCO) to enable schools to arrange a teacher to co-ordinate the support of non-Chinese speaking students, organize student support groups, and promote the cultural integration in schools to make sustainable development of the support. At the same time, the Education Bureau should add a

teaching post (for example, non-Chinese speaking students support teacher [NCSST]) to be responsible for NCS students' support (for example, group activities/group teaching) to support cultural integration. It is worth noting that these measures have been implemented in foreign countries for teaching second language learners for many years (for example, New South Wales in Australia and British Columbia in Canada). Many studies have also shown that assigning a dedicated teacher to support second language teaching is beneficial to students (Dove & Honigsfeld, 2010; Russell, 2012). To encourage teachers to be more willing to teach non-Chinese speaking students and receive training to enhance the quality of support, salary adjustments, additional co-ordination posts, and professional training requirements for non-Chinese speaking support teachers would be needed.

### 7.3 Professional support and development

**7.3.1 To provide a complete set of teaching materials for the "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework":** On the one hand, we understand that the Education Bureau has repeatedly stated in different policy papers that the "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" is based on the mainstream Chinese language curriculum. The framework is considered from the perspective of second language learners and breaks the process of learning Chinese down into "small steps" to facilitate teachers to design school-based curriculums. Teachers can adjust teaching progresses and materials according to the progress of non-Chinese speaking students. Teachers can formulate learning and teaching strategies based on the performance of non-Chinese speaking students so that non-Chinese speaking students with different learning needs can learn Chinese in a step-by-step manner.

On the other hand, the results of this study showed that, frontline educators clearly point out that this learning structure is too ideal and does not meet the actual learning situations of non-Chinese speaking students in Hong Kong. Furthermore, many teachers believe that they lack the training of second language teaching to design materials to meet non-Chinese speaking students' actual learning needs. Although the Education Bureau emphasizes that each school should have its school-based curriculum in order to meet its school conditions and the learning needs of different students, school-based curriculum often needs to be adjusted or designed based on existing teaching materials. The "Second Language Learning Framework" for non-Chinese speaking students has only launched in recent years. Without a set of teaching materials to support this learning structure, frontline teachers are basically designing a new set of materials from scratch. Therefore, the research team believes that it is necessary for the Education Bureau to provide teachers with a complete set of materials that can match the mainstream curriculum and the "Second Language Learning Framework".

**7.3.2 To establish an open online platform to share teaching resources:** Before any complete teaching material is available, teachers have to prepare their only teaching materials for non-Chinese speaking students in every subject, which increases the workload. Therefore, we recommend the Education Bureau to set up an open online platform for schools to share teaching resources designed for non-Chinese speaking students.

**7.3.3 To establish a non-Chinese speaking teaching expert support team:** At the same time, during this transition period, due to a lack of experienced frontline teachers in supporting non-Chinese speaking students, the Education Bureau should promote cooperation between schools and university experts to carry out teaching support continuously and closely, so that teachers can master the skills of teaching non-Chinese speaking students. Especially for very low-concentration schools, due to limited resources, there are not sufficient manpower and it is difficult to arrange teachers to support a small number of non-Chinese speaking students. Therefore, it is recommended that the Education Bureau should organize a non-Chinese language teaching support team and send staff to schools that admit non-Chinese speaking students for school support. In addition, the Education Bureau can gather non-Chinese speaking students in low-concentration primary schools in the same districts for group support according to their Chinese language proficiency (for example, after-school, Saturday enrichment courses or support). The formal learning support provided by the Education Bureau can be complemented by the "District-based Project on Supporting non-Chinese Speaking Children in Learning Chinese" organized by the Language Fund-funded NGOs to further enhance the use of Chinese among non-Chinese speaking students in the classrooms and daily life.

**7.3.4 To require a certain proportion of teachers receive professional training of teaching Chinese as a second language:** In terms of teacher training, the Education Bureau should require teachers teaching NCS students to receive professional training for teaching Chinese as a second language so as to train more professionals with relevant knowledge. The refresher training of the Education Bureau should strengthen the professional development for teaching non-Chinese speaking students and formulate strategies systematically to train dedicated teachers. It is suggested that in the future, the Education Bureau makes reference to the professional development model of teachers who take care of students with special educational needs. For example, within five years, a certain proportion of teachers must complete basic and advanced courses. Similarly, with reference to the current model of special educational support, the Education Bureau should require a certain number of teachers in each school to receive training for teaching non-Chinese speaking students. As pointed out in the second chapter of this report, in various places, only teachers who have received relevant professional and recognized training are allowed to teach second language students.

## References

- Cook, V. (2016). *Second language learning and language teaching*. New York: Routledge.
- Dove, M., & Honigsfeld, A. (2010). ESL coteaching and collaboration: Opportunities to develop teacher leadership and enhance student learning. *TESOL Journal*, 1(1), 3-22. doi: 10.5054/tj.2010.214879
- Freeman, D. (1989). Teacher training, development, and decision making: A model of teaching and related strategies for language teacher education. *TESOL Quarterly*, 23(1), 27-45. doi: 10.2307/3587506
- Gamoran, A., Secada, W. G., & Marrett, C. B. (2000). The organizational context of teaching and learning: Changing theoretical perspectives. In M. T. Hallinan (Ed.), *Handbook of the Sociology of Education*. New York: Kluwer Academic/ Plenum Publishers.
- Lingard, B., & Mills, M. (2003). Teachers and school reform: Working with productive pedagogies and productive assessment. *Critical Studies in education*, 44(2), 1-18. doi: 10.1080/17508487.2003.9558596
- Paryani, P. K. (2015). *The status of ethnic minorities in Hong Kong: 1997-2014*. Hong Kong: The University of Hong Kong.
- Russell, C. (2012). Reclaiming the territory: Understanding the specialist knowledge of ESL education for literacy, curriculum, and multilingual learners. *TESOL in Context*, 22(1), 4-17.
- Tse, S. K., & Loh, E. K. Y. (2008). *HK territory-wide system assessment (TSA) 2007: Analyzing the Chinese language performance of P3, P6, & F1 ethnic minority students (in Chinese)*. Unpublished research report. HKU. HK.
- Tse, S. K., & Loh, E. K. Y. (2009). *HK territory-wide system assessment (TSA) 2008: Analyzing the Chinese language performance of P3, P6 & F3 ethnic minority students (in Chinese)*. . Hong Kong: HKU.
- Whorrall, J., & Cabell, S. Q. (2016). Supporting children's oral language development in the preschool classroom. *Early Childhood Education Journal*, 44(4), 335-341.

### Annex 1: Background information of interviewed schools

Schools	Medium of instruction	Number of NCS students	Whether applied for the additional recurrent funding provided by the EDB in the school year of 2018-2019
A	English	About 20	No
B	Cantonese	12	Yes
C	Cantonese	About 80	Yes
D	English	About 500	Yes
E	Cantonese/ partially Putonghua in teaching Chinese Language subject	About 100	Yes
F	Cantonese/ partially Putonghua in teaching Chinese Language subject	About 20	Yes
G	Cantonese	About 40	Yes
H	English	About 100	Yes
I	Cantonese/ partially Putonghua in teaching Chinese Language subject	About 30	Yes

## Annex 2: Principal interview questions

### A. Background information

- 1) Principal's school administration experience (especially the number of years in managing schools admitting non-Chinese speaking students)
- 2) Principal's professional training (education background and training related to teaching non-Chinese speaking students)
- 3) Number of years that your school has admitted non-Chinese speaking students and number of Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students (and percentage)
- 4) When did your school begin admitting non-Chinese speaking students? Why has your school admitted them? Any extra preparation needed for teaching these students?
- 5) How do teachers and parents think about your school admitting non-Chinese speaking students? Any opponents? If so, how did you address the issue? Did it go well?
- 6) Compared to Chinese speaking students, what factors would you consider when admitting non-Chinese speaking students?
- 7) Have you applied for the additional recurrent funding provided by the Education Bureau to facilitate school support for NCS students? If so, how do you allocate the subsidy?
- 8) Compared to Chinese speaking students, does your school make extra preparation for admitting non-Chinese speaking students?
- 9) In discretionary places admission for Primary 1 students in 2018/19, how many applicants were Chinese speaking students? How many of them were successfully admitted? How many applicants were non-Chinese speaking students? How many of them were successfully admitted?
- 10) Has your school ever given an introduction about the school to non-Chinese speaking parents and encouraged their children to enrol? If so, how did it go?
- 11) Has your school ever provided any activities to help primary one non-Chinese speaking students to better adjust to the new learning environment? If so, how did it go?
- 12) Are there any special arrangements provided by your school to facilitate parent-school collaboration and communication for non-Chinese speaking parents?
- 13) Compared to the Chinese-speaking students, have you provided extra support to help non-Chinese speaking students for preparing their transition to secondary schools? Any advice given to their parents in choosing schools? For example, providing information on the medium of instruction, types of teaching and learning support, provision of teacher assistants for non-Chinese speaking students?
- 14) How can a school prepare non-Chinese speaking students to be admitted into suitable secondary schools? What preparation could be done at the primary school stage to support these students?

15) Generally, what is the greatest challenge a mainstream school would encounter when admitting non-Chinese speaking students into a mainstream school?

B. Difficulties in managing human resources

- 1) What are your requirements in recruiting teachers or teacher assistants to teach non-Chinese speaking students? What difficulties do you encounter?
- 2) What are your requirements in arranging teachers or teacher assistants to teach non-Chinese speaking students? What difficulties do you encounter?
- 3) What are your requirements in arranging teachers or teacher assistants to teach non-Chinese speaking students after school? What difficulties do you encounter?
- 4) Do you think teachers in your school can meet your expectation in teaching non-Chinese speaking students? What difficulties do you encounter?
- 5) What methods has your school used to deal with the difficulties? How did it go?

C. Difficulties in managing material resources

- 1) Has your school adopted any adjustment in designing teaching materials? If so, has your school given any guidelines in designing teaching materials? Any difficulties? Were these difficulties resolved? Please specify.
- 2) Has your school adopted any adjustment in assessment? If so, has your school given any guidelines on the assessment adjustment? Any difficulties? Were these difficulties resolved? Please specify.
- 3) Has your school adopted any policies and measures to cater for the individual learning needs of non-Chinese speaking students? If so, has your school given any guidelines on these policies and measures? Any difficulties? Were these difficulties resolved? Please specify.
- 4) Has your school designed a school-based support system for teaching non-Chinese speaking students? If so, what is it about? Any difficulties in establishing such support system? Were these difficulties resolved? Please specify.
- 5) What have you done to help solve these difficulties? How did it go?

D. Difficulties in supporting teachers to solve the problems in teaching non-Chinese speaking students

- 1) How do your school teachers design the curriculum for the non-Chinese speaking students? Do they collaborate to facilitate the planning? If so, are there any difficulties?



- 2) Do you face any difficulties in asking teachers to adopt the school-based support measures?
- 3) Do you face any difficulties in asking teachers to adopt multiple teaching strategies to accommodate students' needs?
- 4) Do you face any difficulties in asking teachers to enrol in professional teacher training for teaching non-Chinese speaking students?
- 5) Do you think the current measures implemented by the Education Bureau in supporting non-Chinese speaking students are sufficient? What can be done to make further improvement?
- 6) From the school administrator perspective, what are the key factors to determine the success of providing suitable learning for non-Chinese speaking students?
- 7) If a school has just begun to admit non-Chinese speaking students, what would you suggest these schools to prepare in terms of school planning, administration, human resources management, resources allocation, parent-school collaboration, etc.?
- 8) How has your school overcome the difficulties? How did it go?
- 9) Generally, do you think the government has provided sufficient support to schools admitting non-Chinese speaking students?
- 10) What kind of support would you anticipate the Education Bureau to provide?

### Annex 3: Teacher interview questions

#### A. Details about teacher's professional background

1. Years of teaching and years of teaching non-Chinese speaking students
2. Any related training in teaching non-Chinese speaking students
3. Related training in supporting individual learning needs
4. Generally, what is the biggest challenge you have faced in teaching non-teaching Chinese speaking students?

The following questions will be asked in the context of junior primary school level (i.e. kindergarten-primary transition) and senior primary school level (i.e. primary-secondary transition).

#### B. Knowledge about non-Chinese speaking students

1. Based on your observation, what **difficulties** do your non-Chinese speaking students encounter in the following aspects?
  - a) Learning with ethnic Chinese speaking students
  - b) Learning the subject (subject that the interviewee taught)
  - c) Parent-school communication
2. Based on your observation, do your non-Chinese speaking students receive **equal treatment** at school in the following aspects? Why?
  - a) Learning and participation in class
  - b) Participating in extracurricular activities
  - c) Parent-school communication

#### C. Supports to non-Chinese speaking students

1. Have you used any **strategies/ techniques** in the following aspects? If so, please specify.
  - a) Catering for individual learning differences
  - b) Teaching the subject (subject that the interviewee taught)
  - c) Parent-school collaboration
2. In implementing the support measures above, did you encounter any **difficulties**? If so, what were they? Were these difficulties resolved? (Please specify your ways of solving these problems.)
3. Are these support measures effective? Why?
4. At school level, what are the key factors to determine outcome of these support measures?
5. Do you think the Education Bureau has given enough support to these measures for non-Chinese speaking students? What would you recommend?

#### D. Attitudes towards teaching non-Chinese speaking students

1. Before teaching non-Chinese speaking students, were you prepared to teach students with diverse cultural background and language?
2. Before teaching non-Chinese speaking students, did you anticipate any difference between non-Chinese speaking and Chinese-speaking students in learning? If so, please specify.

3. How did you handle the anticipated differences when preparing your teaching? Any teaching techniques used for addressing the difference? If so, please specify.
4. Is there any difference between the actual teaching of non-Chinese speaking students and the predicted situation? If so, please specify.
5. Is the general performance/ learning progress of non-Chinese speaking students meeting your expectation?
6. Have you ever received any pre-service training or professional training on teaching non-Chinese speaking students? Please specify.
7. Generally, how do you perceive your competence in teaching non-Chinese speaking students to achieve the expected outcome? Please explain.

E. Difficulties in teaching non-Chinese speaking students

1. Do you encounter any difficulties in the following aspects?
  - a) Teaching (including classroom management, medium of instruction, look after the learning progresses of both Chinese-speaking and non-Chinese speaking students, preparation of appropriate teaching materials for NCS students, etc.)
  - b) Assessment (including classroom activities, homework, dictation, test/ exam)
  - c) Communication (including communicating with the non-Chinese speaking students and their parents)
2. What methods have you used to overcome the difficulties? How did it go?
3. Do you think your school has provided sufficient support to teachers? In what areas do you want the school to support you the most?
4. What are the key factors to determine outcome for efficient teaching of NCS students?
5. Do you think that the mainstream curriculum is appropriate for non-Chinese speaking students? Why?
6. Do you think the “Second Language Learning Framework” for second language learners help you in teaching non-Chinese speaking students? Why?
7. What would you suggest the government and the Education Bureau to provide?
8. Based on your experience, how can kindergarten schools prepare non-Chinese speaking students to better adjust the primary school curriculum and learning requirements?
9. Based on the information from the alumni, how can primary schools prepare non-Chinese speaking students to better equip themselves to accommodate the requirements and curriculums of secondary schools?

#### Annex 4: School principals' questionnaire survey

The Faculty of Education in the University of Hong Kong has been commissioned by the Equal Opportunities Commission to conduct a survey with all schools in Hong Kong. You are cordially invited to participate in this research study. This study is supervised by Dr Elizabeth Loh from the Faculty of Education (HKU) and Oxfam Hong Kong. Its objective is to understand the difficulties faced by mainstream schools in educating ethnic minority students in Hong Kong (hereafter “non-Chinese speaking students”). This set of questionnaires is designed for **school principals** and estimated taking 15 minutes to complete.

Please circle the corresponding number in the appropriate space and respond to the following items based on your school's situation. The information you provided will be kept confidential and used for research purpose only. The research results will be presented to the Equal Opportunities Commission for policy advocacy in order to build a better learning environment and conditions for the NCS students.

#### Part 1: About personnel arrangements (0 = No difficulty to 5 = very difficult)

To what extent do you think it is difficult to ...						
	0	1	2	3	4	5
1) Employ teachers who have experience teaching NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
2) Employ teachers who are capable of teaching NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
3) Employ teachers who have passion in teaching NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
4) Employ teaching assistants who have experience teaching NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
5) Employ teaching assistants who are capable of teaching NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
6) Employ teaching assistant who have passion in teaching NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
7) Employ teachers who have skill in teaching Chinese as a second language	0	1	2	3	4	5
8) Provide incentives for teachers to be willing to teach NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
9) Retain teaching assistants who have experience in teaching NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
10) Maintain enough resources to employ specialist teachers to teach NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
11) Transform teachers' mind-set and accept teaching NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
12) Encourage teachers to teach NCS students with more flexible teaching modes	0	1	2	3	4	5

13) Arrange teachers to take refresher courses to learn how to teach NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
14) Arrange short-term training courses (such as lectures, workshops, etc.) for teachers to learn how to teach NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
15) Appoint experienced teachers to coordinate the learning and teaching of NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
16) Arranging teachers/teaching assistants to provide after-school tutorials for NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5

Part 2: Chinese learning and assessment (0 = totally disagree to 5 = totally agree)

To what extent do you agree with the following descriptions?	Totally disagree  Totally agree					
<b>Curriculum design</b>						
4) The expected learning outcomes set by the “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework” are too ideal and do not generally meet the learning process of NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
5) The “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework” fails to match the actual teaching progress	0	1	2	3	4	5
6) The “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework” does not help NCS students to keep up with the mainstream learning process	0	1	2	3	4	5
7) The lack of supporting facilities for the “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework” makes it difficult to assist teachers to integrate NCS students into mainstream Chinese Language subject lessons.	0	1	2	3	4	5
8) The mainstream Chinese Language course is too difficult for NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
9) Chinese writing in mainstream curriculum is too demanding for NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Teaching materials</b>						
10) There is an absence of textbooks that set Chinese as a second language as well as conjunction with mainstream curriculum.	0	1	2	3	4	5
11) Chinese Language subject teachers must rely on personal efforts in developing textbooks, exercises, and various adjustments.	0	1	2	3	4	5
12) Following the previous question, Chinese Language subject teachers lack supports in developing textbooks, exercises, and various adjustment assessments	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Class arrangements</b>						
13) NCS students are usually scattered at all grades	0	1	2	3	4	5
14) Following the previous question, schools have insufficient resources to arrange for the	0	1	2	3	4	5

separation or intensive study support for NCS students in each grade.

15) Despite the application of the integration and pull-out learning measures, it is still difficult for NCS students to reach the language level similar to the Chinese speaking students of the same grade before the Internal Examinations (from Primary 1 to Primary 4).	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Assessment arrangements</b>						
16) If NCS students and Chinese speaking students are given the same Chinese language test papers, NCS students are at a disadvantage.	0	1	2	3	4	5
17) Chinese language scores of NCS students and Chinese speakers should be distributed separately.	0	1	2	3	4	5
18) NCS students should receive adjustments during the assessment (e.g. Reading aloud to the students)	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Teaching staff arrangements</b>						
19) The separation support for NCS students is usually provided by teaching assistants.	No			Yes		
20) Teaching assistants have sufficient professional knowledge to judge the student's Chinese language proficiency	0	1	2	3	4	5
21) Teaching assistants have the capability to design appropriate and progressive courses	0	1	2	3	4	5
22) There remains a high turnover rate of teaching assistants	No (skip question 20 & 21)			Yes		
23) If your answer "Yes" for question 19: The replacement of teaching assistants will affect the stability of teaching	0	1	2	3	4	5
24) If your answer "Yes" for question 19: NCS students are required to constantly adapt to the teaching style of different teachers.	0	1	2	3	4	5
25) Teaching assistants generally lack teaching experience	0	1	2	3	4	5
26) Pull-out learning of Chinese for NCS students should be provided by teachers who are experienced in teaching NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
27) Pull-out learning of Chinese for NCS students should be provided by highly qualified teachers.	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Language used in teaching</b>						

28) For schools using Putonghua as the medium of instruction (MOI) for teaching Chinese Language Subject (PMIC):  
 It is very difficult to employ teaching assistants who are capable of teaching Chinese in Mandarin.

	0	1	2	3	4	5
--	---	---	---	---	---	---

---

29) For schools using Putonghua as the medium of instruction (MOI) for teaching Chinese Language Subject (PMIC):  
 It is more difficult for NCS students to integrate into the Chinese Language subject lesson in mainstream curriculum.

	0	1	2	3	4	5
--	---	---	---	---	---	---

---


30) For schools using Putonghua as the medium of instruction (MOI) for teaching Chinese Language Subject (PMIC):  
 It is very difficult for NCS students to learn Chinese in Mandarin.

	0	1	2	3	4	5
--	---	---	---	---	---	---

---




Part 3: Overall teaching circumstances (0 = totally disagree to 5 = totally agree)

To what extent do you agree with the following descriptions?	Totally disagree  Totally agree					
<b>Students' personal factors</b>						
1) Many NCS students have not received local kindergarten education	0	1	2	3	4	5
2) Following the previous question, NCS students who have never received local kindergarten education encounter the greatest difficulty to adapt to mainstream curriculum	0	1	2	3	4	5
3) The Chinese learning level of NCS students affects their overall learning performance	0	1	2	3	4	5
4) NCS students are often absent which affects teaching progress	0	1	2	3	4	5
5) NCS students are often overdue for their homework	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Progression issues</b>						
6) Internal Examinations restrict the future academic development of NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
7) Following the previous question, NCS students have limited choice of secondary school progression	0	1	2	3	4	5
8) According to the current mechanism, Chinese Language and Mathematics will be scored nine times larger. Thus, Chinese language ability will have a great impact on the allocation. For most NCS students, both Chinese and English are their second language. As a result, the current Internal Examinations mechanism is unfair to non-Chinese speaking students compared to Chinese speaking students who only require learning one second language (English).	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Family factors</b>						
9) NCS students lack family support	0	1	2	3	4	5
10) Parents of NCS students lack resources to enroll tutorials for their children	0	1	2	3	4	5
11) Parents of NCS students have lower expectations for their children's education	0	1	2	3	4	5

12) Parents of NCS students are not willing to communicate with teachers	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Issues in relation to teaching NCS Students</b>						
13) The Education Bureau lacks support for NCS students in other disciplines (e.g. Mathematics, General Studies)	0	1	2	3	4	5
14) The additional subsidy provided by the Education Bureau according to the number of NCS students can only be used for the learning and teaching of Chinese language and there is no chance to cater for the needs of other subjects (e.g., Mathematics, General Studies).	0	1	2	3	4	5
15) Lack of identification tools for identifying NCS students with learning difficulties	0	1	2	3	4	5
16) It is very difficult for teachers to take care of both non-Chinese and Chinese speaking students while teaching.	0	1	2	3	4	5
17) Many teachers are not willing to teach NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5

Part 4: Measures to support NCS students (0 = totally disagree to 5 = totally agree)

To what extent do you agree with the following descriptions about the measures to support NCS students?	Totally disagree  Totally agree					
<b>Staff arrangements in supporting the NCS students</b>						
1) The subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is not enough to employ an Assistant Primary School Teacher (APSM) to teach NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
2) The subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is not enough to give teachers, who are dedicated to teaching NCS students, getting promotion (i.e. to PSM)	0	1	2	3	4	5
3) The subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is not enough to employ teachers with more teaching experience to support NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
4) NCS students should be taught by teachers with more teaching experience	0	1	2	3	4	5
5) Government subsidy are often only enough to employ younger teachers or just teaching assistants.	0	1	2	3	4	5
6) Teachers who specialize in teaching NCS students lack professional recognition	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Professional support</b>						
7) School-based curriculum development services provided by the Education Bureau have little effect	0	1	2	3	4	5
8) Teachers can hardly enroll refresher courses since the timetable for these courses was not notified to them as early as possible.	0	1	2	3	4	5
9) Teaching materials developed by the government and universities fail to meet the teacher's demand to support NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
10) University scholars do not quite understand the needs of primary school teachers to support NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
11) Refresher courses held by the university are too theoretical and out of reality.	0	1	2	3	4	5
12) Refresher courses held by the university fail to meet the teacher's demand to support NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5

13) The Education Bureau provides no special support measures or guidelines for communication with NCS parents.	0	1	2	3	4	5
14) The Education Bureau provides no special support measures or guidelines on the cultural integration of NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5

Part 5a: Suggestions in supporting NCS students (0 = not effective to 5 = extremely effective)

How do you rate the effectiveness of the following suggestions in supporting NCS students?	Not effective <span style="font-size: 2em;">←————→</span> Extremely effective					
<b>Resources</b>						
1) The Education Bureau should increase the amount of subsidy to allow the schools to employ Assistant Primary School Degree Teachers (APSM) to provide NCS students with pull-out learning teaching support.	0	1	2	3	4	5
2) The Education Bureau should be distributed according to the number of NCS students proportionately.	0	1	2	3	4	5
3) The subsidy of the Education Bureau should improve the flexibility of using the subsidy so that schools may use it to promote cultural exchange activities and communication between NCS parents and schools.	0	1	2	3	4	5
4) The Education Bureau should add a coordinator position (e.g. NCSCO) who is responsible for co-ordinating the support work of NCS students, organizing student learning support group and promoting cultural inclusion in schools.	0	1	2	3	4	5
5) The Education Bureau should add a teacher position (Non-Chinese Speaking Students Support Teacher (NCSST)) who is responsible for supporting students' learning activities (for example: group teaching or split-group teaching) and the cultural inclusion.	0	1	2	3	4	5
6) The Education Bureau should provide professional recognition to teachers who teach NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
7) The Education Bureau should require NCS support teachers to ensure the use of subsidy to be relevant to the learning and needs of the NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Professional support and development</b>						
8) The Government should re-implement the policy of "designated schools"	0	1	2	3	4	5

9) The Education Bureau needs to provide teaching materials for the “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework”.	0	1	2	3	4	5
10) The Education Bureau should support NCS students’ learning in other subjects (such as Mathematics and General Studies).	0	1	2	3	4	5
11) The Education Bureau should set up a platform for schools to share teaching resources designed for NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
12) The Education Bureau should promote more sustainable and closer cooperation between schools and university experts.	0	1	2	3	4	5
13)The Education Bureau should organize NCS teaching support teams and send staff for supporting schools that admit NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
14)The Education Bureau can group NCS students of low NCS composition primary schools, located in the same district, and provide them with group learning support, based on their Chinese language proficiency (for example: after-school, Saturday enrichment courses or support)	0	1	2	3	4	5
15)As for teacher training, prospective teachers should be specialized their training of teaching Chinese as a second language	0	1	2	3	4	5
16)The government should encourage teachers, who teach NCS students, to get the related training by providing some incentives.	0	1	2	3	4	5
17)The Education Bureau should have special measures on the school-parent communication and cultural integration for NCS parents.	0	1	2	3	4	5
18) The Education Bureau should set up professional training development for teachers who teach NCS students, so that schools can systematically train specialist teachers (e.g. it can be done by providing basic, advanced and special courses)	0	1	2	3	4	5
19) The Education Bureau should require a certain number of teachers in each school to receive relevant training in teaching NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
20) The Education Bureau should plan the whole school approach in supporting NCS students' learning and related policies.	0	1	2	3	4	5

Part 5b: Preferences of the suggestions

Please indicate your top 5 among the 20 suggestions mentioned above (see part 5a) according to the importance, urgency and effectiveness respectively.

1) Indicate the five **most important** suggestions

---

a.                      b.                      c.                      d.                      e.

---

2) Indicate the five **most urgent** suggestions

---

a.                      b.                      c.                      d.                      e.

---

3) Indicate the five **most effective** suggestions

---

a.                      b.                      c.                      d.                      e.

---

Part 5c: Other suggestion: Please fill in the box below if you have any other suggestion to make.

Part 6: Factors affecting the effectiveness of teaching NCS students (0 = no influential to 5 = extremely influential)

Do you think the following factors affecting the effectiveness of teaching NCS students?						
	Not influential					Extremely influential
1) Subsidy from the Education Bureau	0	1	2	3	4	5
2) School-based support services of the Education Bureau	0	1	2	3	4	5
3) A platform to allow schools to share teaching resources with each other introduced by the Education Bureau	0	1	2	3	4	5
4) NCS students supporting courses organized by the Education Bureau	0	1	2	3	4	5
5) A teaching position in the school system who is responsible for supporting NCS students introduced by the Education Bureau	0	1	2	3	4	5
6) NCS students supporting courses introduced by university	0	1	2	3	4	5
7) Teaching materials	0	1	2	3	4	5
8) School-based support provided by university	0	1	2	3	4	5
9) NCS parents' understanding of Hong Kong's education system	0	1	2	3	4	5
10) Educational expectations of NCS parents	0	1	2	3	4	5
11) Cooperation of NCS parents	0	1	2	3	4	5
12) Recruitment of experienced graduate teachers (GM) to support NCS students by schools	0	1	2	3	4	5
13) Teacher's understanding of NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
14) Teacher's attitude towards cultural differences	0	1	2	3	4	5
15) Teacher training to teach NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
16) Teacher's enthusiasm for teaching NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
17) Teacher's teaching skills	0	1	2	3	4	5
18) Teacher's teaching experience	0	1	2	3	4	5
19) Teacher's insight for self-teaching effectiveness	0	1	2	3	4	5
20) NCS students' cultural understanding of Hong Kong	0	1	2	3	4	5



21) Learning motivation of non-Chinese speaking students	0	1	2	3	4	5
22) Volunteer organization support for learning and inclusion of NCS students (e.g. tutorial, cultural exchange activities)	0	1	2	3	4	5
23) Please indicate the top 5 among the 22 factors mentioned above that are the most effective in the teaching of NCS student.						
a.	b.	c.	d.	e.		

Part 7: Views towards different ethnicities (0 = totally disagree to 5 = totally agree)

To what extent do you agree with the following descriptions?	Totally disagree <span style="font-size: 2em;">←————→</span> Totally agree					
<b>Recruitment matters</b>						
1) Willing to employ a NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as a Chinese Language subject teacher	0	1	2	3	4	5
2) Willing to employ a NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as an English Language teacher	0	1	2	3	4	5
3) Willing to employ a NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as a Mathematics teacher	0	1	2	3	4	5
4) Willing to employ a NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as a General Studies teacher	0	1	2	3	4	5
5) Willing to employ a NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as a teaching assistant	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Students' matters</b>						
6) Willing to accept NCS students who meet the requirements for Primary 1 admission	0	1	2	3	4	5
7) Encourage NCS students to participate in extracurricular activities and allocate more resources to employ tutors who can teach in English / to provide extracurricular activities in English	0	1	2	3	4	5
8) Willing to let NCS schools participate in inter-school competitions (e.g. reading, singing, drama)	0	1	2	3	4	5
9) Willing to let Chinese speaking students know the cultural characteristics of other ethnic students in school	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Communication with parents</b>						
10) Willing to provide English translation of school notices to promote communication with NCS parents	0	1	2	3	4	5
11) Willing to arrange English teachers as class teachers for NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
12) Willing to allow NCS parents to join the Parent Teacher Association	0	1	2	3	4	5

13) Willing to explain the measures supporting NCS students in the “Primary School Overview” and the school website	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Understanding of different ethnicities</b>						
14) You recognize the culture of each ethnic group	0	1	2	3	4	5
15) You recognize the traditions of various ethnicities	0	1	2	3	4	5
16) You have heard of the Racial Discrimination Ordinance	0	1	2	3	4	5
17) You understand the contents of the Racial Discrimination Ordinance	0	1	2	3	4	5
18) To consider the "Racial Discrimination Ordinance" when formulating school affairs	0	1	2	3	4	5

**Part 8: School Information**

1) From which year on, your school started to recruit NCS students?

2) How many classes are there in each grade in your school?

P.1	P.2	P.3	P.4	P.5	P.6

3) How many students are there in each grade in the academic year 2018-2019?

P.1	P.2	P.3	P.4	P.5	P.6

4) How many NCS students are there in each grade in the academic year 2018-2019?

P.1	P.2	P.3	P.4	P.5	P.6

5) Did you apply for the EDB's subsidy for supporting NCS student in the academic year 2018-2019? ( Circle as appropriate )

Yes/  
No

6) If Yes, what is the amount of the subsidy? HKD \_\_\_\_\_

7) If you applied for the subsidy, do you use the subsidy to employ teachers or teaching assistant for supporting the teaching of NCS students?(circle as appropriate)

Yes/  
No

8) If yes, how many teacher(s) and/or teaching assistant(s) did you employ?

6a)Teacher(s): \_\_\_\_\_ 6b)Teaching assistant(s): \_\_\_\_\_

9) What is the medium of instruction for Chinese Language subject? (Put  in the appropriate box )

Cantonese for all grades    Mandarin for all grades    Cantonese for NCS students

Mandarin for NCS students    Other, please specify: \_\_\_\_\_

10) What is the medium of instruction for other subjects (Mathematics, General Studies, etc.)? (Put  in the appropriate box )

Chinese    English

11) What is the funding mode of your school? (Put  in the appropriate box )

government    aided    direct subsidy    private-independent

~ End of questionnaire, Thank you very much!~

## Annex 5: Teachers' questionnaire survey

The Faculty of Education in the University of Hong Kong has been commissioned by the Equal Opportunities Commission to conduct a survey with all schools in Hong Kong. You are cordially invited to participate in this research study. This study is supervised by Dr Elizabeth Loh from the Faculty of Education (HKU) and Oxfam Hong Kong. Its objective is to understand the difficulties faced by mainstream schools in educating ethnic minority students in Hong Kong (hereafter "non-Chinese speaking students"). This set of questionnaires is designed for **school teachers** and estimated taking 15 minutes to complete.

Please circle the corresponding number in the appropriate space and respond to the following items based on your school's situation. The information you provided will be confidential and used for research purpose only. The research results will be presented to the Equal Opportunities Commission for policy advocacy in order to build a better learning environment and conditions for the NCS students.

### Part 1: About teaching NCS students (0 = No difficulty to 5 = very difficult)

To what extent how difficult do you think it is to achieve the following descriptions?	<div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between; align-items: center;"> <span><u>No</u> difficulty</span> <span style="font-size: 2em;">←————→</span> <span><u>very</u> difficult</span> </div>					
1) Require NCS students to bring essential items for class (including stationeries and books)	0	1	2	3	4	5
2) Make NCS students understand classroom instructions	0	1	2	3	4	5
3) Apply appropriate teaching methods to guide NCS students to understand the teaching content	0	1	2	3	4	5
4) Make NCS students keep up with the teaching pace of the classroom	0	1	2	3	4	5
5) Inspire the learning motivation of NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
6) Apply teaching strategies to stimulate the curiosity of NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
7) Ask different levels of questions to guide NCS students' thinking	0	1	2	3	4	5
8) Apply questioning strategies to stimulate NCS students to take the initiative to speak	0	1	2	3	4	5
9) Provide opportunities for NCS students to express their opinions	0	1	2	3	4	5
10) Provide appropriate performance opportunities for NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5

11) Arrange assignments that match the ability of NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
12) Make NCS students understand the homework requirements	0	1	2	3	4	5
13) Ask NCS students to submit all homework	0	1	2	3	4	5
14) Make NCS students keep up with the progress of mainstream curriculum	0	1	2	3	4	5
15) Make NCS students achieve the learning goals of the mainstream curriculum	0	1	2	3	4	5
16) Avoid over-emphasizing the importance of assessment scores to NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
17) Cater for the learning differences of both Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students at the same time	0	1	2	3	4	5
18) Design teaching activities meeting the learning level of both Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students	0	1	2	3	4	5
19) Enhance the interaction between Chinese and non-Chinese speaking students	0	1	2	3	4	5


Part 2: Overall teaching (0 = Totally disagree to 5 = Totally agree)

To what extent do you agree with the following descriptions?	<u>Totally disagree</u> <span style="font-size: 2em;">←————→</span> <u>Totally agree</u>					
<b>Teachers' confidence in teaching NCS students</b>						
18) You are confident to teach NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
19) You are confident to teach NCS students to reach the learning level close to that of the Chinese speaking students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
20) You are confident to teach NCS students while taking care of the learning of Chinese-speaking students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
21) You are confident to integrate NCS students with the Chinese speaking students to learn effectively.	0	1	2	3	4	5
22) You feel stressed to take care of both NCS and Chinese speaking students while teaching.	0	1	2	3	4	5
23) When you are teaching NCS students, you are aware that you need to improve your teaching skills	0	1	2	3	4	5

24)When you are teaching NCS students, you are aware that you need to improve your lesson designs	0	1	2	3	4	5
25)You have ever felt discouraged because NCS students are still falling behind the peers even after dedicating all your efforts to teach them	0	1	2	3	4	5
26)The disparity of Chinese language proficiency has affected NCS students' overall learning performance	0	1	2	3	4	5
27)Lack of assessment tools to identify NCS students with learning difficulties	0	1	2	3	4	5
28)The Education Bureau lacks support for NCS students learning other subjects (e.g. Mathematics and General Studies)	0	1	2	3	4	5
29)You are willing to teach classes with NCS students even without school assignment	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Family factors</b>						
30) NCS students lack family support	0	1	2	3	4	5
31) Parents of NCS students lack resources to enroll tutorials for their children	0	1	2	3	4	5
32) NCS parents have low expectations for their children's education	0	1	2	3	4	5
33) NCS parents are not willing to communicate with teachers	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Student personal factors</b>						
34) Many NCS students have not received local kindergarten education	0	1	2	3	4	5
35) NCS students who have never received local kindergarten education encounter the greatest difficulty to adapt to mainstream curriculum	0	1	2	3	4	5
36) NCS students are often absent which affects teaching progress	0	1	2	3	4	5
37) NCS students are often overdue for their homework	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Progression issues</b>						
38) Internal Examinations restrict the future academic development of NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
39) NCS students have limited choice of secondary school progression	0	1	2	3	4	5
40) According to the current mechanism, the scores for language subjects and Mathematics will be multiplied by 9 times. Thus, Chinese language ability will have a great impact on the allocation. For most NCS students, both	0	1	2	3	4	5

Chinese and English are their second language. As a result, the current Internal Examinations mechanism is unfair to non-Chinese speaking students compared to Chinese speaking students who only require learning one second language (English).

Part 3: Chinese learning and assessment (0 = Totally disagree to 5 = Totally agree)  
(Please skip the part 3 and keep on the part 4 if you are not a Chinese Language subject teacher)

To what extent do you agree with the following descriptions?	<u>Totally disagree</u>  <u>Totally agree</u>					
<b>Curriculum of Chinese Language subject</b>						
1) The expected learning outcomes set by the "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" are too ideal and do not generally meet the learning process of NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
2) The "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" fails to match the actual teaching progress	0	1	2	3	4	5
3) The "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" does not help NCS students to keep up with the mainstream learning process	0	1	2	3	4	5
4) The lack of supporting facilities for the "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" makes it difficult to assist teachers to integrate NCS students into mainstream Chinese Language subject lessons.	0	1	2	3	4	5
5) The mainstream Chinese Language course is too difficult for NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
6) Chinese writing in mainstream curriculum is too demanding for NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Teaching materials</b>						
7) A lack of teaching Chinese as a second language teaching resources that match the mainstream curriculum	0	1	2	3	4	5
8) It relies on personal efforts of Chinese Language subject teachers in developing textbooks, exercises, and various assessment accommodations.	0	1	2	3	4	5



9) Following previous question, Chinese Language subject teachers lack supports in developing textbooks, exercises, and various assessment accommodations	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Lesson arrangements</b>						
10) NCS students are usually scattered at all grades	0	1	2	3	4	5
11) Following the previous question, schools have insufficient resources to arrange for the pull-out or intensive learning support for NCS students in each grade	0	1	2	3	4	5
12) Despite the application of the integration and pull-out learning, it is still difficult for NCS students to reach the language level similar to the Chinese speaking students of the same grade before taking the Internal Examinations (from Primary 1 to Primary 4).	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Assessment arrangements</b>						
13) If NCS students and Chinese speaking students are given the same set of Chinese Language subject examination papers, NCS students are at a disadvantage.	0	1	2	3	4	5
14) Chinese language scores of NCS students and Chinese speakers should be handled separately.	0	1	2	3	4	5
15) NCS students should receive adjustments during the assessment (e.g. read aloud the paper)	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Teaching staff arrangements</b>						
16) The separation support for NCS students is usually provided by teaching assistants.	No			Yes		
17) Teaching assistants have sufficient professional knowledge to judge the student's Chinese language proficiency	0	1	2	3	4	5
18) Teaching assistants have the capability to design appropriate and progressive courses	0	1	2	3	4	5
19) There remains a high turnover rate of teaching assistants	No (skip question 20 & 21)			Yes		
20) If your answer "Yes" for question 19: The replacement of teaching assistants will affect the stability of teaching	0	1	2	3	4	5
21) If your answer "Yes" for question 19: NCS students are required to constantly adapt to the teaching style of different teachers.	0	1	2	3	4	5
22) Teaching assistants generally lack teaching experience	0	1	2	3	4	5

23) Pull-out learning of Chinese for NCS students should be provided by teachers who are experienced in teaching NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
24) Pull-out learning of Chinese for NCS students should be provided by highly qualified teachers.	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Language used in teaching</b>						
25) For schools using Putonghua as the medium of instruction (MOI) for teaching Chinese Language Subject (PMIC): It is very difficult to employ teaching assistants who are capable of teaching Chinese in Mandarin.	0	1	2	3	4	5
26) For schools using Putonghua as the medium of instruction (MOI) for teaching Chinese Language Subject (PMIC): It is more difficult for NCS students to integrate into the Chinese Language subject lesson in mainstream curriculum.	0	1	2	3	4	5
27) For schools using Putonghua as the medium of instruction (MOI) for teaching Chinese Language Subject (PMIC): It is very difficult for NCS students to learn Chinese in Mandarin.	0	1	2	3	4	5

Part 4: Measures to support NCS students (0 = totally disagree to 5 = totally agree)

	Totally disagree						Totally agree
<p>To what extent do you agree with the following descriptions about the measures to support NCS students?</p> <p style="text-align: center;">←—————→</p>							
<b>Staff arrangements in supporting the NCS student</b>							
1) The subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is not enough to employ an Assistant Primary School Teacher (APSM) to teach NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5	
2) The subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is not enough to give teachers, who are dedicated to teaching NCS students, getting promotion (i.e. to PSM)	0	1	2	3	4	5	
3) The subsidy provided by the Education Bureau is not enough to employ teachers with more teaching experience to support NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5	
4) NCS students should be taught by teachers with more teaching experience	0	1	2	3	4	5	
5) Government subsidy are often only enough to employ younger teachers or just teaching assistants.	0	1	2	3	4	5	
6) Teachers who specialize in teaching NCS students lack professional recognition	0	1	2	3	4	5	
<b>Professional support</b>							
7) School-based curriculum development services provided by the Education Bureau have little effect	0	1	2	3	4	5	
8) Teachers can hardly enroll refresher courses since the timetable for these courses was not notified to them as early as possible.	0	1	2	3	4	5	
9) Teaching materials developed by the government and universities fail to meet the teacher's demand to support NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5	
10) University scholars do not quite understand the needs of primary school teachers to support NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5	
11) Refresher courses held by the university are too theoretical and out of reality.	0	1	2	3	4	5	
12) Refresher courses held by the university fail to meet the teacher's demand to support NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5	

13) The Education Bureau provides no special support measures or guidelines for communication with NCS parents.	0	1	2	3	4	5
14) The Education Bureau provides no special support measures or guidelines on the cultural integration of NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5

Part 5a: Suggestions in supporting NCS students (0 = not effective to 5 = extremely effective)

How do you rate the effectiveness of the following suggestions in supporting NCS students?

Not effective Extremely effective



<b>Resources</b>	0	1	2	3	4	5
1) The Education Bureau should increase the amount of subsidy to allow the schools to employ Assistant Primary School Degree Teachers (APSM) to provide NCS students with pull-out learning teaching support.	0	1	2	3	4	5
2) The subsidy of the Education Bureau should be distributed according to the number of NCS students proportionately.	0	1	2	3	4	5
3) The Education Bureau should improve the flexibility of using the subsidy so that schools may apply it to promote cultural exchange activities and communication between NCS parents and schools.	0	1	2	3	4	5
4) The Education Bureau should add a coordinator position (e.g. NCSCO) who is responsible for co-ordinating the support work of NCS students, organizing student learning support group and promoting cultural inclusion in schools.	0	1	2	3	4	5
5) The Education Bureau should add a teacher position (Non-Chinese Speaking Students Support Teacher (NCSST)), who is responsible for supporting students' learning activities (for example: group teaching or split-group teaching) and the cultural inclusion.	0	1	2	3	4	5
6) The Education Bureau should provide professional recognition to teachers who teach NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
7) The Education Bureau should require NCS support teachers to ensure the use of subsidy to be relevant to the learning and needs of the NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Professional support and development</b>						
8) The Government should re-implement the policy of "designated schools"	0	1	2	3	4	5
9) The Education Bureau needs to provide teaching materials for the "Chinese	0	1	2	3	4	5

Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework".

10) The Education Bureau should support NCS students' learning in other subjects (such as Mathematics and General Studies).	0	1	2	3	4	5
11) The Education Bureau should set up a platform for schools to share teaching resources designed for NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
12) The Education Bureau should promote more sustainable and closer cooperation between schools and university experts.	0	1	2	3	4	5
13)The Education Bureau should organize NCS teaching support teams and send staff for supporting schools that admit NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5
14)The Education Bureau can group NCS students of low NCS composition primary schools, located in the same district, and provide them with group learning support, based on their Chinese language proficiency (for example: after-school, Saturday enrichment courses or support)	0	1	2	3	4	5
15)As for teacher training, prospective teachers should be specialized their training of teaching Chinese as a second language	0	1	2	3	4	5
16)The government should encourage teachers, who teach NCS students, to get the related training by providing some incentives.	0	1	2	3	4	5
17) The Education Bureau should have special measures on the school-parent communication and cultural integration for NCS parents.	0	1	2	3	4	5
18) The Education Bureau should set up professional training development for teachers who teach NCS students, so that schools can systematically train specialist teachers (e.g. it can be done by providing basic, advanced and special courses)	0	1	2	3	4	5
19) The Education Bureau should require a certain number of teachers in each school to receive relevant training in teaching NCS students.	0	1	2	3	4	5

20) The Education Bureau should plan the whole school approach in supporting NCS students' learning and related policies. 0 1 2 3 4 5

---

Part 5b: Preferences of the suggestions

Please indicate your top 5 among the 20 suggestions mentioned above (see part 5a) according to the importance, urgency and effectiveness respectively.

1) Indicate the five **most important** suggestions

---

a.                      b.                      c.                      d.                      e.

---

2) Indicate the five **most urgent** suggestions

---

a.                      b.                      c.                      d.                      e.

---

3) Indicate the five **most effective** suggestions

---


a.                      b.                      c.                      d.                      e.

---

Part 5c: Other suggestion

Please fill in the box below if you have any other suggestion to make.

Part 6a: Factors affecting the effectiveness of teaching NCS students (0 = no influential to 5 = extremely influential)

Do you think the following factors affecting the effectiveness of teaching NCS students?	Not influential  Extremely influential					
	0	1	2	3	4	5
1) Subsidy from the Education Bureau	0	1	2	3	4	5
2) School-based support services of the Education Bureau	0	1	2	3	4	5
3) A platform to allow schools to share teaching resources with each other introduced by the Education Bureau	0	1	2	3	4	5
4) NCS students supporting courses organized by the Education Bureau	0	1	2	3	4	5
5) The Education Bureau adds a teaching position in the school system who is responsible for supporting NCS students introduced by the Education Bureau	0	1	2	3	4	5
6) NCS students supporting courses introduced by university	0	1	2	3	4	5
7) Teaching materials	0	1	2	3	4	5
8) School-based support provided by university	0	1	2	3	4	5
9) NCS parents' understanding of Hong Kong's education system	0	1	2	3	4	5
10) Educational expectations of NCS parents	0	1	2	3	4	5
11) Cooperation of NCS parents	0	1	2	3	4	5
12) Recruitment of experienced graduate teachers (GM) to support NCS students by schools	0	1	2	3	4	5
13) Teacher's understanding of NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
14) Teacher's attitude towards cultural differences	0	1	2	3	4	5
15) Teacher training to teach NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
16) Teacher's enthusiasm for teaching NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
17) Teacher's teaching skills	0	1	2	3	4	5
18) Teacher's teaching experience	0	1	2	3	4	5
19) Teacher's insight for self-teaching effectiveness	0	1	2	3	4	5
20) NCS students' cultural understanding of Hong Kong	0	1	2	3	4	5





Part 7: Views towards different ethnicities (0 = totally disagree to 5 = totally agree)

To what extent do you agree with the following descriptions?	Totally disagree <span style="font-size: 2em;">←————→</span> Totally agree					
<b>Recruitment matters</b>						
1) Willing to employ an NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as a Chinese Language subject teacher	0	1	2	3	4	5
2) Willing to employ an NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as an English Language teacher	0	1	2	3	4	5
3) Willing to employ an NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as a Mathematics teacher	0	1	2	3	4	5
4) Willing to employ an NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as a General Studies teacher	0	1	2	3	4	5
5) Willing to employ an NCS applicant who meets the requirements of the position as a teaching assistant	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Students' matters</b>						
6) Willing to accept NCS students who meet the requirements for Primary 1 admission	0	1	2	3	4	5
7) Encourage NCS students to participate in extracurricular activities and allocate more resources to employ tutors who can teach in English / to provide extracurricular activities in English	0	1	2	3	4	5
8) Willing to let NCS schools participate in inter-school competitions (e.g. reading, singing, drama)	0	1	2	3	4	5
9) Willing to let Chinese speaking students know the cultural characteristics of other ethnic students in school	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Communication with parents</b>						
10) Willing to provide English translation of school notices to promote communication with NCS parents	0	1	2	3	4	5
11) Willing to arrange English teachers as class teachers for NCS students	0	1	2	3	4	5
12) Willing to allow NCS parents to join the Parent Teacher Association	0	1	2	3	4	5
<b>Understanding of different ethnicities</b>						

